

[*Babu Deba Prasad Sarbadhikari.*]

"As I have stated above, the objecting Members of Your Honour's Council are frequently met by one stereotyped reply: 'The Government is pledged or committed to this scheme and it must be provided for.' No scheme could Your Honour's Government have been more definitely and inviolably pledged and committed than the Presidency College scheme, and it is a matter of regret and wonder that the Financial Department took no steps to have the pledge redeemed. We, therefore, appeal to Your Honour and ask Your Honour to go up to the Government of India to have the engagement kept inviolate, and I appeal with confidence and hope.

"There are other important Building projects, in connection with advancement of learning, to which I should very much like to draw the attention of the Government and the Council, but to do which I find little encouragement indeed, considering how the Presidency College extensions are faring. All the same, I feel it my duty to refer to a highly-important scheme, the extension of the Senate House buildings, which must be undertaken in the immediate future. The munificent gift of His Highness the Maharaja of Durbhanga, which all true lovers of Education trust is but the earnest and fore-runner of a freer flow from the purse of our wealthy magnates, will make the building of a long-needed University Library soon possible. But we are in the position of people who have funds to build, but no suitable land to build on. There is no doubt, at the back of the Senate House, land long acquired for the purpose of a library; among other things, acquired at a time when no one thought that it would be possible to have a fine Library building, such as 2½ lacs of rupees ought to be able to procure. A building, such as we could then afford, had best perhaps be away in the back ground. But if I could make all feel like I feel in the matter, I would have the Ramessar Library, right on the road frontage, with its lofty and attractive facing, an instructive object-lesson to our philanthropically-inclined millionaires. Working upon ideas such as these, I pressed that the market to the south of the Senate House should be acquired and the Ramessar Library should be located on the corner plot; the back land away from the tram-line being reserved for the press, the laboratories and other buildings. There can be no doubt that the market will, sooner or later, have to be acquired, and it would be a grave economical blunder to delay the acquisition longer than can be helped. The Vice-Chancellor had long suggested and insisted on this acquisition; and that it has been so long deferred, through want of funds, is distinctly unfortunate. And it is now doubly unfortunate that we do not know where fittingly to place the Ramessar Library, for the University has still no funds. I invite Your Honour to come to its aid. We may probably be told that all such grants have hitherto been made from the Imperial Funds and that is the greater reason for the Provincial Government also doing some of its duty to the University in this direction. That the need is pressing is beyond all questions, for we shall have to pay a good deal more later on for what may cost us less now; and if the Provincial Government gives us some slight assistance, its good example may not improbably be imitated by the Eastern Bengal Government, and we may also fittingly press the Government of India for its contribution of aid in such shape as may be fitting; the University may thus be assisted to get that which it would be next to impossible for it to achieve unaided, at least within a reasonable time. I would, therefore, beg of Your Honour's Government to be pleased to provide a substantial portion of the costs of these highly important and beneficial public works.

"There are some other necessary and urgent building works, in connection with the Educational work of Bengal, to which I feel it my duty to draw Your Honour's attention before passing on to other matters. Large works have recently been undertaken in connection with the Medical College and the Medical College Hospitals; but, having regard to growing requirements, they are nothing like enough. One of the principal works in progress is the Surgical block of the Medical College, for which there is a budget allotment of two lacs and thirty thousand rupees; and this year the fourth block of the Medical College has been provided for at an expense of 90,000 rupees. But the College is badly in need of properly-equipped Biological and Physical Laboratories,

[*Babu Deba Prasad Sarbadhikari.*]

and also a hostel for non-military students. The last two are urgently needed for compliance with the University regulations, which had for the time being to be re-laxed to a certain extent, and no time should be lost in providing Government institutions with what is being insisted on in the case of private institutions. Much stress has recently been laid on proper hostel accommodation, as a necessary educational machinery; and such a machinery would be most needed in the case of medical students who, if they are not living with their own people, are best nearest their hospitals, and whose hours make it impossible for hostel or mess authorities, at a distance and unconnected with the College, to exercise proper check and control. The Hooghly College also is sadly in need of proper hostel buildings as well as of separate school buildings, which are insisted on by the University regulations; and I desire to impress upon the Government the necessity of early supply of these bare necessities. There is another much-needed hostel which has been practically promised for a long time, and that is in connection with the Darjeeling School. I was glad to see it announced in the newspapers that the Bengal Education Department will shortly purchase, at a cost of Rupees 20,000, a plot of land for the construction of a Hostel and for a play ground near the school; but I see no budget provision for it. If the newspaper announcement is not a mistake, then the mistake in the budget should be corrected; and if it is a mistake, then also will the budget require correction, in regard to this long and much-felt want, at a place where Your Honour's Government is located for a considerable part of the year and where many Government servants are obliged to keep their children for education.

"The Government of India, to which we owe the present Educational policy for good and evil, owe heavy duties and responsibilities which it has not adequately recognized and is not realizing. To make an admittedly unpopular University Act as popular and acceptable as possible, it began with an inconsiderable grant of eighty thousand rupees towards the bettering of non-Government Colleges in Western Bengal, and another inconsiderable sum in Eastern Bengal which could but go a very small way towards real reform. The Chancellor's recent announcement, about endowment of a Chair in Economic Science, which I trust will be fittingly called the Minto Chair, is an important step towards realization of the duties of the Government of India in the matter, so far as relates to the University proper. The Government Colleges, which are important adjuncts of the University system, require a great deal of strengthening and supplementing. In the words of Your Honour's recent Resolution, the question as to how far the reforms introduced by the new University Act and the new University Regulations are to be real, is very largely one of funds? Heavy expenditure is needed in many directions for the proper development of the Colleges, according to the new ideals; and the means by which this expenditure is to be met not only in Government Colleges but in deserving Private Colleges, without resources of their own, is a problem of the utmost gravity. As Mr. Earle has justly remarked in his admirable Educational Report, it is now, as it always has been and will be, for the Government Colleges to take the lead in shaping a better model for general Education; but the Provincial Funds available are insufficient to do more than ensure a bare compliance with the regulations. We must, therefore, look to the Government of India for substantial help. Much remains to be done to put the staff and appliances, even in the foremost of the Government Colleges, on a proper footing; and whenever any important schemes of reform are put forward, the Government is met with the problem of making two rupees do the work of four or perhaps more. There is one unbroken and agonizing cry for more men, better men, better paid men and better classes of men; and the Government is obliged to say, in a sober and considered document, that it is beyond the power of the Government to meet all or nearly all the demands made upon it and the one hope of real progress seems to lie in the liberality of private persons.

"The demand made upon the 'Government', which in the words of the Resolution, the Government is unable to meet, is, we take it, in respect of its own institutions and institutions that it aids. And the Director, in his Report,

[*Babu Deba Prasad Sarbadhikari.*]

more than once calls attention to the large share of Educational expenditure in England, which is met from endowments and private contributions. English analogies are not to be applied in this country to Educational matters, was the criticism, last year in this Council, in reply to the Hon'ble Babu Bhupendra Nath Basu, whose uncomfortably ample and heavy mantles have fallen on weak and unworthy shoulders. And may not his successor ask, in all humility, as to why analogies like this should be forthcoming with regard to the particular matter of Private Endowments alone? Where are the endowments to come from, for which the Government is placidly waiting for realization of Educational ideals of its own creation or framing, in its own colleges and institutions? What we are pleading for strenuously in this Council is for bettering of Government models at Government expense, and we are told that real reform is impossible, except with the aid of private liberality. The standing complaint is that the Government does too little for the people in the matter, taking its own institutions and aided institutions together; and the reply practically amounts to this, that the people must not only do nearly all in regard to their own institutions, but must help Government institutions as well. Referring to the Hon'ble Babu Bhupendra Nath Basu's statistics last year, showing how small a sum is spent on Education in India compared to European countries, the Hon'ble Mr. Gait said that it is obvious that expenditure must depend on the income available; and that it was quite clear that the Government of India cannot rival Switzerland in spending more than Rs. 9 per head of the population on Education, when its total revenue from all sources is not much more than Rs. 4 per head. But it strikes us that Switzerland does a really heroic thing in spending more than Rs. 9 on Education, out of an income of not more than 1£ to 5s. per head, which according to popular ideas would be something like Rs. 13 and according to the current rate of Exchange would be Rs. 19 per head. Our Government spends the magnificent sum of one anna and three pies per head, not out of ten pies of revenue per head, but out of more than Rs. 4 per head. Since the Hon'ble Mr. Gait thought it worth while to controvert the position of my predecessor in office, it would be as well to examine the matter with some little care. The hon'ble gentleman apparently overlooked that the public revenue of the Republic, which is happily safe from all Kaiser-Tweedmouth controversy, had an income in 1903 (from which year's figures the percentage was taken) of no more than £4,257,200 from a population of 331,300, which gives a revenue of something like £1-5s. or about Rs. 19 per head, out of which Rs. 9-11-2 (Rs. 3,20,200) was spent on Education. Or, in other words the Government of Switzerland spends nearly half of what it gets, against a pice and a quarter out of the rupee that our Government gets. But then the Executive power of the Republic is in the hands of the National Assembly, the President of which has a salary of £ 720, the Vice-President and other members of the Council being paid £ 480 a year, and all other expenses being naturally proportionate. Of course Switzerland is without a standing Army, a reform that the Zakka Khels would welcome in this country with great relish and gusto, and even the Militia, which effectively takes the place of the standing Army, have to provide their own badges and uniforms. These are not reforms immediately within the range of practical politics in this country, and since even our Assistant Magistrates will not look with complaisance at the Swiss President's pay, we shall not expect our Government to spend half its revenue on our Education. But would a paltry four anna bit per head, out of more than four rupees that we bring to the Imperial Coffers every year, though starved and famished, be too exacting a standard for our Educational demands? Is it a demand, we ask, that, in the terms of the Hon'ble Mr. Streetfield's recent Resolution, is beyond the power of the Government to meet? If it is all to be a question of figures, statistics and proportions, you have to look at the question as an entire whole; and we have a right to complain and do complain that just a little more than one-sixty-fourth, just a little more than a pice in the rupee, that you take out of us in the shape of revenue, though most of us can never afford even a meal a day, should be spent upon that which is a certain insurance against lawlessness, to put it on no higher grounds.

[*Babu Deba Prasad Sarbadhikari.*]

"And what princely and munificent endowments do you expect from a people out of whom the Government with its powerful, resourceful and watchful tax-taking machinery, of grotesquely manifold order, cannot take out more than Rs. 4 per head, in the shape of Provincial and Imperial taxes and revenues? By way of indicating as to what the people are doing, I would briefly refer to events like these. Ours are a people with perennial Famine conditions, prevailing from year's end to year's end. Ours is a community loaded with lower middle classes, whose conditions are much more pitiable than those of the labouring and agricultural classes, as Your Honour, with great effect and pathos, stated the other day at the Town Hall Famine Relief meeting. It is these very classes, whom the present abnormally high prices so severely affect; from which our students and teachers mostly come, and see how manfully, in spite of their known and admitted troubles, they are trying to do their duty in the matter of Education. And it is chiefly from these classes, in other countries, that the munificent Educational and other endowments come. What wonder then that Educational endowments, in this country, are few and far between? I shall not, for my present purposes, refer to gifts of gentlemen and noblemen like the Maharaja of Durbhanga, the late Babu Prasanna Kumar Tagore, the late Maharaja Sir Jotindra Mohan Tagore, the late Mr. Prem Chand Roy Chand, the late Babu Guru Prasanna Ghose and the many minor donors, who have contributed to the twenty-six lacs of rupees worth of endowments in the University of Calcutta, to which the Vice-Chancellor of the University referred the other day in his Convocation address. These are endowments that might and ought to be manifolded if all who, in similar spheres of life, have the capacity, as also the inclination to imitate the noble-minded donors whom I have named. Nor shall I, by way of justification or vindication of our people's position in regard to this matter, refer to events like the foundation of institutions like the Hindu School, the Hare School and the Bethune School, by private enterprise; nor to the foundation of institutions, in recent times, like the Indian Association for Cultivation of Science, the Association for assisting our young men to proceed to Foreign Countries to study Industries, the National Council of Education and the Bengal Technical Institute and other Institutions, in connection with which a great deal of energy and money is being spent in a quiet and workmanlike way: all tending to the educational and economic salvation of the country. I would rather confine myself for the present to what the people themselves are doing in a still more unostentatious way every day of their life, and the evidence of which is to be found in the Government Reports and the Government Resolution, though to a very limited extent.

"In Your Honour's Resolutions on the Quinquennial Educational Report, it is observed that the expenditure during 1906-07, on Secondary Education, was Rs. 25,43,105, of which Rs. 5,58,303 was from the public funds. The total expenditure on Primary Education, during the same year, was Rs. 25,50,768, of which the public funds contributed Rs. 8,94,749 or 35.1 per cent. The total expenditure on the education of girls and women was Rs. 5,46,803, of which the public funds contributed Rs. 2,80,631. In regard to European schools the public funds contributed Rs. 1,55,790 out of Rs. 11,67,077 in 1901-02. We have no information in the Resolution and Report regarding Arts and Technical schools all over the country, that are entirely supported by private funds; these institutions do not submit any return to the Government, being in no way subject to Government control or inspection. For similar reasons, no information is available in regard to our great private and Missionary Colleges and Muhammadan schools and Maktabas and Madrasas, Sanskrit toles, various Homeopathic and Ayurvedic and Yunani schools, and last and not the least to our Allopathic Colleges, some of which will soon fittingly claim affiliation, which do not exist or work for pecuniary gain, but generally at a loss to the promoters; and are carrying on the educational work of the country under the heaviest conceivable handicap, against which some measure of Government relief is now being gradually vouchsafed.

"In passing, I may be permitted to draw Your Honour's attention to the excellent work that is being steadily done at these medical schools and colleges,

[Babu Deba Prasad Sarbadhikari.]

and the hospitals attached or affiliated to them, by private exertions and out of contributions that Your Honour's Government rarely hears anything about. A body of non-official workers is being trained up, some of whom are in their own respective spheres able to hold their own against all comers. While non-officials are being freely associated in other important public work, people are naturally asking themselves, and would like to ask the Government, as to whether the talents and devotion of non-service medical men could not be some way utilized and their work recognized and encouraged, under a well-thought-out scheme, in which service interests would of course in the first instance be safeguarded? An attempt like this has recently been made in Bombay, and if it has not quite succeeded, it is because of mistakes that would have to be carefully avoided elsewhere. It would be a welcome, wholesome and necessary departure, the author of which would be long and lovingly remembered by all interested in problems of Sanitation and Medical Education. Our Law Education is mostly in private hands, and the most that Government attempts is the keeping up of the profitable and obsolete Pleaders' Examination. This is another field of Education in which a re-arrangement of ideas will soon be necessary, though in a somewhat different direction.

"Though private liberality in these domains may not be very large or very much in evidence, it would hardly be correct to say that a proverbially poor people are not doing what they can, by way of supplementing Government endeavours. I say all this not by way of apology, but for emphasizing the need of more liberal treatment of the situation by the Government, Provincial as well as Imperial. The paramount need for greater expenditure is admitted and means must be found, if it is not to be said that the Government has upset our notions of things and has set up ideals, in realizing which it will not help us to its utmost, no, not even in its own schools and Colleges; better far that there was no new University Act and that we were allowed to go our own way in modest humility and work out our educational salvation as best as we could, and in as long a span of time as possible. We never understood why otherwise, for teaching and learning of science, elaborate and costly appliances, which we could not afford, should have been insisted on; and why on failure to provide them at a price, perfectly beyond our means, all science teaching was to stop? The opening lecture of Dr. Schuster showed up the weakness of a position like this with unmistakable clearness, and the learned Professor made some of us flinch and wince that we have been party to the insistence that true science needs forbidding and prohibitive paraphernalia; and he has re-convinced us of what we had long been convinced that it is the men and not upon costly apparatus in handsome, lofty and well-equipped and expensive laboratories, with hot and cold water and other comforts and conveniences laid on in abundance, regardless of costs and resources, upon which proper science studies will be possible. And we must see that teaching and research work go on side by side, except in exceptional cases, and that the one does not militate with the other. There has been painfully abundant evidence of late that the people will never be able to afford all this out of their own resources, and a helpless Government now appeals to private liberality. The old world ideal is shattered, and in the words of the Vice-Chancellor, in the Convocation address, as well as of Your Honour's Resolution to which I have previously referred, the available funds are insufficient to do more than ensure bare attainment of the new ideal. Even the Government Colleges have to be starved in regard to the full curriculum, and subjects after subjects have to be given up in Colleges where they were favourites before; and if this is the state of things in the Government Colleges, what is likely to be in private and Missionary institutions? It is a problem, not only of an utmost gravity, in the words of Your Honour's Resolution, but of the gravest anxiety. Who is to solve it, and when and how? I am very much afraid it is the Government and the Government alone, and not the people; for a good long time yet to come, that can afford the solution. If the Government is unable or unwilling to extend a helping hand, there is bound to be a re-arrangement of ideas, and most of the Education of the country will pass

[*Babu Deba Prasad Sarbadhikari.*]

away out of Government and of University control. It is clear that so long as the present system of settlement attains, the Provincial Government is powerless to do all that is required, and the Imperial Government, the rich legacy of whose advanced Educational policy the country is now called upon to enjoy, for good or evil or both, must come to our aid; and we look to Your Honour with confidence and hope for a proper presentment of the case to the Government of India on our behalf, and the first instalment of such assistance will have to be in connection with the Presidency College. The country will await the issue with anxiety.

"The proposal for the removal of the Sibpur Engineering College to Ranchi raises an important question, which I referred to in Your Honour's Council at the last meeting, and as the reply was slightly encouraging I would beg of Your Honour to consider, before finally deciding, as to whether the Technical Department proper had not best be retained near the important centre of trade, commerce and industry, where practical work of all descriptions would be within easy reach? I would beg leave further to raise the question in connection with the budget also, as to whether the whole of our Technological Education should not be administered by experts, better able to handle it than lay educationalists, in the same way as medical and agricultural education is administered? Our people have, after a prolonged lapse, recognized the urgency of Technical Education, and in the various private institutions that I have named a good beginning has been made. Your Honour and Your Honour's responsible officers have on our invitation seen some of this work, and enough indication is forthcoming of the earnestness of the desire to profit by such education. Here is an untrodden field of self-help which is likely to be fully utilized, and the Government has not been troubled for direct aid. But there is an important direction in which Government aid is possible and desirable, and that is by superior training, to turn out from the Government Technological Departments properly qualified and trained teachers, who could make the people's work easier. We have tried teachers from Europe and America; we have tried teachers from Japan and from various centres of Indian industry, and somehow or other the result has not been satisfactory. Capable, devoted and willing teachers are as badly needed in the technological side of education as in other sides, and the Government will be doing an important duty, in its own well-equipped model Colleges, if it succeeds in training and turning out capable workers and thorough teachers, whose field of usefulness is very large, in fact practically unlimited. They will find employment in public as well as private schools and workshops, and will themselves prove to be the nuclei of economic and industrial developments of no mean magnitude. Bengal is essentially an agricultural country, and the result is that with the slightest depression of agriculture, which is unfortunately the normal condition of things now-a-days, and the suffering not only of the agriculturists but of the untold thousands who depend upon agriculturists, mostly as idle hangers-on, is acute beyond conception. As a distinguished and high-placed expert officer of the Government has been good enough to suggest to me, the remedy is in starting small industrial centres in agricultural areas, by way of supplementing local resources. By spasmodic and adventitious aids, such as have been asked for in the Council today, shall we preserve and better our industries; but we must set to business in an organized manner.

"The idea is well-worth taking up and considering, and I crave Your Honour's indulgence for one brief moment while I refer to it. If Government or private enterprise is unequal to the task, Municipalities, District Boards and Village Unions may, under proper direction and supervision and with some slight aid, do useful work in this connection. The general idea is to have suitable workshops in important and selected centres; where cultivators' relatives and all who care may be taught practical work of weavers, blacksmiths, carpenters, makers of agricultural implements, carving, rattan work, dyeing, moulding of bricks and tiles and various other small arts and useful industries on a small scale that one might think of and name. With the recent disruption of the caste and guild systems, there has been

[Babu Deba Prasad Sarbadhikari.]

a good deal of economical and industrial disturbance, and things have to be re-arranged in this, as in many other spheres of life. I have seen important centres where it is difficult to get a good blacksmith or a good carpenter, or even the average brick-moulder. If local industrial facilities like this could be provided, there would be communal as well as individual good, and an agriculturist would not have to travel miles to a distant village or town to get everyday implements mended or made? nor would brick-moulders have to be imported by the gang per season, from distant parts, at a prohibitive cost. The thing could be worked out at a comparatively small cost, according to a properly thought-out scheme, and a large number of village idlers who go only to swell the criminal classes could find profitable work, and agricultural congestion would to a certain extent be relieved. These workshops need not be self-contained in all centres and ought not to be costly and pretentious. Boards of local members may be constituted for directing the management, organizing prizes for good work and for profitable sale of the outturn. It is by workmanlike handling of the subject, and not by inclusion of fancy subjects in the primary and upper primary courses of our schools, that real economic good can be expected. From a small nucleus like this, will there be evolved the opportunity of developing the most important work by degrees and small industries, and individual development will still be an economic salvation under suitable conditions. This has been recognized in the peoples' institutions, where small and profitable industries are being given due prominence; and the Government will have to supplement our endeavours in this direction, while not unmindful of the larger works on which it is already or is about to be engaged. The difficulty is to create these nuclei, and he will be a good friend of the country and the Government, who will organize and work a network of these small workshops and industrial centres, side by side with our model agricultural farms and educational institutions, and his name will be handed down to grateful generations. As has often and truly been remarked, the country is not yet suited for the development of large and organized industries, and individual efforts must, for a long while yet, be fostered and taken care of.

"And, side by side would, and may, there be the promotion of Primary Education, for which the Government is prepared to do so much. Every régime has its fads and fetishes that the next generation has the satisfaction of seeing exploded, and one has only to study between the lines of Your Honour's recent Educational Resolution to see how some of these exploded schemes are faring. We are told that the proportion of pupils, in upper primary schools, has shown no advance during the last 15 years. We are officially and authoritatively told that this, coupled with the unpopularity of middle vernacular schools, points to the conclusion that vernacular teaching, beyond the elementary stage, does not under present conditions commend itself to parents, as being of practical value. 'Craik's pursuit of knowledge under difficulties' will, therefore, yet need revising and re-editing, and the teaching of English must not be attempted to be thrown back. Further down, in the same Resolution, we see that the system introduced by the Resolution of 1901 has proved a failure, as regards both intellectual training of the children and the proper teaching of the vernacular. A revised syllabus for the infant section and for Standards I and II has been published, which will be introduced for 1910. It is said to be clear, from this syllabus, that it is educationally sound; but to my mind its failure is also foredoomed, for reasons that I shall try to explain later on as they strike me. We are next told that the Commercial classes of the Presidency College have failed to be popular, and the reason to my mind is, that they sought to turn out mere assistants and clerks (which are best trained in the lowest office rungs) and did not aim at giving real commercial education of a superior and attractive type. The failure is somewhat of the nature of the failure of the Fort William College and the earlier Government educational enterprises, which similarly aimed at the out-turn of good clerks, writers and assistants, and did not care to make real education its goal. The list of educational failures is by no means yet exhausted. We have it in the words of the Resolution that the work done in agricultural classes, attached to

[Babu Debā Prasad Sarbadhikari.]

high schools, has not at all been satisfactory. In fact, says the Resolution, the footing on which they were started was not such as to render success possible. Steps are now being taken, we are told, to place these classes on a *business footing*, and one must be pardoned for wondering as to why business footing was the last and the latest thing to be thought of, and not the first and foremost? In order for them to be successful, these classes must not be considered as a part, but must be no more than mere auxiliaries of high schools, somewhat on the lines that I have been trying to indicate. We have it again that the B classes, attached to zilla schools, have proved a failure. Attempts are being made to foster the developments of these classes, and the Director remarks that their ultimate success must depend upon the extent to which the classes of Indian society, who use secondary schools, are prepared to encourage their sons to take up work, other than Government service or clerical employment. This connotes a misconception of the objects of the high schools as well as of these classes against which we protested from the beginning, and which accounts for the present failure. Those who will want good workmen or good foremen, carry on their work, we take it, on a *business footing*; and they will not care for amateurs from High School Agricultural classes or zilla school B classes, where the teaching of the special subjects for obvious reasons cannot be adequate. So far as manual training is necessary as a part of general training, as recognized on all hands, have it by all means in our schools, but not as a likely reproductive factor. That must be on an entirely and essentially business footing; and to control and regulate Industrial education like this, as well as the higher Engineering and Technological education, we badly want a well-equipped, separate and special Educational Department, which will not make the many mistakes that Mr. Earle's conscientious and thorough work has discovered. My plea for such a department is thus strengthened, and we are glad to note in the terms of Your Honour's memorable Resolution that old errors have been realized: 'and we do hope and trust that really sounder ideals will now be put forward.'

"Let me here explain why I have misgivings as to the ultimate success of the revised Syllabus, which is claimed to be educationally sounder than its predecessors and which is to be introduced from 1910. This is neither the time nor the place to go into details of so important and technical a question like this, and I shall have barely time to examine only one of its most important phases.

"It appears from the Resolution of the Bengal Government (in the General Department) No. 1028T.-G., dated 10th June, 1907 (*vide* Calcutta Gazette of 19th June, 1907), that the Government will prepare model text-books for the Lower Primary Scholarship Examination, in accordance with a revised Syllabus appended to that Resolution, and that these books will replace, from 1910, all the Lower Primary text-books now in use. It has no doubt been provided that if the public can prepare equally good or better books, these will also be accepted. What the inevitable effect of such a provision may be, I need not attempt to forecast. But it appears to me undesirable and unnecessary that the Government should enter into competition with the public, and there can be no doubt that the interest of students, as well as of education in general, would be best served by leaving the preparation of text-books to open competition. At a time when literature has made admitted advance in Bengal, the necessity for fostering School-Book Societies does not exist, and the recent strong protest of our publishers, regarding matters of this description, must still be fresh in public memory. Preparation of model text-books by the Government might be considered necessary only on one or other of the two suppositions,—first, that there are good reasons for apprehending that the public will fail to prepare suitable text-books; and, second, that the Government can secure the services of such experts of exceptional ability as may not care to prepare text-books themselves. None of these suppositions are warranted by the existing state of things, and books made to order are generally unsatisfactory.

"As a justification for the first supposition, it may possibly be urged that though the preparation of Lower Primary Science Primers now in use had been left to open competition, no good books are yet available. But, if good

[*Babu Deba Prasad Sarbadhikari.*]

Science Primers have not been available, may it not be that the fault lies more with the syllabus itself than with the authors? Is not a Lower Primary Science Primer a strange medley of more than half a dozen of scientific subjects (Botany, Zoology, Physics, Chemistry, Agriculture, Hygiene, Domestic Economy, etc.), and no single author could be expected to do justice to all these subjects, within the small compass necessarily allowed? The Syllabus has now been revised, and the Lower Primary Science Primers will be replaced and better books may be reasonably expected. There are no good grounds to suppose that our authors, some of whom are well-advanced, will prove incompetent to prepare good literature books for the Lower Primary examination, even if we concede that they could not prepare good Science Primers of the above-mentioned type.

“As to the second supposition, which might justify preparation of model text-books by the Government, it may gravely be doubted if the abilities of the experts, whose services the Government may secure, will be superior to those of the experienced authors whose books are now in use; for, it is obvious that, the most competent persons will as a rule prefer to write books on their own behalf, since the remuneration for doing the same work for the Government must and ought to be far less attractive. It would be interesting to know the names of a few experts, whose services the Government may expect to secure, and compare them with those whose books are or are likely to be available in the market. If it be urged that the preparation of each book will be entrusted by the Government to a committee, consisting of three or four persons, and that a book prepared by a number of persons in consultation with one another will be superior to a book written by an individual author, it may be pointed out in reply that the advantage, even if real, can but be very small; and that far better books are bound to be produced by open competition, especially as one of the rules of the Text-Books Committee makes it obligatory upon authors to revise their books at intervals.

“Under these circumstances, I would ask the Government, which has much more serious and pressing work in hand, to modify their decision, with regard to the preparation of model text-books, particularly in the case of Arithmetic and subjects like Literature, Geography, History and Grammar, in which excellent books already exist. And in regard to subjects in which there are no books yet up to the mark, model text-books should be withdrawn from circulation as soon as equally good and better books are available; for they will then have served their purpose, and the Government can have no intention of undertaking reproductive public works in the book-making line. It appears from paragraph 9 of the Resolution referred to already, that the first list of approved books, written according to the new system, will be issued in July, 1909, and that private authors will be given one year's time to prepare their books (from June, 1908, to June, 1909). Under this arrangement, it will be almost impossible for a private author to get his book approved in July, 1909; for he will have to prepare the book and get it printed, and then the book will have to pass through (1) a confidential preliminary examination, and (2) a formal examination by the Text-Book Committee. All this will require considerable time. The result will be that the Government text-books will have a monopoly for the Lower Primary examination, 1911, though, probably, it is not the intention of the Government to create a monopoly on its own behalf, even for a single year. So, if the Government must prepare model text-books, it is desirable that their introduction into schools may be postponed at least by another year; and that it should be officially notified that the examination of all books, submitted by private authors on or before a certain date to be fixed by the Government, shall be finished by the Text-Book Committee, in time for the first approved list published under the new system. By precautionary measures like these, the Government will minimise the chances of failure of the description, regarding which I have taken the liberty to warn the Government not without hesitation and anxiety.

“My remarks on Educational topics have already been so lengthy, that I cannot take up many other phases of this and other questions that are of pressing interest. But I cannot close this subject, without referring to the

[Babu Deba Prasad Sarbadhikari.]

all-important question of the status and pay of our Professors and Teachers. In the existing state of the public and private purses, we cannot expect the country to be strewn with Eton and Harrow teachers, or Cambridge and Oxford professors; for we have neither rich endowments nor the capacity to pay large fees, which make such a state of things possible. It is, however, clear and admitted that the existing state of things will not do and must at once be changed for the better. Your Honour's Government has earned our abiding thanks by realizing this; and, in these sentiments of gratitude, we have the supreme pleasure of associating the name of Mr. Earle, whose earnest and single-minded endeavour during the period of his office, has been to better the position of our teachers and professors. And fortunately for them and us and for our after-comers, the Government of India has also realized the state of things and decided, we hope, to come to the rescue of the Local Government. We sincerely trust their aid will be more solid than in the shape of mere advisory and sympathetic resolutions, and that the resources of the Local Government will be substantially supplemented. The question has often been referred to in Your Honour's Council; and now that it is engaging the earnest and careful attention of Your Honour's Government as well as of the Imperial Government, it may not be amiss to shortly review the situation and indicate the points on which immediate reform is necessary, and would be possible without prohibitive costs.

"The scheme for re-organization of the Provincial and Subordinate Educational Services of Bengal was introduced with effect, as I understand, from September, 1905. The Bengal Government deserves our thanks for attempting improvement; but the scheme has not appreciably benefited our Educational Officers, and has therefore failed to remove the prevailing discontent. One of the causes of this discontent is extremely slow promotion; and as this is a matter of some importance I beg leave to examine it in detail, though this has on former occasions been referred to in the Council and elsewhere, though not with more effect than I expect from my remarks.

"Promotion is slow for two reasons—First, the number of posts in the three lowest classes is very large; and the number in the higher classes is comparatively small. The inevitable result is that, even under the most favourable circumstances, nearly three-fourths of one's period of service must be spent in getting through the three lowest classes. A glance at the following figures, showing side by side the number of posts in each class of the Provincial Educational Service, and the number of posts in the corresponding class of the Provincial Executive Service, will satisfy the Government that promotion in the former service must be extremely slow.

Class	I	II	III	IV	V	VI	VII	VIII
Provincial Executive Service ...	6	8	18	57	84	87	50	43
Provincial Educational Service ..	4	6	7	11	13	18	26	39

"If the number of posts, in different classes of the Provincial Educational Service, was adjusted in the same relative proportions as in the case of the Provincial Executive Service, the figures would have been as follows:—

Class	I	II	III	IV	V	VI	VII	VIII
Number of appointments ...	2	3	6	20	30	30	17	15

"If these figures, especially those for Classes V, VI, VII and VIII be compared with the actual figures for the corresponding classes, the most important cause of slow promotion will be obvious.

"The second cause of slow promotion is, the practice obtaining in the Education Department of appointing officers direct to some of the higher classes of the Provincial Service. Since the constitution of the Provincial Educational Service in 1896, more than twenty officers were appointed direct to Classes VI and VII, and even to class IV. In consequence, most, of the posts in the highest classes are now held by officers, who will retire later than most of the members of the intermediate classes. This practice of making appointments direct to the higher classes of a graded service has, I believe, no parallel in any other service; and it serves to bring about a very undesirable and abnormal state of things in the Provincial Educational Service. In all other graded services,

[Babu Deba Prasad Sarbadhikari.]

members of the highest class retire in due order and their places are gradually taken by members of the next class, so that there is a steady flow of promotion, and every officer may expect in due course to get to class I. In the Provincial Educational Service, a smaller number of officers, belonging to the highest classes, is benefited in consequence of this practice, at the expense of the rest of the officers in the lower classes, who form the majority. I do not wish to suggest that officers, who were appointed direct to the higher classes, are getting more than what they deserve, or even all that they deserve. Some of them, in fact, are graduates of European Universities, who fully deserve to be appointed to the Indian Educational Service. The point that I wish to make is, that their inclusion in the Provincial Service list has seriously blocked the promotion of other members, who form the majority.

*II.—Promotion in the Provincial Educational Service as compared with that in the Executive branch of the Provincial Civil Service.*

"A Deputy Magistrate gets Rs. 400 in 10 to 11 years, while a great many of the officers now in classes IV, V, VI and VII of the Provincial Educational Service will have to retire on Rs. 300 to Rs. 400. Accuracy of this statement can be verified on reference to the Civil List and the History of Services of Gazetted Officers.

*III.—Illustrations of slow promotions in the past.*

"(a) On reference to the History of Services of Gazetted Officers, it will be seen that many deserving members of the Provincial Educational Service retired on Rs. 250 or Rs. 300.

"(b) The number of posts in the lowest class is so large that a good many years must elapse before an officer can get through it. One of our best Professors took more than eight years in getting through the lowest class. Another well-known and successful Professor is getting only Rs. 200, in spite of the recent re-organization, after ten years of service. A third, who is on extension now, is getting Rs. 300 per month.

*IV.—Comparison of the average monthly income of Provincial Educational Officers in different Provinces.*

"The figures in the second and third columns of the following tabular statement showing the strength and cost *per mensem* of the Provincial Educational Services in the different provinces are taken from the Resolutions of the Government of India on the Quinquennial Review of Education (1892-93 to 1896-97), by Mr. J. S. Cotton, published in the Gazette of India of the 4th November, 1899.—

I			II	III	IV
Province.			No.	Cost per month.	Average income per month.
				Rs.	Rs.
Bengal	...	...	113	29,250	259
Madras	...	...	32	10,850	339
Bombay	...	...	23	8,400	365
North-Western Provinces and Oudh	...	...	24	7,750	323
Punjab	...	...	17	6,100	359

Since the recent re-organization, the figures for Bengal have changed, so that the average monthly income is now Rs. 310. But it should be pointed out that this represents nothing real, for the average income in the case of the small number of officers, now in the highest classes, is much larger (nearly Rs. 500); while that of others in lower classes is in consequence much less than Rs. 300.

*V.—Remedies.*

"More money. It is essential that a large amount of money should be spent in improving the prospects of promotion.

"The number of posts in the three lowest classes should be considerably reduced, and there should be a corresponding increase in the number of appointments in the intermediate classes. The distribution of posts in the different classes should be on the same scale as in the case of the Provincial Executive

[Babu Deba Prasad Sarbadhikari.]

Service, and at the same time the class on Rs. 350 should be abolished and a class on Rs. 800 added. If these suggestions be accepted, the number and pay of eight classes of the Provincial Educational Service will be as follows :—

Class.	I	II	III	IV	V	VI	VII	VIII
Pay ...	800	700	600	500	400	300	250	200
Number of posts	2	3	6	20	30	30	17	16

“Another alternative suggestion may be made. The grade system may be altogether abolished and a system of progressive pay similar to that in vogue in the Indian Educational Service may be introduced. A Provincial Service officer appointed on Rs. 200 a month should get Rs. 400 a month in ten years by an annual increment of Rs. 20 per month. He should then get an increment of Rs. 100 per month at the end of every five years.

“No appointment direct to a higher class should be made. It should be strictly insisted upon that all first appointments to the Provincial Educational Service should be made to the lowest class, and under no circumstances to a higher class. It appears that appointments direct to a higher class of the Provincial Educational Service arise in three different ways :—

(a) first, there are some special posts included in the Provincial Service List, to which it may be necessary to appoint officers on higher initial salaries than the minimum pay of the Provincial Service ;

(b) Gentlemen of special merit, such as graduates of European Universities, are some times appointed direct to higher classes, and

(c) lastly, deserving members of the Subordinate Educational Service, when promoted to the Provincial Service, are often appointed to a higher class.

“As to (a), the remedy is to exclude the special posts from the Provincial Service, and introduce a system of progressive pay for those posts, as in the case of the Personal Assistant to the Director of Public Instruction. In passing, I may be permitted to observe that this appointment should ordinarily go to the Provincial Service.

“As to (b), appointments may be made to the Indian Educational Service, or personal allowances may be granted.

“As to (c), there will probably be no difficulty in the future, since the minimum pay of the Provincial Service has now been raised to Rs. 200 ; provided all officers of the Subordinate Service, eligible for promotion to the Provincial Service, be promoted to that service, before they rise to class I (Rs. 250) in the Subordinate Service.

“The maximum pay should be brought in a line with the corresponding branches of the Executive and Judicial Services, in order to make the Educational Service permanently attractive.

“A fair number of the more meritorious members of the service should be allowed to hold Principalships of Colleges and the Assistant Directorship of Public Instruction should, as I have stated above, be thrown open to the service. And, in the interest of efficiency, it is of the utmost importance that capable Professors, who have made their mark as teachers or in research work, should not by way of promotion be drafted on to the Inspector's branch of the service. Teaching proper should be lucrative and honourable enough to attract or retain the best available talent in the country which, sad to think, is by no means the case, as it undoubtedly was before, when we had teachers and professors whose names are held in loving memory by generations of grateful students, who have made their mark.

“The present practice is to appoint Indians, as a rule, to the Provincial Service, while the Indian Service is recruited in England. When Europeans are appointed to the Provincial Service, they are generally appointed to the higher classes which tends to the block. Thus Educational appointments do not altogether depend on academic distinctions and educational qualifications, and distinctly inferior men, who cannot hold their own against the more meritorious members of the Provincial Service, are appointed to the superior service. On the other hand, even the most distinguished graduates of Indian Universities cannot, as a rule, aspire to be members of the Indian Service. This

[*Babu Deba Prasad Sarbadhikari.*]

could hardly have been anticipated at the time of the organization of the two services; and the effect is, that most of our distinguished Judicial Service or the more lucrative appointments under the Government of India, such as those in the Financial Department, some at least of the most distinguished Indian Judges of the High Court and members of the learned professions intended to devote their lives to teaching work, and but for the current anomalies they would have been Educationalists by profession as well as choice. The Local Government is powerless in the matter of rewarding genuine scholarship, and the most loyal and zealous service among the members of the Provincial Service, by promotion to the higher service and the two services, have come to be what they are not in theory. Scientists, of European reputation, and distinguished graduates and honours men of Oxford and Cambridge, whom for obvious reasons again I shall not name, are to be found among the ranks of the Provincial Service, even after 15 or 16 years of approved service in the department. A further anomaly has grown up in course of time. An Indian honours man of Oxford or Cambridge is in the Provincial Service, because recruited in India; while a European—perhaps his contemporary in England—perhaps his junior, with no higher academic distinction and sometimes decidedly his inferior in attainments, is in the higher service, because recruited in England.

“A comparison of dates would show that some of the Indian members of the Provincial Service, who have European qualifications, joined the Department long before the Provincial Service was organized. These officers were placed outside the classified lists and naturally expected that, in course of time, they would be absorbed into the higher service. It is more than doubtful if they would have joined the Department, had they anticipated the present position and prospects of the Provincial Service. To them, the hardship and injustice is all the greater.

“Sir Alfred Croft, who was the Director of Public Instruction in Bengal when schemes for the Provincial Educational Service were being discussed, made no secret of his view that, by European officers he meant officers who had obtained high degrees in European Universities, and not merely by race. As the services are now constituted, an European officer can hardly be said in practice to mean an officer with European qualifications only.

“Previously, it was quite usual to promote deserving officers from the lower to the higher branch of the service. In this way, the following were appointed members of the Indian Educational Service: Babu Prasanno Kumar Sarbadhikary, Pundit Mohesh Chunder Nayaratna, Dr. P. K. Ray, Dr. J. C. Bose, Mr. M. M. Percival, Rai Bahadur Radhika Prasad Mookerjee and Rai Bahadur Bromho Mohon Mullick.

“I believe at one time there were no less than five or six Indians, that is  $\frac{1}{4}$ th or  $\frac{1}{5}$ th of the cadre, in the higher branch. There are in the Provincial Service officers enough to make similar promotions again possible, and, if this is done, it will in no way impair the efficiency or status of the superior service, and will remove the existing tensions in the Provincial Service; and the cheering prospects of promotion to really deserving men will considerably improve the latter service. As to the definite proposal of the Government of India, I beg to state in addition to what I have already stated—

(a) Only lately the intermediate grades of the service have been added to and the initial salary has been raised from Rs. 150 to Rs. 200 a month. This has not altogether relieved the congestion in the service, and will not be relieved till the more distinguished officers are drafted on the superior service.

(b) It is obviously desirable that our best men should be attracted to the Education Department. The present constitution of the services, however, does not tend to this; and as I have tried to show, unfortunately for this country, its best talents are diverted on to other channels. I may be permitted to refer, in this connection, to the case of the holders of the State scholarships

[*Babu Deba Prasad Sarbadhikari.*]

electd by the Calcutta University. These scholarships are tenable in one of the older English Universities, *viz.*, Oxford or Cambridge, and according to the terms of the scholarship the scholar must graduate in one of these ancient seats of learning. It might have been expected that scholars, so trained, would elect to join the Education Department. With the exception of very few indeed, all the scholars elected to compete for the Indian Civil Service and mostly succeeded. While rejoicing that so many of my countrymen should have had an opportunity of entering the Civil Service through State aid, which they would probably not have been otherwise able to enter, I cannot help regretting that the Educational service should have failed to be attractive to a fair member of our State scholars. If it has failed to be attractive, it is because of disabilities and disqualifications, which are unknown even to the Civil Service. They should be removed, in order that there may be real reform and improvement; and here not the Local Government but the Government of India, which has been graciously pleased to move in the matter, not a day too soon, can be of great service, if it will.

"There is one other point to which I take this opportunity of drawing attention. There should be as little financial barrier as possible against the employment of a reasonable number of well-paid assistants and demonstrators in Government service and Technical Colleges, to enable the work to be properly developed; and also by way of furnishing training ground for good teachers. Though some expenditure would be involved, the return in output would be ample compensation and good men should have an opportunity of quick advancement. In our research scholars, we have a body of men who would be trained into a fair body of teachers and professors and whose services are not fully availed of at present. The result is, they have to go back to the services and professions which their less distinguished and capable contemporaries have joined before them much to their advantage, while they themselves were engaged in research work, that merely delayed and retarded their professional career. Unless the services of the research scholars are utilized in a way advantageous to them and to the educational service, research work is likely to be unpopular, which from the worldly point of view is not apparently paying.

"The special consideration in the Provincial Educational Service, of graduates in English Universities and Prem Chand and Ray Chand students, is contained in the orders laid down in paragraph 14 of the Bengal Government Resolution No. 1244, dated the 26th March, 1897. It runs thus:—That graduates in honours of English Universities and Prem Chand students should originally be appointed to class VI (Rs. 250) of the Provincial Educational Service; that after a service of three years in that class, they should have a claim to the first vacancy in class V (Rs. 300), and that after a further service of three years in that class, they should have a claim to the first vacancy in class IV (Rs. 400).

"Government Notification No. 774, dated the 21st February, 1900, extends the above privilege to successful Post Graduates Research scholars. In the rules issued in that notification, it was laid down that scholars and those who might desire to enter the Educational Service of the Government of Bengal, would be considered to have equal claims to employment with those who had been Prem Chand students.

"Government Notification No. 905, dated the 6th July, 1900, withdraws the above rules, on account of representations of other officers of the service, the service having since considerably enlarged.

"It is time to consider whether some special consideration and consequent modification of rules is not necessary, by way of encouraging graduates of English Universities, Prem Chand Ray Chand Students and Research scholars and other meritorious officers, whose claims cannot be adequately dealt with in the ordinary course of things.

[*Babu Deba Prasad Sarbadhikari.*]

"No less important a question is that of Government Grants, for with it is intimately connected the question of the Staffing of our Private Schools and Colleges. The grant of Rs. 80,000 a year, for private and Missionary colleges, the benefaction of the Government of India, is all too small, as those who have to weigh and adjudicate upon the claim of the different institutions know to their bitter regret and chagrin. Here the Eastern Bengal Government is, through similar beneficence, able to make separate provisions for the colleges within its jurisdiction, regarding the allotment of which the University authorities have as yet had no visible hand. The Local Government may fairly be asked to supplement the grants of the Supreme Government; and till that is possible, real reform must be slow and tardy. And our private schools stand in no less need of aid than our colleges, and aid such as is now forthcoming is, in many cases, not only inadequate but is worse than useless. An experienced and honoured Government servant, who has long retired on a well-earned pension, tells me that the meagre salaries received by the lower teachers in our aided schools are a grievance, which in these days of abnormally high prices, which have unfortunately to be referred to in every connection, demands prompt redress. Meagre salaries greatly prejudice the teaching in our schools; because the recipients of such salaries are compelled to supplement their resources by trying to earn other small sums of money as private tutors, a function which prevents them from giving undivided attention to their teaching work. The grants to schools are generally so small and depend upon compliance with conditions, which compel an utterly rotten system of school management. A school receiving a grant must itself contribute a definite quota or proportion to the school fund, must pay the teachers a definite scale of salaries and forfeit the grant, or submit to its reduction if it fails to comply fully. But full compliance with such conditions is impossible in the case of many village schools, and grants are therefore protected in some cases by means, which are hardly honourable. This state of things, according to my informant, who was himself a Secretary of one of these schools, which post he had to resign in disgust, exists and has always existed, probably not without the knowledge of some Educational Officers. That this is possible, in what should be the purest and most immaculate of Departments, is because the grants are of the most illiberal and insufficient character and depend upon impossible conditions. A high educational authority, the head of one of the foremost of our Missionary Colleges, assures me, that such a condition of things interferes with freer flow of private liberality in educational channels. A more generous and reasonable grant-in-aid system would call into existence more and better private schools and colleges and I would ask Your Honour to re-consider the grant-in-aid system as a whole and place it on a footing, needed to prevent its degenerating in the way that the experts, to whom I have referred, assured that it has degenerated.

"The educational needs of our Muhammadan friends are still much neglected; and, in connection with the forthcoming schemes of primary education, it is of the utmost importance to consider whether adequate allotments should not separately be made in Muhammadan interest, in proportion to population, out of funds placed at the disposal of District Boards? The few model Muktabas, that have been started, cannot possibly make any impression on the situation, and much more expenditure is needed to remedy the educational backwardness of Muhammadans. An important question in this connection is, the need of employing teachers to teach Arabic and Persian, whose mother tongue is Arabic or Persian, as the case may be; and here also the question of money is bound to be predominant. A distinguished European official, identified with educational interests, was good enough to put it to me, in connection with the question of schooling fees, as to whether it would not be possible to make some concession in the case of two or more brothers at a Government school or College, *viz.*, the eldest might be charged full fee while the younger brothers might be charged less in some proportion to their numbers? I am told that such a system exists in the Punjab; and having regard to the educational backwardness of Muhammadans, I would respectfully suggest such an experiment, in their case, at all events, in these Provinces.

[Babu Deba Prasad Sarbadhikari.]

"Excluding expenditure under inspection, grants-in-aid and scholarships, we gather that the following special provision has been made for Muhammadan education :—

	Rs.
Calcutta Madrasa ... ..	61,800
Elliott Madrasa Hostel ... ..	5,109
Murshidabad Nawab's Madrasa ... ..	20,000
Muhammadan female education in Patna ... ..	1,200
Maktab scheme ... ..	3,420

"This is an educational field requiring and deserving special treatment, and we cannot persuade ourselves that all that can and ought to be done is being done in the matter. The educational backwardness of our Muhammadan fellow subjects is a reproach to the community, and the Government and Hindus would not only not grudge but would welcome measures, that would improve their position and give them equal educational advantage.

"The grants towards helping the Students' Hostels and Messes Committees will be inadequate next year, and at least twice as much as the last year's figure should be provided. Rupees 9,000 is the present grant to Calcutta hostels and messes, and it will have to be raised to at least Rs. 15,000

"We are glad and thankful that sanction has already been obtained for making necessary payments out of the general Educational grant of the year. The success or otherwise of the Hostel system will, for many reasons, and in many quarters, be keenly watched.

"The grant for Female Education is all too small, compared to its necessities and importance. We are told that a provision of more than 3½ lacs have been made under this head, including training institutions for girls. Greater expenditure is necessary for obtaining suitable Zenana teachers, considering the difficulty of recruiting them, a difficulty that prospects of handsome remuneration alone may in time overcome.

"There is no special grant ear-marked in the budget in aid of Art Schools, a deserving class of institutions that are doing useful work, and which, if properly supported, may do better work, both esthetic and industrial. It would be possible to eke out suitable grants from the general grant, no doubt; but stress has to be laid on the subject in order to ensure attention.

"And generally it may be said that there is no country in the world, so poorly provided with endowments for educational purposes, as India, whether by the Government or the people; and yet there is no country more in need of them. As long as this is so, it is the duty of Government to provide for the maintenance of a system of universal Primary Education; for it is the first duty of a State to see that every child receives at least the elements of Education.

"Nor can Secondary and University Education be neglected, and they both must be put on a sound financial and rational basis.

"It is the Schools that require financial support and re-modelling first of all, for they are feeders of the University; and to secure this, teachers must be trained and their prospects improved. All this means money and, in present circumstances, we must look to the Government for it. A much larger and more adequate appropriation from the public funds, provincial and imperial, is now urgently required for the proper equipping and staffing of high schools and colleges and for the training of teachers before we can hope to see the improvement, which the new University Regulations were framed to effect.

"I would, therefore, urge upon the Government the necessity of setting aside a much larger sum for Education than has been done. Without this, it is vain to look for any real advance. Machinery, without motive power, is useless, if not worse.

"My remarks on Educational topics have reached undue proportions, and I have to apologise for such length. The aspects are so many and so varied that the barest reference to them is bound, in the aggregate, to be long. As the opportunities, even for such bare references, are so few, I trust that Your

[*Babu Deba Prasad Sarbadhikari.*]

Honour and the Council will pardon the length of remarks, which in more capable and practised hands and with greater leisure, might have been somewhat condensed.

"Closely allied to the subject of Education and no less important are those of Temperance and Social Purity, which seriously affect the moral welfare, and I do not know why I should not add, the physical welfare, of the City and the Province.

"The public are awaiting, with expectation, some pronouncement regarding the Bengal Excise Bill. I am informed that Your Honour's Council and the Select Committee appointed by it, spent many hours in the spring of 1904 upon what was then stated and admitted to be an urgently needed reform of the Bengal Excise Act, VII of 1878. This Council is well aware of the circumstances that have spelt procrastination in the re-submission of that Bill; but I think it well to point out that, in these four years, the net Excise revenue has risen in the Province from Rs. 1,30,11,358 to Rs. 1,53,44,423, or twenty-three lakhs in all. Each year that passes signifies the gradual spread of the drinking habits among certain classes of the people, and consequently greater difficulty in carrying out the avowed policy of the Supreme Government, to 'minimise temptation to those who do not drink and to discourage excess among those who do.'

"The evidence placed before the Excise Committee, recently appointed by Your Honour, revealed the unsatisfactory character of the present Excise Administration in this City—the steady increase of drinking, excessive facilities arranged on no apparent principle, and without local consideration—large sales of imported liquors among sections of the population who, according to the finding of the Excise Commission, should not use it—an undesirable congestion of shops in certain parts of the City, and of hotels in the neighbourhood of Bentinck Street, Wellington Street and other points too numerous to mention. As the findings of the Excise Committee have not yet been made public, though it is hoped they soon will be, I desire only to observe that the public will be disappointed if the results of that investigation and the character of the evidence adduced do not result in—

- (a) an immediate and considerable reduction in the drinking facilities of the City;
- (b) an administrative reform, under which the Revenue Executive shall share with some other authority the power of deciding the number and location of all future licenses;
- (c) local opinion receiving much more consideration, so that to some extent the people chiefly concerned may have an opportunity of saying how many grog-shops they require and where they may be located;
- (d) an insistence that the standard of quality of all liquors sold, whether country or foreign, shall be subject to periodical and rigid examination;
- (e) a definite legislative measure, that shall not be a skeleton; allowing rules to be framed thereafter in accord with the personal idiosyncrasies of the Revenue authority for the time being, but that shall incorporate as part of the Act, all those reforms, the need of which has been so long admitted, *viz.*, no sales to children or drunken persons, the limit and hours of retail sales, the structural fitness and sanitary character of all shops, the minimum distance of one shop from another, and so on

"In my own immediate neighbourhood, near the crossing of the Wellington Street with the Bow-bazar Street, there are two drinking-dens literally within a few hundred feet of one another, and both doing lucrative business all hours of the day and most of the night. The British Parliament is legislating to counteract the admitted curse of intemperance, as the result of which no less than 30,000 licenses will be abolished within the next few years. The Bengal Legislature, which has the opportunity of legislating to prevent the curse falling upon the country, is losing golden opportunity every day and is thereby

[Babu Deba Prasad Sarbadhikari.]

adding to the difficulties of the situation. In 1904, the Government of India objected to the local option clause. Then came the Commission and the Government of India's criticism on its findings; then the appointment of the late Excise Commission, and nothing more has been heard since, excepting rumours about divided opinion. In the meanwhile Intemperance, and revenue that prospers by intemperance, have been steadily increasing, and the agonized cry of a long-suffering public is, 'How much longer?'

"Turning now to a subject that is admittedly a difficult problem in our civic life, and upon which silence is supposed to be golden, I desire to voice the opinion of all the respectable sections of the various communities of the city to thank Your Honour for the legislative action taken in the recent amendment of the Calcutta Police Act. The judicious use of the powers, conferred by that Act upon the Commissioner of Police, has led to the most desirable removal of a number of houses of ill-fame from the vicinity of Churches and schools, and I would add theatres and places of public amusements and resorts; and no right-minded man can object to the student class of the city being kept, as far as possible, from unnecessary temptation. It is to be noted, however, that the Act aims further at dealing with the main thoroughfares and great channels of communication, and that the recommendation of the Municipal Commissioners is necessary, before Your Honour can notify the Commissioner of Police to take effective action in clearing such thoroughfares of undesirable habitations. I should like to inquire if the Commissioners know of the power thus placed in their hands by the Legislature, and, if so, how much longer are our Civic authorities going to permit some of our leading streets, including Corporation Street itself, to be a moral disgrace to the City?

"Objection may, with justice, be urged against a policy of disturbance that only drives the social sin to darker haunts away from public scrutiny, and as we ought not to have the *Jasowaras* of Japan or cannot have the *Saitanpura* of the Ain-i-Akbari days, where a list of all Visitors, including high officials, was scrupulously kept, segregation must proceed on proper basis. In this connection, it is worthy of consideration whether some system of the 'Homes' and 'Refuges' cannot be organized in suitable neighbourhoods, for rescue of those who are willing to leave the evil path; for it is not enough to unhouse and dislocate wrong, but there should be some attempt to encourage repentance. Your Honour appointed a Special Committee to report to you on certain aspects of this evil, which, if successfully dealt with, would go far to materially reduce the extent and character it has unfortunately been allowed to reach. I may assure Your Honour that, in this matter also, public opinion would approve and support any legislative action that would accord the young life of our city the protection and aid it may legitimately claim at the hands of the State. And nothing would be more grateful to us than to be able to see Your Honour complete the work that Your Honour has so well begun.

"Next, in point of importance, are Law and Justice, and I naturally turn first to the High Court under this heading. A sum of Rs. 3,000 has been sanctioned for strengthening the ministerial Department of the Appellate side of the High Court. No provision has, however, been made for the Original side of the Court, where every office is undermanned and every subordinate officer is under-paid. With the increase in the number of Original Courts, the ministerial work has enormously increased; and orders and decrees are necessarily delayed and work suffers generally. With the recent appointments of the Official Referee and Assistant Referee, the idea seems to have got abroad that the High Court must not expect any further assistance from the Government; and, if the idea is at all well-founded, no idea could be more disastrous. If the High Court Judges have themselves made no reference, all that can be said is, that such a reference ought to have been and ought to be made; for all who know anything of the working of the Original side of the Court, know that there is great dissatisfaction in the offices themselves and in the profession in all its branches. The High Court has now its new building nearly completed, and partial removal to it will soon take place. There will be considerable costs entailed by the removal, and if there is no budget provision for this, the removal can hardly wait another year. Here also some provision

[Babu Deba Prasad Sarbadhikari.]

is urgently needed. Before leaving this subject, I desire to voice the gratitude of the community on the permanent appointment of Mr. S. P. Sinha to a post of the highest trust, which was the unrealized day-dream of the foremost of Indian Advocates of the time, Mr. W. C. Bonerji for 'Moti, the Advocate,' never came about. I desire also to congratulate the Government, in this connection, on the better recognition of the claims of the Bar to Police Court appointments; greater confidence in which, let us hope, will soon be restored by more discriminating appointments and by overhauling the work and appointment of Honorary Magistrates. While Government Solicitors' and Public Prosecutors' fees and special fees, in what are known as *Swadeshi* cases, are more than ever, it is sincerely to be hoped that the rumours about attempts to cut down the emoluments of the highest Law Officers of Government are not well-founded.

"I may now be permitted to make some observations regarding the prospects of the Judicial Branch of the Provincial Civil Service. Important pronouncements have been made regarding the separation of Judicial from Executive functions, which we have not yet sufficiently understood and realized, and which will take time to ripen into practical work. Whatever happens, the Judicial Service will soon have to be placed on a sounder basis all round.

#### I.—PARTITION OF THE SUBORDINATE JUDICIAL SERVICE.

"The Hon'ble Mr. Carlyle, in reply to a question by the Hon'ble Babu Jogendra Chandra Ghose, said in the Bengal Legislative Council on the 10th November, 1906, that the question regarding the separation of the Judicial Services of Bengal and Eastern Bengal was under the consideration of the Government. Though such a division would prejudicially affect the prospects of Munsifs of Eastern Bengal, our own Munsifs may be slightly better off, which may be a matter of congratulation so far. The total number of Munsifs and Subordinate Judges in both the Provinces is 314 and 61, respectively. At present, therefore, the proportion of Munsifs to Subordinate Judges is 5·1 to 1. But on Partition, in Eastern Bengal, there would be 136 Munsifs and 19 Subordinate Judges; and in Bengal, 178 Munsifs and 42 Subordinate Judges; that is to say, the proportion between the two branches of the Subordinate Judicial Service in Eastern and Western Bengal, would be 7·1 to 1 and 4·2 to 1, respectively. In other words, while at present, roughly speaking, one in every five Munsifs has the chance of being a Subordinate Judge, if the service be partitioned, in Eastern Bengal one in every seven; and in Western Bengal, one in every four, would have the same chance: that is to say, Munsifs of the old province will have nearly double the chance of those belonging to the new province, of being promoted to the superior branch. To render the chances equal in both the provinces, the number of Subordinate Judges in Eastern Bengal would have to be increased from 19 to 32. The average salary of a Subordinate Judge is Rs. 708 *per mensem*. To raise the present strength of the Subordinate Judges to the above figure, the Eastern Bengal Government shall have to spend Rs.  $(708 \times 12 \times 13 =)$  1,10,448 a year. We have no right to suggest any such expenditure to another Government; but this phase of the question of partition is of sufficiently general interest to be worthy of mention in this connection, specially as the appointments will still continue to be regulated by the High Court to a certain extent. And, in passing, the comparative bettering of the position of our own officers is worthy of note and admission.

"In the Budget debate of 1906 the Hon'ble Mr. Richardson, on behalf of the Government, was pleased to say: 'The Government has under its consideration certain proposals for improving the conditions of the Subordinate Judicial Service, as regards the rules regulating leave and pension.' Previous to this in March, 1906, the Hon'ble Mr. Richardson, in reply to a question by Babu Ambica Charan Mazumdar said: 'The question of amending the rule according to which officiating periods of service cannot be counted towards pension is already under consideration, and the Government hopes to be able to make some definite pronouncement regarding it at an early date.' On the 10th November of the same year, in reply to Babu Bhupendra Nath Basu, Mr. Richardson

[Babu Debā Prasad Sarbadhikari.]

again said that the Bengal Government was in communication with the Government of India, with regard to these proposals. On the 12th January, 1907, the Government, replying to a question on the same subject, expressed itself as follows: 'The proposal that Munsifs should be permitted to count the broken period spent by them in officiating appointments before confirmation as pensionable service, is still under consideration.' The members of the service would feel gratified to learn that the proposals of the Bengal Government have been approved by the Government of India.

## II.—INCREASE OF PAY AND PROSPECTS.

### (a) Abolition of the fourth grade.

"The grievances of members of the Judicial Branch of the Provincial Civil Service, who are admittedly a 'very competent and deserving body of officers' (*vide* the Hon'ble Mr. Streatfeild, in the Bengal Council on 8th February, 1908) are many and various. I mention here only the most prominent. First, as regards pay. It has often been urged (*vide* Calcutta Weekly Notes, 12th March, 1906, and 20th May, 1907), that Munsifs as soon as they are made permanent should be placed in the third grade on Rs. 250. At present, they officiate for two to three years on Rs. 200, and are then made permanent on the same salary in the fourth grade, which is called the 'probationary grade.' This is a misnomer, for Munsifs are recruited from the ranks of practising lawyers and three years of experience as officiating Munsifs give them a thorough judicial training. Their confirmation in service depends upon the favourable report of the District Judges under whom they serve. As Mr. Justice Jackson said long ago (quoted by Maharaja Jotindra Mohan Tagore in the Supreme Legislative Council on 28th March, 1877), 'Munsifs, even at the beginning of their career, are well prepared for the performance of their judicial duties, and failure in that respect is of great rarity.' The increase of pay here advocated can be supported on various grounds. In the first place, the price of food-grains, the wages of servants and house-rent have gone up to an extent unknown before; and, on this ground, the salaries of ministerial officers are soon to be increased. In the second place, formerly Munsifs used to begin service on Rs. 250, and the change would merely rehabilitate them to their former condition. Thirdly, members of the Provincial Police Service draw an initial pay of Rs. 250, and neither in previous training and educational qualifications, nor in social status and official dignity, do they surpass members of the Judicial Service. Fourthly, that officers belonging to the Provincial Executive Service begin at Rs. 200 cannot be advanced as an argument against this proposal, for, generally speaking, a Deputy Magistrate begins to draw Rs. 200 when he is much younger, and at the age when a Munsif is confirmed in service, he usually draws Rs. 300 a month.\* Fifthly, the increase of pay suggested above would work out to Rs. 29,400 *per annum*, which is less than the pay of one second grade District Judge. Sixthly, considering the profit which Government makes annually from civil litigation, amounting to considerably over fifty lakhs of rupees, this slight increase should not be grudged.

\*The maximum age at which a Deputy Magistrate can enter service is 26, while the minimum age at which it is practicable for a Munsif to be confirmed in service is 30.

### (b) Personal Allowance to first grade Munsifs invested with higher original powers.

"Again, Munsifs of the first grade who are vested with higher original powers should receive a personal allowance of Rs. 100 a month. It is well-known that the Government has often expressed its willingness to create a grade of Munsifs on Rs. 500 a month—thus admitting the necessity for such a grade—provided the High Court agreed to the abolition of the first grade of Subordinate Judges on Rs. 1,000 a month. But the High Court has stood firm on that point, and quite justifiably in our opinion, with the consequence that Government has refused to create a special grade of Munsifs on Rs. 500. The solution of this problem may be found in granting a personal allowance, such as that proposed to such members of the first grade of Munsifs as are called upon to exercise jurisdiction over suits above Rs. 1,000, but not exceeding Rs. 2,000 in value. It

[Babu Deba Prasad Sarbadhikari.]

is obviously unfair not to give some additional remuneration to such Munsifs, for the extra work thrown upon their shoulders—work which is properly the sphere of Subordinate Judges. The bestowal of this special jurisdiction, on a large number of senior Munsifs, has made it possible for the Government to confine the strength of the higher original Courts to their present limits and saved it a large amount of expense. The arrangement would also have its analogy in the Executive Service, where special allowances are granted for special work; and this constitutes a considerable source of income to officers of that service.

(c) *Temporary Promotions.*

“Another serious grievance of the members of the Subordinate Judicial Service is, that when a Subordinate Judge or Munsif goes on deputation to a higher appointment or takes furlough, or some other kind of leave other than privilege and casual, the senior officers of all the lower grades in succession, down to the lowest, are not in any way benefited by the temporary vacancy thus caused in the service. To almost all the other departments of the Public Service—ministerial officers not even excepted—this indulgence is invariably shown.

(d) *Joining time and Additional Munsifs.*

“A practice has grown up by which Munsifs and Subordinate Judges are deprived of the joining time, to which they are entitled on transfer under the Civil Service Regulations. These officers are now transferred during short vacations not lasting more than three or four days, and ordered to take over charge at the new station on the re-opening day. More consideration should be shown to gentlemen of their position who usually live with their family and are put to the greatest inconvenience, by being transferred on such short notice. Similarly, the practice of appointing senior officers as extra or additional hands, to relieve congestion of work at particular places when the appointment of junior officers would serve the purpose just as well, should be discontinued, as it causes unnecessary hardship to the officers concerned.

(e) *Munsifs' Quarters.*

“Munsifs' quarters have been built in many sub-divisional towns and *chaukis*, and I welcome some additions in this year's budget. They are very welcome and supply a long-felt want. For, as Justice Prinsep in his Minute, dated 15th July, 1885 (*vide* Calcutta Gazette, Part I, 10th March, 1886), observed:—

‘At the sub-divisions, contrast between the accommodation given to Judicial and Executive officials is specially remarkable in their private arrangements

The contrast is not only in the Court-houses, but in arrangements made for private accommodation. The Deputy Magistrate lives in comfort in a building belonging to the Government, the Munsif must be content with the best lodging that he can procure; and when his Court is often placed in a small village, the only lodging procurable is so unsuitable that he is forced to send his wife and family to his own home. Is it surprising that, with such disadvantages, the Executive should be regarded as the favoured service, and that Judicial Officers should feel that their interests and comforts are neglected? In education, in intelligence, in devotion to the public service, in public estimation, I venture to state that the officers of the Subordinate Judicial Service are not surpassed by those of any other department under the Government. Why, then, should the claims of this branch of the service always be deferred to those of other departments?’

“The attempt that is being made, to provide Munsifs in outlying stations with suitable dwelling-houses, therefore, deserves all praise. But it must, nevertheless, be urged that the scale of rent fixed for such houses, *viz.*, 10 per cent. of the pay, operates with undue severity on the Munsifs; for a house-rent of Rs. 30 or Rs. 40 per month in a mufassal village is rather high, and is usually more than can be commanded by the best private residences. A more reasonable scale would be the one given below, and I recommend it for the favourable consideration of the Government:—

Munsifs.					House-rent.
					Rs.
1st grade	...	...	...	...	30
2nd "	...	...	...	...	25
3rd "	...	...	...	...	20
4th "	...	...	...	...	15

[Babu Deba Prasad Sarbadhikari.]

"It would not be out of place to mention here that Deputy magistrates who are Sub divisional Officers, have to pay no house-rent at all.

(f) *Secret Reports.*

"Two other grievances, which require to be dealt with in a sympathetic spirit, may now be mentioned. In submitting their annual Administration Reports, District Judges are required to record their opinions regarding 'the character, qualifications and official merits of the Subordinate Judicial Officers' (Rule 63, Chapter X, General Rules and Circular Orders of the High Court, Volume I). These opinions are treated as strictly confidential and never made known to the officers concerned, and yet they form the basis of their promotion and preferment.

"It has often been ruled by the Privy Council (*vide* X, C.W.N. 969) and the Calcutta High Court (*vide* XII C.W.N. 65), as an elementary principle, which is binding on all persons who exercise judicial or quasi-judicial powers, that an order should not be made against a man's interest, without giving him an opportunity for being heard. Is it then just that the very officers, who have been warned by the High Court not to pass judgment against a person without giving him a chance of defending himself, should be condemned unheard by the High Court? Such a procedure is rapidly demoralizing the whole service, and officers are coming more and more to think that to keep the District Judge in good humour is the sole duty of their official existence, for it is a terrible weapon that has been placed in the hands of the District Judge; for District Judges, like all other persons, are very human, and if it is necessary in the interest of discipline to arm them with great power over their Subordinate Judicial Officers, it is also necessary, in the interests of justice and efficiency, that the latter should be given an opportunity of being heard in self-defence, before action is taken against them on the *ex parte* statement of their official superiors. Sir Richard Couch is reported to have said (*vide* the speech of Maharaja Jotindra Mohan Tagore in the Supreme Council, Gazette of India, 28th April, 1877): 'The appeal from a Munsif is in most cases heard by a Judge, who is not superior in knowledge and ability to the Judge whose decision is appealed against; in some instances, he is inferior.' Sir William Markby is also known to have expressed similar views. Is it likely that Munsifs should not feel conscious of this, and being conscious, should not regard the implicit reliance of the High Court, on the opinions of District Judges in matters concerning themselves, as more or less in the nature of an anomaly, besides being iniquitous? The Hon'ble Mr. Gait, Chief Secretary to the Government of Bengal, said the other day in giving evidence before the Decentralization Commission, that officers of the Indian Civil Service who were unfit for higher appointments should be compelled to retire on such pension as they had earned; but he was careful to add that he would not extend the rule to the Provincial Civil Service, and his reason was: 'one sees such divergent opinions expressed about the same officer.' Every member, of both the branches of the Provincial Civil Service, knows to his cost how true it is. If ability had been considered the sole test of merit, such divergent opinions would not be possible; the fact of the matter is, that these opinions are almost always coloured by the personal preconceptions and idiosyncrasies of the Civilians under whom members of the Provincial Service happen to serve for the time being, and it is therefore neither safe nor just to rely absolutely on such opinions. One of the most estimable of men and officers, that it has been my fortune to know, was kept out of his long deserved Subordinate Judgeship, because of his having been described in the secret reports as 'Erratic;' and not a little endeavour was necessary on the part of a sympathetic High Court before this cloud was lifted.

(g) *Representations.*

"The other matter, which arises for consideration in this connection is, that at present there is no well-defined channel for laying the grievances of individual Subordinate Judicial Officers before the High Court, in the matter of transfer and the like, it being entirely discretionary with District Judges to forward to the High Court any representation made by a Subordinate Judicial

[Babu Deba Prasad Sarbadhikari.]

Officer. If Munsifs and Subordinate Judges are expressly authorized to communicate demi-officially with the Registrar of the High Court ~~on these~~ subjects, or if it be made compulsory on the part of District Judges to forward such representations with his remarks, favourable or otherwise, the complaint would cease to exist. In the matter of demi-official correspondence, members of the Provincial Executive Service enjoy greater facility; in the case of the Provincial Judicial Service, District Judges or the Registrar of the High Court do not always treat such correspondence with consideration.

#### IV.—DISPOSAL, THE SOLE TEST OF MERIT.

"It is a matter of common complaint among members of the Subordinate Judicial Service, and it is also well-known to lawyers practising in the Mufasssal, that disposal has now become the sole test of merit, and a good Munsif is daily coming more and more to mean one who shows a large numerical out turn of work. It is forgotten that an officer who, besides the usual routine work, shows a daily average of say two contested cases, must either deal generally with easy cases, or do his work in a slipshod and perfunctory fashion. To sacrifice quality of work to quantity is a most mischievous policy, and is bound to lead to the deterioration of the service and serious injustice. When a Judicial Officer has to dispose of a large number of cases, within a fixed time, there is hardly much scope left him for a careful consideration of all the points at issue, and the study and discussion of the questions of law and fact involved. The District Judges are required to submit a concise statement regarding the outturn of work of Munsifs and Subordinate Judges once every quarter, and rule 59 of Chapter X of the General Rules and Circular Orders of the High Court says: 'these statements will be taken into consideration by the Court in connection with transfers and promotions in the Subordinate Judicial Service.' Generally, though not always, the High Court calls for explanations from such officers as are found to have shown a deficient outturn of work; and the number of such explanations, which the High Court has to consider every quarter and ultimately accept as satisfactory, must be very large indeed. But what I was going to point out is, that there is no rule emphasizing the need of examining the quality of the judgments delivered by these officers, which ought to be a matter of greater importance, if justice be the primary object aimed at. Had such a rule existed, the average outturn would certainly have been smaller, and the number of Munsifs and Subordinate Judges would have to be increased.

#### V.—STATUS AND PRESTIGE OF THE SUBORDINATE JUDICIARY.

"The status and prestige of Subordinate Judicial Officers instead of being gradually improved are being steadily lowered, thus bringing them down more and more to the level of ministerial officers in relation to the District Judge. It will not be denied that in point of culture, learning and ability, the difference between the District Judges and the Subordinate Judiciary has appreciably diminished, and that the proper relation between them ought to be that subsisting between Senior and Junior colleagues. A little more consideration, for the feelings and sensibilities of members of the Subordinate Service, would add immensely to its popularity.

##### (a) Contract Contingency grants.

"Take, for instance, the case of the small monthly expenditure which have to be incurred in every Munsif or Subordinate Judge's office, and which are met from the District Judge's contract contingency grants. These expenses are necessary in connection with the purchase of matches, candles, small articles of furniture and the like, and in executing petty repairs. No distinction is, however, made between large and small items, and for every pice spent by the Munsif or Subordinate Judge, the previous sanction of the District Judge has to be obtained. Not only does a Munsif try suits up to Rs. 1,000 in value, but in Small Cause Court cases he is vested with final and summary jurisdiction, with respect to suits up to the value of Rs. 100. A Subordinate Judge has unlimited original jurisdiction and exercises Small Cause Court powers over

[Babu Deba Prasad Sarbadhikari.]

money suits, not exceeding Rs. 500 in value. Government officers, who are vested with such large powers over the pecuniary concerns of the public, including the Secretary of State for India, cannot spend a pice out of the public funds without the District Judge's permission. This irksome, irritating and unnecessarily suspicious policy of petty pinpricks should be abolished; and the interests of economy would be sufficiently safeguarded if a small uniform scale of monthly grants were sanctioned to meet the contingent charges of Subordinate Judicial Officers, and the registers of such expenditure kept by them subjected to periodical inspection by the District Judge.

(b) *Ministerial Appointments.*

"In official parlance, a Munsif or a Subordinate Judge is the head of an office, and the District Judge is the head of a Department. At present, all appointments, down to that of an orderly peon which is likely to last for more than two months, are made by the District Judge, under section 31 of the Civil Courts Act of 1887. Under the Civil Courts Acts of 1871 and 1881, however, all appointments, in a Munsif or Subordinate Judge's establishment, used to be made by the head of the office himself, subject to the approval of the District Judge. The effect of this change has almost invariably been the reduction of the head of the office to a cypher in the estimation of his staff, and the bestowal of unlimited patronage in the hands of the District Judge's sarishtadar and the nazir. This centralization of power, in the Civil Judicial Department, is irritating and unnecessary. There is no statutory rule which makes it incumbent on the District Judge to consult a Subordinate Judicial Officer when promoting, transferring or degrading a ministerial or menial officer on his establishment; and oftener than not, the District Judge acts in these matters on his own initiative, without reference to the head of the office. This is not calculated to raise the Subordinate Judiciary in the esteem of *amladom*; nor does it make the maintenance of discipline easier for them.

(c) *Power of District Judges to suspend Munsifs.*

"A most significant illustration of the anachronism which characterizes some of the provisions of the Civil Courts Act is furnished by section 29, which lays down that a District Judge may in urgent cases go the length of suspending a Munsif and report the fact at once to the High Court. This rule was framed to meet the exigencies of a time long past, when Munsifs were no better than the *amlas* of the present day in respect of education and reputation for honesty, and when communication was not so easy as at present. Now a-days it is impossible to conceive of a case of judicial corruption or misconduct so urgent that it cannot be suitably dealt with by the High Court, through the medium of the electric telegraph with due despatch and promptitude. As a matter of fact, District Judges do not find it necessary to exercise the power vested in them by this section; but the fact that it exists on the Statute Book none the less shows how slow the Government is to move with the times, in matters affecting the Subordinate Judicial Service. This unnecessarily humiliating provision should be repealed, as the first step towards an improvement in the status of the Service.

"Munsifs have been described as 'Judgment-producing machines,' and it is well-known that they are overworked. Nobody will deny that the improvements here suggested, if carried out, will make their lot a little happier. To the vast majority of them, the hope of a first grade Subordinate Judgeship or an Officiating District Judgeship, at the end of their career, is a delusion and a snare. Such illusory prospects do not tempt them or cheer up the gloom of a singularly monotonous career, which often ends in diabetes and premature death. Some of the real hardships and grievances from which they suffer, I have tried to point out at the risk of being voted wearisome, and I shall not mind this vote if some good comes to the services. Visions of glory, such as those implied by a remote District Judgeship, are not unoften displayed before their eyes (*vide* the Hon'ble Mr. Richardson's speech in the Bengal Council on 7th April, 1906), but more substantial good will be done to them if, instead of

[*Babu Deba Prasad Sarbadhikari.*]

wasting time in drawing such eloquent fancy-portraits, the powers that be were to devote their attention to a few simple remedies and make an earnest and sympathetic attempt to give effect to them.

“Let me now briefly refer to some other items of the budget, which would require more detailed and careful examination; but which after taking up so much of the time of the Council already, I can now ill afford. Foremost of these is the question of Sanitation. Complaints were made at the previous year's Budget debate regarding the insufficiency of provision under the head of Sanitation, having special regard to the increasing ravages of Malaria. Provision for combating Malaria should be clearly shown and be sufficient. Under the head of ‘Sanitation’ would come the items about which pointed attention was drawn last year—

- (a) jungle-clearing ;
- (b) improvements of silted rivers and water-channels, such as the Bhairab valley drainage and Bhagirathi valley drainage ;
- (c) removal of obstruction of water-courses ;
- (d) improvement of water-supply in the mufassal—sinking of artesian wells to which attention was called last year, and excavation of tanks.

“Under heading ‘Miscellaneous’ (page 4, Appendix), grants for some Water-works are shown. No provision for the Hooghly Water-works has been shown, because no scheme has been yet matured. But it ought to be matured at once, and will, we hope, be ready next year. There is a strong public feeling with regard to this matter, and it is important to bear in mind that on the improvement of the health of places near Calcutta, towards which greater Calcutta could extend, would to a considerable extent depend the health of Calcutta. Great things have recently been claimed on behalf of Calcutta, about which Calcutta residents are naturally sceptical. Realization of the Calcutta Improvement Scheme, in the not very distant future, has again been promised, and Your Honour has vigorously summoned lagging merchants to their places in the front, in which they were with so much solicitude placed. But let us reiterate, as our representatives have pressed over and over again, that a better and greater Calcutta will not be possible till the surroundings are cleared and till Calcutta concerns are once more placed in hands that have the most interest in them, by a judicious and sympathetic amendment of the Municipal Act. The civic wet-nursing that has gone on so far, is pronounced insufficient, nay, unwholesome, and Municipal Government is described as a ‘hopeless farce,’ under the new-born system. And the fumes of the ten-year old vintage are still very much in evidence, judging from the utterances of the Hon'ble Mr. Larmour, to which we have just listened. Never could there be better opportunity of amending the Act than when the present and the past Chairman of the Corporation are on the Council, and when the Council may have further the assistance of several present and past members, who knew and know its working thoroughly well. And it would be exceedingly appropriate and grateful, Sir, to have the close of Your Honour's régime associated with the restoration of metropolitan civic life. If the needs of greater Calcutta were more in view, we should not have had to send away the Engineering College at an enormous cost from unhealthy surroundings, which a mere fraction of the cost of the proposed removal would improve.

“We are thankful that the general question of Sanitation is engaging the attention of the Government of India, and a small Imperial grant has after all been made. What sanitary improvements can do, in the way of lowering death rates, can be seen in England, where death rate has been reduced from 20 to 15·5 per thousand in 20 years. During a similar period in India, it has gone up from 28 per thousand to 36 per thousand. The representatives of the people are, therefore, bound to draw pointed attention to the matter, year after year. The necessity of providing and clearing tanks and wells in the Mufassal should be incessantly impressed upon all local bodies; and, having regard to the dangerous river pollution that has been steadily going on for some years in the neighbourhood of Calcutta, the question of supply of filtered water, within the

[Babu Deba Prasad Sarbadhikari.]

mill regions, along both the banks of the Hooghly, cannot possibly be trifled with. Mr. Hanikin's recent researches show that the water of the Ganges and the Jumna is hostile to the growth of the cholera microbe, not only owing to the absence of food materials but owing to the actual presence of an antiseptic of a mysterious description, that has the power of destroying this microbe. Science has thus justified time-honored tradition; but we are afraid that this may not strengthen our protest against pollution, but may, on the other hand, justify, prolong and vindicate that pollution in the interest of trade and industry.

"Regarding jungle-clearing and other important sanitary undertakings, I desire to draw the attention of the Government and of the district authorities to the recent formation of bands of sanitary workers all over the country. The merest of helps and the slightest of encouragements—at all events absence of all discouragement—will be a great help to these veritable 'pioneers,' who Ruskin-like are determined, spade in hand, to do a much neglected and long-needed work. What good work in these directions our young men are capable of, was abundantly illustrated in connection with the recent *Ardhodaya Jog* festival, as Your Honour was good enough to testify; and it would be a gain all round to promote and encourage such work and bring people back to the olden ideas of things, in which the King and the King's officers have to lead the way. His Majesty the King-Emperor has been graciously pleased to do so already by his sympathetic pronouncements, in connection with plague prevention. It remains for the officers to follow suit, and however much one may spend money on rat-catching or flea-destroying, which subsequent scientific ideas discountenance, the outstanding fact remains that Sanitation proper should not be neglected; and before hygienic novelties are pressed on a starving people, they should be better fed, better housed, better clothed, have better drains and better water supply. When these common-place necessities are forthcoming, sanitary reforms will be automatic, and to this end our strenuous and serious efforts must bend.

"The provision for compensation for dearness of food ought, I think, to be enlarged; we are once again thankful to Your Honour for Your Honour's powerful plea in the Imperial Council in this behalf. With increasing dearness of food, the sufferings of the lower middle classes is indescribable; and relief to clerks drawing Rs. 50 and under and not Rs. 30 and under should at least be provided. I am glad the Hon'ble the Nawab Bahadur of Murshidabad has also taken this view of things. In Bombay, where the suffering is less, there has been, I understand, a provision like this. This will no doubt entail much heavier expenditure, but the situation demands it. We are glad to have the assurance of Your Honour's Secretaries that the matter is separately under consideration, and we hope to see early fruition. A painful and regrettable phase of the scarcity question is, the increase of registration fees, indexing indiscriminate transfer of holdings, apparently to money-lenders to stave off the passing evil of the hour. It is a serious question whether this cannot and ought not to be minimised, if not stopped, and whether the scope of the relief-loan system cannot be suitably enlarged? At all events, in deserving cases, which ought not to be difficult to discriminate, full profits should not be made out of the people's woes; and the scale of fees may be capable of revision, though a discount, and by no means a premium, ought to be put upon thoughtless and avoidable alienation.

"Allied to this is the subject of Famine Relief which is really of no greater importance, for the sufferings of our lower middle classes are past describing and imagining. We are told that the amount that may be required, according to the latest revised reports received from the local officers under Famine Relief, has been provided for thus:—

		1907-08.	1908-09.
		Rs.	Rs.
Imperial	...	8,00,000	7,50,000
Provincial	...	...	2,50,000

"If the situation alters, so as to necessitate a larger expenditure for the purpose of giving adequate relief, an additional grant will be made, we are told,

[Babu Deba Prasad Sarbadhikari.]

WITH the sanction of the Government of India, which is satisfactory so far and there need be no present apprehension about the matter.

“One phase of the question is, however, a puzzle to me—the recent strikes and labour difficulties and the difficulty of obtaining domestic servants, in spite of admitted and patent scarcity. If these difficulties are so noticeable, even in times of stress and trouble, the question of legislating upon the relations of master and servant and of artisan and employer, and between capital and labour, generally, cannot long be relegated to the back ground, if serious economic, social and domestic troubles are to be avoided. A philanthropically inclined gentleman offered to pay for the travelling, clothing, up-keep, treatment and employment and return home, after a stated time, of a hundred persons from a famine area, and he had no response. The Government and the people are alike interested to ask and know as to what this may mean?

“We are grateful that Your Honour's Government is, through the medium of the recent Fisheries inquiries, doing important work, for bettering the food-supply of the country; and I sincerely hope to see early success of these labours. I confess that, for what such opposition might be worth, I was opposed to the purchase of a fishing trawler, for which budget provision has been made, and even the knowledge that the purchase was already a *fait accompli* did not seem to me to alter the situation. I had, however, the advantage of talking the matter over with Mr. Ahmed, whom Your Honour has selected for carrying on Mr. K. G. Gupta's work, and I was convinced of the immense possibilities in the direction aimed at. I desire, therefore, openly to withdraw my opposition and give the provision my humble support, none the less warmly, because we hope to have the proud distinction of setting an example even to the first City of India. But what I do complain of about the matter is, the *fait accompli* element; for we do not understand, at least without some explanation, why budget provisions should be needed or made for what had already been not only decided on, ordered and purchased, but was actually on its way out? In these remarks, I desire to include the provision for the second cruiser for the Sandheads, at a cost of nearly five and-a-half lakhs of rupees, which, as we gather, is similarly situated.

“A large item of a lakh and twenty thousand rupees has been allotted to the Calcutta Municipality, for re-alignment of drains in the new Presidency Jail. We are told that the Government of Bengal was committed to this expenditure, when the Victoria Memorial Scheme was inaugurated. I have not been able to get particulars of such a committal; but I do venture to think and urge that it is the Memorial Funds that ought to bear these costs, as well as the cost of building the Jail, a lac and fifty thousand out of which is budgetted this year, particularly, as there seems to be no immediate or very near prospects of more beneficial employment of the funds. Wherever else it may be, there is in my mind no confusion of ideas regarding the matter.

“A large sum of Rs. 45,000 has been budgetted as a grant for alteration of the Circular Canal Bridge. I submit this is unnecessary and undesirable, and I would respectfully ask Your Honour to expunge this item. The existing bridge, though old and old-fashioned, is good enough for its purposes, and the improvements are needed for the benefit of the Tramway Company, who will take their trebly reproductive lines over the bridge. They will pay a mere paltry sum of Rs. 15,000 and the remaining 45,000 is to be paid by the Government, for which there is no plea or justification. Only the other day, a very necessary bridge on the southern side of the canal was negatived, though the Corporation was ready with a handsome contribution; and if any money is to be spent on bridges by the Government, it should be for the provision of urgently needed new bridges like this, and not by way of aiding and benefitting private enterprises, steadily earning fat dividends.

“I have trespassed far too long on the patience and forbearance of the Council, and my apology once again is the vast and varied range of interests to be traversed. The Budget debate is about the only opportunity that non-official members have of drawing the attention of Government to important public questions, though in the course of the year there may be some change for the

[*Babu Deba Prasad Sarbadhikari; Babu Gajadhar Prasad.*]

better, or as some apprehend for the worse. What is in store, is hidden away from the ken of normal humanity and is veritably on the knees of the gods. The heart is weary and sick with waiting, and it is best not to pitch public expectation too high, lest the disappointment be proportionate. After longer years of travail and labour than memory can recall, the first move towards the bettering of the relations between the Judicial and the Executive is about to be attempted, but commentaries and elucidations are awaited with interest for expounding the situation. Public judgment has therefore been judiciously suspended, and upon Your Honour's Government and the Government of East Bengal, the close connection between which is thus officially emphasised, will fittingly devolve the first toils of elaborating schemes, pregnant with possibilities.

"The present is not only an anxious time, but is also a time of stress, strain and struggle, the character of which is hard to divine and will be harder to control, if due appreciation and restraint are wanting all round. So long as people's interests are in the hands of officials like those that welcomed the pick of our culture at the Rector's Jubilee party last month under shadows of sickness and sorrow that, thank Heaven, are gradually lifting, there need be no serious apprehension about the future. It is no less a misfortune of the governors than of the governed, that there can be but the least affinity in this country between the official head and the official hand, the official heart and the official tongue, for the tongue dare not utter what the heart feels, and the hand is not permitted to do what the head dictates. The limitations and possibilities of officials in India are unique, such as are not open even to those born unto the purple elsewhere, for the veriest tyro may rule rulers of men to-morrow. Amidst hollow artificialities and in mistaken zeal, however, golden opportunities are often worse than frittered away. There is no country in which people are more thankful for the smallest of small mercies, and not the least of the achievements of the Decentralization Commission will be the bettering of the relation between officials and non-officials to which throughout its sittings so much prominence has justly been given. Such cordiality, if genuine, will of itself solve many an outstanding administrative problem of difficulty, and the gentlest of whisperings will achieve more than the most brutal of the doomed whipping. 'Live and let live' is the agonised cry, and when the pursuer, the prosecutor and the punisher are different under the new régime; when prestige ceases to loom unhealthily large; when superior courts and officers have not, at every step, to check magisterial and executive vagaries, as has almost been the rule in the near past all over the Continent; when living, education and sanitation are all broad-and-firm based;—then and then alone will the ruler's work be easy, profitable and pleasant, and then will people realize that the prospect is not so gloomy, so weary, or so desolate, and they have something real to live for and work for. While Mr. Redmond is with mock-pathos and moderation pleading for the same treatment for the Irishman as the Frenchman receives at Quebec and the Dutch in the Transvaal, the Indian is the object of contempt and contumely at home and abroad, and the situation is getting more and more complex, with possibilities of mischief in unscrupulous hands. The antidote can never be growing repression and the attachment of the bayonet and the baton to the same belt. Larger confidence and greater premium on endeavours on the side of law and order, are sovereign remedies, and sympathy and appreciation can work marvels even at the breaking-point. Under soothing and wholesome influences like these, law and order are bound to be assured commonplaces, and the power of resisting plague, famine and other earthly woes may yet return to a people, the last vestiges of whose manhood are fast ebbing away, by a long course of untold sufferings. Under the changed order of things the cultivation of stout optimism, the latest of scientific panaceas, may be possible, and it is devoutly to be hoped that a 'morning of morbid tendencies and incapacity' will veritably be 'changed to an eventide of productive usefulness.'"

The Hon'ble BABU GAJADHAR PRASAD said:—"Your Honour—It has often been said that the debate on the Budget has at best an academic interest and is utterly hollow in its character. But I feel no hesitation

[*Babu Gajadhar Prasad.*]

in making the remark that Your Honour's Government has effected improvements in the system which prevailed in the past, and is certainly favourably inclined towards a real expansion of the privileges which we, the non-official Members of the Council, at present enjoy. The informal discussion of the Financial Statement among the Members, both official and non-official, before its formal presentation to the Council is an important departure from the old beaten lines and likely to be productive of some good to our community.

"I deem it my duty first to congratulate the Hon'ble the Financial Secretary on the simplicity and lucidity of the statement which he has laid upon the table. I am sorry he has not been able to show any large surplus; indeed we have not got before us a Prosperity Budget. Famine Stricken Provinces can hardly be expected to have Prosperity Budgets.

"I think it fair to thank the Government of India for making an additional grant of Rs. 22,47,000 from the Imperial Revenues, and to thank Your Honour for making provisions in the Budget for Famine Relief and for other works of sanitary, educational and agricultural improvements. But I cannot at the same time help mentioning that the sum of money allotted for the purpose of Famine Relief does not seem to be enough for the year 1908-1909. It is well-known that the paddy crops have suffered much this year; somewhere by inundation, somewhere by drought and somewhere by both. Comparatively very small areas in Bihar yielded a normal quantity of paddy. I think the villages situated on both sides of the canals only had a normal quantity of paddy. The *rabi* in many cases could not be properly sown for want of moisture in the soil at the time of sowing; but some lands were anyhow sown, and the prospects of *rabi* seemed to be brilliant. Unfortunately in some parts of Bihar, they also have suffered from heavy hailstorms and rains, and many tenants have lost a good deal of money and labour over these crops. In short, the year is a bad one and all sorts of crops have been more or less damaged. Orissa is stricken with Famine, and I am afraid lest Bihar should be similarly affected.

"I am fully aware of the fact that the distress in some other parts of India is greater and more severe than in Bengal; but I cannot close my eyes to the intense scarcity which is afflicting the millions in our midst. It is possible that the Government may soon be called upon to face the difficulty and to take some measures for the protection of the people under its charge. The budget itself shows that there has been an increase in the income from Registration. This fact is an index to the poverty of the people and to the greater and greater hold which the money-lender is day by day having upon them. Under the circumstances, the Government should be prepared to spend a large amount of money for this purpose; the provision in the Budget is not adequate. In every year of abnormal distress, such items of expenditure, as can be conveniently put off, should be put off; for instance, the reclaiming of the Sundarbans at the cost of Rs. 50,000, survey of the Sundarbans at the cost of Rs. 20,000 and such other items. The sum of money, thus saved, should be devoted to the relief of the poor. In answer to my question in the Council meeting on the 8th February, the Government was pleased to state as follows:—

'The Government is aware that the prices of food-grains in Bihar are high, but there is no Famine anywhere at present. Takavi loans are being given freely in districts where they are needed, and arrangements have been made for relief operations. These will be commenced without delay should the necessity arise.'

"But unless we provide a sufficient amount of money in the Budget no arrangement can be satisfactorily made for relief operations, should such a necessity arise.

"In this connection, I note with pleasure that the Government generously desires to continue the grant of Grain Compensation Allowance to low-paid officers, but I should be glad if we could afford to grant some such compensation to all officers drawing less than Rs. 50 per month; for there is no doubt that the middle classes of our people are feeling most the severity of the Famine.

[Babu Gajadhar Prasad.]

**"Irrigation.**—I am glad to find that much has been done and is being done for Canal Irrigation. It is through the Sone Canal this year, that large areas situated on both sides of the canal yielded paddy crops and have got good *rabi*. It appears from experience that we cannot have full rain every year. As the large majority of the people of this Province live upon agriculture and their well-being depends upon proper arrangement for irrigation, and as it is impossible to have canals in every locality, I beg respectfully to suggest the introduction of a system of well-irrigation. The system of well-irrigation has, I hear, been tried in the Madras Presidency and there is no reason why it should not be tried in our part of the country. In Bihar, the depth of the well is not very great. If the Government provides big wells with big water-lifting machines, it is very likely that it would be a source of considerable profit, both to the Government and to the people. If the Government is required to spend Rs. 20,000 on the well-irrigation of a village, having 1,000 bighas, and if it charges Rs. 3 a bigha as water rate, it would mean a substantial help to the people and a clear source of income to the Government. In places where it is not practicable to have canal irrigation, it would, I submit, be expedient to establish a system of well-irrigation. In my opinion, no tenant or zamindar will grudge to pay water-rate for irrigation by means of wells; they will rather pay more for it than for canal-irrigation, and that for the following reasons:—

- (1) They will be sure of having some produce every year.
- (2) According to my information, gathered from experienced cultivators, well-water brings out larger produce than canal-water. Well-water is a better fertiliser.
- (3) Some lands in some localities irrigated by canal-water are being deteriorated day by day on account of silt deposit, and there is no such risk in Well-irrigation.
- (4) When on account of drought rivers are dried up, canals cannot supply a sufficient quantity of water; but that will not be the case with wells.
- (5) In his budget speech at the Bengal Council on the 7th April, 1906, the Hon'ble Mr. Inglis very properly remarked: 'With respect to Irrigation, in my opinion, it is undoubtedly the case that where, as on the Sone Canals, rice has taken the place of other crops, requiring less water or not requiring irrigation at all, there is some increase in sickness, which we call in a general way malarial fever. This may be due to a rise in the level of the sub-soil water or to other causes; but, whatever the cause, I believe it to be a fact that you cannot have a purely artificial cultivation of rice on a large scale without some bad effect on health' This evil cannot exist if Well-irrigation is resorted to. Again, there is another useful means of irrigation. But this also cannot be utilized without the help of the Government. There are numerous small rivers and rivulets which can be used as canals, for irrigation purposes.

"I have noted above my humble suggestions for the provision of greater facilities for Irrigation; they are based on crude ideas and have not been subjected to scientific scrutiny. But the subject is so important that I beg to invite the attention of the Government to it, and to request that it may consult its scientific experts, and see if it can take any such action in the matter. We should never lose sight of the fact that India is an agricultural country, and that any harm to its agricultural interests would spell its ruin.

**"Excise.**—It cannot but be deplored that the Government is under the necessity of accepting revenue from the liquor traffic. It is now a well-established fact that intemperance is a curse, and that no pains should be spared for its suppression. In every age and in every country, it has been severely condemned; and nowhere more than in India. The people of our land are by their habits, as also by their religions, remarkably averse to drink. Anything, therefore, which places temptations in their way and which has the likely effect of leading them astray, should be deprecated as much as possible. The Government should do all that it can for the discouragement of the liquor traffic; no anxiety for gain should interfere with the right performance of its duties. And I am glad that not only the Government of Bengal but the

[*Babu Gajadhar Prasad.*]

Government of India and the Secretary of State have more than once given out their approval of the principle I have referred to above.

"The Government of Bengal in its Resolution appointing the Commission of 1883-1884 stated: 'It is unnecessary here to recapitulate all that has been said against and in favour of the outstill system, which is in force over practically the whole area of the Province outside Calcutta and its environs. One thing is clear, that there has been a serious increase in drinking among the people. That increase is not confined to the area under the outstill system, but that it has taken place throughout a great part of that area is not open to question. Whether the causes in operation are the same as those which have caused the increase in the smaller area under the Sader distillery, or whether they are special causes, either inherent in the system or brought into force by the present application, it is impossible for the Government to allow this increase in drinking to continue, without making every effort to ascertain their causes, and if possible to remove them. No consideration of revenue can be allowed to outweigh the paramount duty of the Government to prevent the spread of Intemperance, so far as it may be possible to do so.' I believe there has been no change in the policy of the Government since 1883, when this Resolution was published.

"Your Honour's Government has always been friendly to the cause of Temperance. The actual Excise revenue in 1906-1907 was Rs. 1,60,81,92, and the revised estimate of 1907-1908 was Rs. 1,70,00,000, the present budget estimate is Rs. 1,75,00,000, half of which is our Provincial share. Such a big jump in the Excise revenue is deplorable. If the estimate of revenue is raised, the Officers placed over the Excise Department may come to believe that they are bound to try for a proportionate increase of revenue in their respective districts, and may thus be led to display extra zeal in the raising of the receipts from Excise. Revenue may be increased by the raising of the price, but this means may not always succeed in decreasing drunkenness. I have learnt on inquiry that when the revenue of a particular shop is increased, the shopkeeper sells liquor cheaper than before (of course he sells adulterated liquor and thus secures a larger sale). There is here also a risk of increasing drunkenness.

"It is strange that no rate has been fixed by the Government for the sale of liquor by the shop-keepers. Shop-keepers are at liberty to sell liquor at any price which suits them. The Government should fix at least the minimum price of the liquor to be sold at the shops. Unless the Government lays down any such restriction, drunkenness is bound to increase and the morals of the people are liable to be injuriously affected. The Excise Bill is pending before the Bengal Council. I have proposed amendments to the following effect, viz., 'no license for the sale of any intoxicating liquor or drug in any locality shall be granted against the wishes of the majority of the people of that locality, and that no intoxicable liquor or drug should be sold to women or to children below 16 years of age.' The Government is a guardian of the people; it has to promote their interest; it has to protect them from evil. There is no reason why it should allow women or young boys to be assailed by temptations. If a man who has attained the age of discretion contracts evil habits or falls into ways of debauchery, the Government or even his parents can hardly help it. But it is otherwise with women and young boys. In the latter case, the Government and the parents are to a great extent the controlling authorities. The Government should so far as practicable help the parents in keeping the children straight.

"Again, I do not see how any Government can reasonably oppose the principle of local option. A liquor shop should never be thrust upon a people that do not like it. It is gratifying to note here, that the Government has not unoften laid down the principle that such shops should not be opened in the vicinity of important public institutions. But that is not enough. I humbly submit that the Government should formally recognize the rule of local option and make it incumbent upon its Excise Officers to respect the rule. I have known numerous instances in which the opinion of the people of the locality concerned has been utterly disregarded and treated with a

[Babu Gajadhar Prasad.]

contempt which it did not deserve. The Excise Committee also did not condemn the principle; indeed its report supports, to a certain extent, the proposal that due provision should be made in the Excise Act, for the ascertaining and respecting of public opinion.

"The Excise Committee recommends a general prohibition of the sale of liquor to children. The Committee, no doubt, hesitates to put a sudden stop to the sale to women; but the Committee is, I see, of opinion that the local authorities should have power to stop such a sale, in case of need. But if the sale is an evil, I do not understand why it should not be put a stop to by the Government; why should such a matter be left to the discretion of the local authorities? I believe the British Government will soon have in England a Licensing Act which would largely reduce the evils attendant upon the liquor traffic, and I hope our Government will not fail to grant us the boon of local option in the Bill which is yet pending before it.

"Before I pass on to another topic, I should like to speak a word or two about cigarette smoking. Cigarette smoking among schoolboys prevails to an alarming extent and does, it is held, immense harm to their health and studies. Is it possible to restrict its use among boys by legislation?

"*Assessed Taxes.*—There is an increase under this head also. The actual figure of 1906-1907 in the Provincial share was Rs. 24,33,631, and the revised Budget estimate for 1907-1908 was Rs. 25,25,000, and the present Budget estimate is Rs. 26,25,000. Of course, this figure represents half of the really estimated income under this head.

"I think in these days of scarcity, this figure in the budget is alarming. If the estimate is kept at such a high figure, every officer in charge would deem it necessary for him to increase the tax to its utmost limits. The result may be that the people who expected reductions on account of any falling off in their incomes would find their prayers unheeded, or that those who did not deserve to be assessed would be saddled with the burden. It cannot be gainsaid that, India, during the days of scarcity, the income of the people is considerably induced; no increase in the Income-tax should be expected. In the preparation of the Budget, I humbly think the actuals of the last year should be our guide.

"*Education*—It cannot be doubted that all the Provinces are equally entitled to the support and sympathy of the Government. The Government is *ma bap* to all of them. But just as the parents devote more attention to their infant children than to those that are grown up and are capable of carving out their career, the Government is bound to lend greater help to the weak and the infirm in their faltering steps on the path of education. Similarly, the more advanced provinces are morally bound to help their less advanced sister provinces. Bihar cannot be adequately grateful to the Government for the improvements that have been already made, and that are likely to be made in the immediate future in the Patna College and the Temple Medical School. Your Honour's Government has indeed done much for the well-being of these two important Educational Institutions in that Province. But Bihar badly needs and richly deserves some encouragement at the hands of the Government, in the matter of Technical Education. On the 25th January last, I suggested in one of my questions in the Council that the Bihar School of Engineering should be raised to the status of a college. The Government was pleased to reply as follows:—

'It is hoped that the Sibpur Engineering College will shortly be removed to Ranchi. This site will be in all respects as favourable for Bihar students as for students from the rest of Bengal. The Lieutenant-Governor, as at present advised, does not consider that there is room for a second Engineering College in this Province. It would not be possible to have another College equally efficient with the College now situated at Sibpur.'

"I agree to the opinion that it would not be possible at present to have another College equally efficient with that now situated at Sibpur; but I think it would not be easy for one College at Sibpur or Ranchi to accommodate all the students of Bihar and Bengal. And I am humbly of opinion that the present requirements of Bihar would be sufficiently met if the Bihar School of Engineering were raised to the status of a second class College, teaching up to the F. E. Standard of the Calcutta University. I have had discussions on



[Babu Gajadhar Prasad.]

"It would appear that only two additional Professors and some additional expenditure in the workshop would be required, in case the school is raised to that standard; there would be in all probability a recurring charge of only about Rs. 6,000 a year and an initial outlay of Rs. 10,000, for the purchase of some machinery: the latter, of course, would be non-recurring.

"Then there is another important factor, *vis.*, the income from the fees and fines of the College. It is probable that the Government will not have to spend a very large sum of money for the maintenance of the College. It is expected that the income from F. E. class and the workshop will not be inconsiderable. We have got at present a splendid building, with a splendid hostel attached to it; and I respectfully submit we should try to widen the usefulness of the school. It is really a very fortunate circumstance that we can raise the status of the school at a cost of only Rs. 6,000 a year. The Government should not fail to avail itself of such an excellent opportunity. Only a little help from the Government will place the people of Bihar under a deep debt of gratitude. The fund which was spent on the construction of the building and the equipping of the Institution was raised by private subscription, on the occasion of His Majesty's visit to Patna. The chief donor was Nawab Syed Lutfali Khan Bahadur, C.I.E., of Patna. The Board of Visitors of the School spent its fund with the hope that they would have a College. If the Board, of which I have the honour to be a member, had known that there would only be a school, the Board perhaps would not have agreed to spend such a large sum of money on a building. A school would not require such a grand building. It is hoped that an institution, which is connected with the memory of His Majesty's visit to Patna, would receive from the Government a large measure of attention. It may not be out of place to remind Government that it has very recently abolished the Government Law Class at Patna, and has thus been relieved of a recurring charge entailed by the maintenance of a Law class. In these circumstances, the Government will, I fervently hope, invest a little more money in the Bihar School of Engineering.

"There is another first class College in Bihar, *i.e.*, the Bihar National College, which deserves special notice. It was founded by the late lamented the Hon'ble Babu Saligram Singh, and his brother the late Babu Bisseswar Singh; they were truly patriotic Biharees. The Institution was started with a view to give cheap high education to Bihar. It was not at all a mercenary business. It was never in want of accommodation or funds. But the new University Regulations made an uncommonly heavy demand upon its purse and put a strain upon its resources, consequently Government aid became a necessity. It has done much towards the imparting of cheap education to Biharees, and Bihar is indebted to the founders of the Institution. Bihar cannot be adequately thankful to Your Honour for the aid which has been granted to this Institution, and I hope the Government will not neglect this Institution if any further aid is needed.

"*Law and Justice.*—It is a well-known fact that some of the Criminal Courts in the Province hold their sittings till late hours in the evening. The causes are various: sometimes it is the pressure of business, sometimes it is a piece of indiscretion on the part of the presiding officer concerned; but I beg humbly to submit that these sittings cause a good deal of inconvenience to the litigants and their lawyers. There would be very little murmuring if it were settled that each of the Criminal Courts would hold its sittings at night. If the parties came prepared to be present at a night sitting, they would not feel the inconvenience much. But as matters stand, the whole thing rests on uncertainty, on the whims or the caprices or for the matter of that, on the common sense of the Officers concerned. If a Pleader or a Barrister, who goes to Court at 11 A.M., is made to work, without previous notice, till, say 9 P.M. or 10 P.M. at night, he cannot but feel very much inconvenienced. I frankly admit that there may be occasions on which late sittings may be necessitated by the circumstances. But the liberty given to the officer, of holding late sittings should, I submit, be hedged in by proper safeguards.

"It may here be noted that the Calcutta High Court has in its note to rule 1, Chapter 1, Part I, Volume I, of the General Rules and Circulars laid

[Babu Gajadhar Prasad.]

down the following for the guidance of the officers of the Civil Courts: 'The daily sittings of each Court shall ordinarily extend from 11 A.M. to 5 P.M. If the Government is of opinion that there is a greater pressure of business in the Criminal Courts than in the Civil Courts, or that the criminal business is generally more urgent than the civil, the Government, which is always the best protector of the public, can direct its officers ordinarily to hold their Courts from 11 A.M. to 5 P.M., and record their reasons whenever they are compelled, by pressure of business or by any other cause, to depart from the rule. These Officers may also be asked to give previous notice to the parties, whenever they deem it necessary to hold late sittings.

"I considered it my duty to draw the attention of Your Honour's Government to the subject only because I see that, if only a little remedial measure be taken by Your Honour's Government, a fruitful source of misunderstanding, a cause of friction between the Bench and the Bar, between, I may go so far as to say, the rulers and the ruled, will be done away with. I know there have been several cases in which such late sittings have caused much unpleasantness and have disturbed not a little the harmonious relationship existing between the officers of the Government and the parties concerned. As there is no such order of the Government to guide them, many officers, well-meaning, intelligent and courteous have to do their business in a way which runs counter to the wishes of the public and causes them serious inconvenience. If in order to avoid night sittings the Government has to incur any additional expense the Government should not I submit, hesitate to do it.

"*Provincial Rates.*—Famine, Plague and Cholera reign supreme in Bihar; and Sanitation cannot be neglected with impunity. In the first place, it is, I humbly think, necessary for the Government, as well as for the people, to devote some attention to the Sanitation of Villages. The villages are, generally speaking, in an insanitary condition. It is no doubt one of the duties of the District Boards and the Local Boards to look after the Sanitation of the Rural Areas. But there are two things necessary to the performance of that duty:—

- (i) Distinct and clear direction of the Government as to the proportion of the income of the Board which should be spent on Sanitation.
- (ii) Pecuniary aid from the Government to the District Boards for the purpose of carrying out Sanitary Schemes.

"The Sadar Local Board of Patna introduced, some time ago, a system of Village Sanitation. The system proved successful and was approved by the Government and noticed in its Resolution, reviewing the report on the Working of the District Boards of Bengal, 1900-1901, in the following terms: 'The Patna and Dinapore Local Boards inaugurated a regular system for cleansing villages and rural towns, which mainly consisted of the removal of filth and rank vegetation, the filling up of ditches, and works of a like nature. The example is one which other Local Boards would do well to follow, not only as a remedy when plague or other epidemics are rife, but as a help against their occurrence.' The Government desired the other Local Boards of the Province to follow the example thus set to them. But I find from experience, gained as the Chairman of the Patna Sadar Local Board, that the Sanitary Schemes cannot be properly completed and carried out for want of funds. The village population is as much entitled to the help and sympathy of the Government as the city population. If the District Boards, and the Local Boards that are under them, spent a fixed proportion of their revenues and if they received some substantial help from our benign Government, the fate of the village people would be appreciably bettered and their best interests considerably advanced.

"*Miscellaneous.*—I thank the Government for its allotment of Rs. 1,00,000 to Puri, of Rs. 77,000 to Gaya and of Rs. 75,000 to Monghyr, for their water-works. In this connection, I cannot help reminding the Government that some thing must be done for the Patna Water-works. When His Excellency, Lord Elgin, visited Patna, His Excellency remarked that Water-works and Drainage were twin sisters, and that where Drainage had been already constructed, Water-

[*Maharaj-Adhiraj Bahadur of Burdwan.*]

works must be had. If the pukka drainage had not been made, the kutchra drains would have absorbed all filthy matters; but pukka drains cannot so absorb them and the result is bad smell and the poisoning of the atmosphere; and thus Water-works have become more urgent on account of the existence of the pukka drains. When I asked a question in the Bengal Council meeting of the 8th February last on this subject, the Government was pleased to state:—

‘The charges for projects of local Water-supply should ordinarily be met from local resources. The Government cannot be expected to do more than make contribution from the general revenues to supplement local subscription.

‘The most recent estimate for a scheme of Water-supply for the City of Patna, made in the year 1900 by the Sanitary Engineer, amounted to about 20 lakhs of rupees, and the annual maintenance charges were estimated at Rs. 40,000. It is out of the question that the Government should make a grant of the whole cost. Moreover, the Lieutenant-Governor is advised that the Municipality is not in a position to meet even the maintenance charges of such a scheme.’

“I think the answer was given under a misapprehension, that Patna Water-works could not be had for less than Rs. 20 lakhs; but I have got a complete report on the subject jointly prepared by Mr. Ross, the then City Magistrate, and Mr. Cumming, the then Chairman of the Patna Municipality. It shows that the Water-works can be had at a much lower cost than Rs. 20 lakhs; there are several estimates, *viz.*, 20 lakhs, 15 lakhs, 13 lakhs, the lowest being Rs. 7,31,223. The question naturally arises, how can even this amount of 7 lakhs be raised? In answer to this, I humbly submit that in Bihar, rather in Patna Division, there are many wealthy and liberal Raj estates that could very easily subscribe at least one lakh each for the purpose of Water-works at Patna; but, except Darbhanga, all the big Raj estates, *i.e.*, Bettiah, Hatwa and Dumraon, besides other big estates like Nurhan, &c., are under the Court of Wards. I think the Court of Wards can fairly sanction a donation of Rs. 1,00,000 from each of the three Raj estates, and one lakh from the other comparatively minor estates under the Court of Wards. The Maharaja Bahadur of Darbhanga, who gave Rs. 50,000 to the Patna Municipality some time before the birth of the Maharaj Kumar, will, with his usual generosity, surely give us a large donation. We have already Rs. 1,00,000 at our disposal; the balance may easily be contributed by the Government.

“It would appear from the above that the proposal for the Water-works at Patna is not quite unreasonable, and the question need not be altogether brushed aside. Your Honour’s Government will always be gratefully remembered in connection with this boon.

“Your Honour’s Government has, I am glad to be able to say, done not a little for the sanitary improvements of the town of Patna, and I trust this will be the finishing touch. I hope the Hon’ble Mr. Greer, the late Commissioner of Patna, who knows Patna and Patna Division very well, will bear me out and support me in this matter. The proposal for the Water-works at Patna may be considered selfish by some critics; but it is not really so. Patna is the chief town of Bihar and is a seat of the Government. The Province and the Government are interested in its sanitary improvements; and I hope Your Honour’s Government will not fail to do as much as it is possible to do in this direction.”

The Hon’ble MAHARAJ-ADHIRAJ BAHADUR OF BURDWAN said:—“Your Honour—Though, unfortunately, owing to partial failure of crops in certain districts of Bengal as well as to the heavy expenditures, the Budget before us is not one with a big surplus, yet my hon’ble colleague, the Financial Secretary, is to be congratulated for the excellent way in which he has framed his Budget and has distributed the amounts to the heads under which there are pressing needs.

“I thank Your Honour for allotting a lac of rupees for housing the Officials at Burdwan. This has been a crying need, and I hope that, if a lakh be found insufficient, Your Honour’s Government will enhance the contribution, as proper residential quarters for Government Officials are essential everywhere, especially in places which are unfortunately not free from Malaria.

[Maharaj-Adhiraj Bahadur of Burdwan.]

"Talking of Malaria, Sir, I would have liked much to have expressed my opinion on the present wants of sanitation in the villages, not to speak of the drinking-water problem; but, as the Bengal Local Self-Government (Amendment) Bill is, I understand, now under the consideration of the Imperial Government, and as in it the necessary formations of Sanitary Boards have been introduced, I refrain from remarking until the Bill comes up for discussion in this Council."

"There is one point, Sir, on which I wish to draw your attention, and which has an immediate bearing on the Famine problem in the country, namely, the question of proper preservation of pasture-lands in Bengal. I am not aware, Sir, if there is any special enactment to protect these very necessary lands from being maltreated; but if there is no such protective measure it ought, in my humble opinion, to receive the attention of Government. There are many zemindars who take care of the pasture-lands and see that enough grazings for cattle exist in their zemindaries, but there are several, mostly petty zemindars, who show an extraordinary apathy towards this most important subject. I hope, Sir, that some necessary legislation towards the protection of such pasturage will be forthcoming before very long."

"Under no Lieutenant-Governor has Bengal received such encouragement and help in the way of hospitals, dispensaries and other medical and sanitary institutions as she has been lucky enough to get during Your Honour's régime, and for which we, the inhabitants of and settlers in Bengal, cannot be sufficiently thankful to you, Sir."

"Though no provision has been made in this Budget for helping us to go on with our scheme of the Central Hospital at Burdwan, I trust the year will be financially a good one, and that from the surplus Your Honour will be able to contribute something towards this much-needed hospital by a supplementary grant."

"I was much struck with the Zenana Private Patients' Wards that were not so very long ago opened by Her Excellency Lady Minto at the Lady Dufferin Hospital, and I hope, Sir, that the people of this Province will appreciate the kind thought that prompted you and Lady Fraser to start these Cottage Wards for the women of this Province, and that a time will soon come when the Government will be hampered with requests to build more such Cottage Wards and which, I am sure, with private munificence and the usual liberality of Government, will, when the needed time comes, enable them to build more such useful wards for *pardah* ladies."

"Encouraged by the kind interest that Your Honour takes in things medical, I venture to lay before you a proposal which, I hope, Sir, will receive the consideration that it may deserve at the hands of Your Honour's Government. Sir, as you are well aware the only Sanitarium that exists at present for the exclusive use of the Natives of Bengal is the Lowis Jubilee Sanitarium up at Darjeeling. This institution has served the purpose for which it was started, and during the *Puja* vacation and in the cold weather the place is often crowded with visitors and men in indifferent health who go up to the hills for a change."

"But, Sir, this institution is only resorted to by the well-to-do Bengalis and Indians. The poor middle class is still without a home or sanitarium in Bengal. It is this class, Sir, that needs such an institution badly; it is this class, Sir, that wants a good sanitarium and a healthy place with family quarters, where the not-over-well-to-do middle class folk could go to with their sickly wives and children to get a change and to get rid of the many diseases that they are susceptible to, owing to want of proper clothing, food and sanitation. This class is mostly made up of the clerical community who work as clerks in Government offices, railways, big mercantile firms and in the offices of private individuals, and among whom the majority cannot aspire to be *Burra Baboos*; but who, nevertheless, in many cases are sons of respectable middle class men and who, though they have to borrow in secret, for the sake of living, would rather die than live to be humiliated by their secret woes being made public. The scheme, I admit, is a costly one, but it is worth considering. Just let us for a moment imagine what a blessing it would be if we were able to alleviate the mental and physical sufferings of the

[Maharaj-Adhiraj Bahadur of Burdwan ; Rai Kishori Lal Goswami, Bahadur.]

members of this well-deserving class by being able to give them a sanitarium to go to, where at a moderate cost they could give themselves and their families the much needed change that they require. "The institution, if founded, should be run on such lines so as to make it possible for such men to be able to just afford to go and stay in such a place. The scheme wants working out, and if Your Honour's Government takes up the matter, I am ready to place my humble services at their disposal. Such an institution should be located in a place like the Pareshnath Hills, where I believe the zemindar of these hills intends leasing out lands for building sites, and, if this be so, the first help that the Government could give the scheme would be to procure a good large plot of land at a low rent and in a high and healthy locality for this proposed sanitarium. Failing this place, Ranchi or places like Simultala, Madhupur on the East Indian Railway line would, I should say, be equally suitable. This is a point which can only be decided, of course, if the scheme is taken up. If the Government favours this scheme and promises to contribute, if not a rupee for every rupee raised by public subscription, even eight annas for every such public rupee, I am willing to put my shoulders to the scheme, and, if the Government gives me the above assurance about its share of contribution, I am ready to contribute a lac of rupees, as my humble donation, towards this unselfish scheme for a truly charitable object.

"Sir, your *régime* is drawing to a close and though I am glad to think, God willing, we shall have you to rule over us for some months yet, yet this is the last Budget meeting that we shall have the pleasure of seeing you presiding over in this Council; and as this is the only opportunity I could have had to publicly express the gratitude of my humble self and the community that I belong to, I beg to say, Sir, that the kindness, the consideration and the sympathy that you have shown to us Noblemen of Bengal as a community, not to speak of your great friendliness towards us individually, is one that we can never forget; and I venture to assure Your Honour, on my own behalf as well as on behalf of many of my brother zemindars who have often spoken to me in most appreciative terms about Your Honour's kindness and unfailing courtesy, that we cannot be too grateful to you, Sir, and that we shall always look upon you as one who, as a ruler, tried to do what he thought best and kindest, and who, as a man, was a true and genuine friend to those that had the good fortune to gain his confidence and friendship."

The Hon'ble RAI KISHORI LAL GOSWAMI, BAHADUR, said:—"Before I address myself to the salient features of the current year's Financial Statement, I deem it my duty to make grateful acknowledgments to Your Honour for having permitted some of the non-official Members to informally discuss the draft Budget with the Secretaries in the various departments of Government, before it took the final shape in which it was submitted to the Government of India for sanction. Much larger facilities had been given to some of the non-official Members this year than in the year before, when Your Honour for the first time granted this privilege by way of experiment. Since the rules for the annual discussion of the Financial Statement restrict the right of the Members to merely expressing pious wishes, it is indeed gracious on Your Honour's part to seek the informal co-operation of the non-official Members in the final preparation of the Budget. I flatter myself with the hope that Your Honour has no reasons to be disappointed at the result; and that in future it will be an unwritten rule of this Council to ascertain and consider the views of all the non-official Members, when the Budget is in course of preparation. A Conference over the draft Budget is bound to be futile, so far as the non-official Members are concerned, unless advance copies of the draft budget are placed in the hands of the non-official members at least a couple of days before the meeting.

"The gradually waving closing balance since 1903-04 has, in the financial year just expired, reached the point quite close to the obligatory minimum. While on the one hand, this has operated as a serious handicap against the framing of a prosperous Budget in the year which has just set in; on the other hand the necessity to allot money for coping with the prevailing scarcity,

[*Rai Kishori Lal Goswami, Bahadur.*]

the Division of Orissa, the tract which of all parts of Bengal succumbs easily to the inroad of Famine, coupled with the charge for Grain Compensation Allowance—and what is that but famine relief expressed in less sensational vocabulary—has prevented the Hon'ble the Financial Secretary from making more liberal provisions for many useful purposes and projects which are required for a progressive administration. It is a matter for congratulation that in spite of the heavy demands on the Imperial Exchequer owing to the widespread famine in the United Provinces and in other tracts, the Government of India have made special assignments of a net total of Rs. 22,47,000.

“The forcible appeal which Your Honour made at the last Budget Meeting of the Imperial Council has, I hope, convinced the Government of India that the charges for Grain Compensation Allowance should be regarded as part of the famine charges, and as such should be provided out of the Imperial revenue. I take this opportunity of urging before Your Honour that the local bodies and the municipalities should be relieved of the burden of contributing any portion of the direct expenditure, to combat famine, which come under the head of ‘Famine Relief’; as also the indirect expenditure in the shape of Grain Compensation Allowance. In the revised Budget for local bodies, for the year 1907-08, the expenditure for Famine Relief has been estimated to be one lac and thirty-two thousand, and Rs. 24,000 has been put down as the famine-relief expense for the current year. The local bodies and the municipalities have been relieved of the payment of fees to Government for Banking and Audit. This has doubtless increased to a slight extent their capacity to spend more largely on Sanitation.

“*Fuller information required in the Financial Statement.*—I thank the Hon'ble the Financial Secretary for the lucid exposition of the budget which has helped us in a great measure to thread the maze of figures, which must be an inseparable feature of all budgets. But still, a fuller and more specific information is needed to explain for what specific purposes the grants for Civil Works in charge of the Civil Officers and of the Public Works Department and for the larger items under the several non-recurring charges, will be spent. The present Financial Statement, like those that have preceded it, omits to furnish any clue by which the non-official Members and the outside public can find out, to what extent, allotments made for useful public purposes in a year have not been wholly or partially utilized in the year; together with such explanations as would be deemed necessary, showing particularly how far the unexecuted portion of the works is covered by re-grants in the succeeding year. I venture to think that Your Honour will be pleased to consider the desirability of embodying this useful information in future Financial Statements. Public Works should be fairly representative of the principal heads of administration, such as Education, Police, Medical and Courts of Law. Out of the expenditure of fifty lacs fifty-four thousand rupees for principal works in progress, specially stated in the first part of the general review of the Budget Estimate of the year, the insignificant proportion of one lac and seventy thousand represents works on Educational buildings. I shall dwell on the expenditure on Education later on. A comparatively large proportion of expenditure represent works for the more convenient accommodation of police Force in Calcutta and Howrah.

“*Investment of the special grant of fifty lacs for the Calcutta Improvement Scheme.*—Since 1903-04, the year in which the Government of India made a special grant of fifty lacs of rupees for the Calcutta Improvement Scheme, which, as the Hon'ble the Financial Secretary said: ‘is of the nature of a trust and cannot be utilized for any other purpose,’ this large sum of money has been idly swelling the closing balances year after year. From replies evoked by the impatient queries in the Imperial Council at its last Budget Meeting, it seems to me to be certain that quite two years more must elapse before the scheme will be ripe for practical operation, or arrive at that stage when the actual expenditure of this money will be required. The public have grown weary of waiting, and I doubt not Your Honour will hear a good deal about it from my hon'ble friend, Babu Radha Churn Pal, who has an

[Rai Kishori Lal Goswami, Bahadur.]

which is keen in the non-permanently settled zone of this Province, I mean undoubted right to be heard on matters pertaining to Calcutta. I have been unable to guess why the practical advice of Mr. Bertram, as regards investment of surplus monies at the credit of Government, has not been followed in the case of this special grant. In the present year of stress, the Hon'ble the Financial Secretary will, I trust, be in a better mood to appreciate the wisdom of Mr. Bertram's counsels, who, as an object-lesson of prudent thrift, pointed to the swelling lacs derived from the investment of the Victoria Memorial Fund. I commend this to Your Honour's careful consideration.

*"Excise and Income-tax.*—The receipt side of the budget anticipates the normal growth of revenue under all heads, the prevailing scarcity notwithstanding. The progressive increases under Excise and Income-tax, specially in a year when we are under dark shadows of famine, are not complacently viewed by the public. Times out of number the progressive growths of these heads have been explained, and at times explained away. If the amount of Excise revenue is a true index of the degree of intemperance which prevails in a Province, then comparing our Excise revenue with that of Madras and Bombay as also of other Provinces, Bengal cannot certainly be found guilty of excessive insobriety. I venture to hope that the administration of the Excise Department will not lead to an adverse verdict.

*"Receipts under Registration.*—I am afraid, Sir, the Hon'ble the Financial Secretary has been too sanguine as regards receipts under 'Registration,' for he calculates a nominal increase over an abnormally high figure of the revised estimate which, as explained by him, was due to larger number of registrations on account of high price of food-grains. Coming to the expenditure side of the budget, I find that the Registration Department, after paying its expenses, earns a substantial profit. I, therefore, welcome the additional expenditure to strengthen the clerical staff of the Registration offices, which will ensure expedition in the works of that Department.

*"Large expenditure on the Re-organization of Police.*—Sir, I regret I cannot view, with unalloyed satisfaction, the large expenditure on the re-organization of the Police Department. It is simply natural that Your Honour, who presided over the Police Commission, should set about enthusiastically on the reformation of Police. The Government of India has made very liberal assignments for this purpose. The people are most anxious to see the Police reformed. The expenditure on this Department has been rising by leaps and bounds since 1902-03, but I regret to say that the improvement in the morale or in the dexterity in the detection of crime has not kept pace with the growth of expenditure. The Superintending and the Inspecting staff have been largely re-inforced, and so far the improvement has been quantitative; and I wish I could say that the improvement had been to an equal extent qualitative as well. To my humble apprehension, the real reform of the Police can be brought within the range of possibility, by the judicious operation of the scheme announced by the Hon'ble the Home Member of the Government of India of entirely separating the Judicial and Executive functions in the two Bengals. The fulfilment of a long-cherished and much-debated ideal, though tardy, will be welcomed most warmly. The bare outline of the scheme has been placed before the public, and I do not feel justified to take up the time of this Council at present by attempting a criticism on the details of the scheme.

*"Education.—Comparison with Madras and Bombay.*—The next question to which I wish to invite Your Honour's attention is, the inadequate provision made for the advancement of Education. After the powerful appeal made on behalf of Education by the representative of the Calcutta University, I do not feel called upon to dwell at length on that subject. I shall, however, address a few observations on Secondary and Primary Education. On the occasion of previous Budget debates, the expenditure on Education, in all its branches in European countries, had been exhibited to show in what backward condition our system of Education and Educational Institutions stand. To which the invariable reply has been that the disparity of conditions, financial and

[Rai Kishori Lal Goswami, Bahadur.]

otherwise, fails to furnish common basis for comparison. I shall steer clear of the furcoat logic and try to stimulate a healthy emulation, by comparing the state of Education in this Province with that of Bombay and Madras. Of Bombay and Madras, the latest official reports on Education I could get hold of were those of 1905-06. Of Bengal, I quote the figures from the latest Quinquennial Review of the Progress of Education, 1906-07. There is considerable difference in the population of the three Provinces. Speaking in round figures, the population of Bombay is 18½ millions; that of Madras is 38½ millions, and that of Bengal is 50½ millions, according to the Census of 1901. Bearing in mind this marked difference of population, I shall exhort Your Honour to consider the following tabular statements. A glance at these statements will show that Bengal stands at the bottom of the scale at a considerable distance from Bombay and Madras, and I may add from some other Provinces as well:—

## PRIMARY SCHOOLS.

Province and year.	Number of scholars.		TOTAL EXPENDITURE FROM—			
			Provincial Revenue and Local funds.	Private.	Fees.	
			Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	
Bombay, 1905-06	Male ..	504,863	Boys' schools	22,32,723	3,08,933	3,82,511
	Female	90,125	Girls' ..	2,90,793	30,079	1,71,785
Madras, "	Male ...	5,96,216	Boys' ..	11,21,892	4,96,818	5,94,790
	Female...	1,15,458	Girls' ..	1,67,482	1,52,692	13,406
Bengal, 1906-07	Male ...	9,54,027	Boys' ..	8,92,190	3,35,640	18,48,114
	Female .	73,350	Girls' ..	1,79,582	1,29,615	21,965

## SECONDARY SCHOOLS.

				Rs.	Rs.	Rs.
Bombay, 1905-06	Male ...	50,789	}	5,03,279	4,61,486	10,23,923
	Female...	6,028				
Madras, "	Male ...	91,706	}	5,20,106	5,68,362	13,76,719
	Female...	25,015				
Bengal, 1906-07	Male ...	1,50,275	}	8,43,059	7,46,445	17,61,298
	Female...	6,683				

"I think I can profitably quote one passage from the famous Resolution of 1904 of the Government of India, in which the Educational Policy in India has been fully discussed.

'On the general view of the question, the Government of India cannot avoid the conclusion that Primary Education has hitherto received insufficient attention and an inadequate share of public funds. They consider that it possesses a strong claim upon the sympathy, both of the Supreme Government and of the Local Governments, and *should be made a leading charge upon Provincial Revenues.*'

"The italics are mine. Sir, I shall ask you to consider how far Your Honour's Government has succeeded in making the expenditure on Primary Education 'a leading charge' upon the Provincial Revenue; and if the provision for Secondary Education has been at all adequate. In spite of the stress and strain caused by the inroads of famine and plague on Madras and Bombay, the public expenditure on Education in those Provinces has been on much more

[Rai Kishori Lal Goswami, Bahadur.]

liberal scale than what has been provided for Secondary and Primary Education in Bengal, which is comparatively free from the ravages of famine and plague.

"In the special statement of additional recurring charges under Education, it is to be regretfully noted that out of an additional recurring expenditure of two lacs and thirty-one thousand rupees, one lac and thirty-seven thousand is provided for increasing the inspecting staff and rupees fifty-five thousand for travelling allowance of additional officers, by whom I believe the members of the inspecting staff are referred to; and only rupees twenty five thousand has been provided for strengthening the Government Colleges. No provision has been made for training up a better class of teachers for the schools, and surely enough better teachers are wanted before inspection.

"I regret to find that the last year's grant for construction of Guru-training schools had not been utilized. There has been a pronounced tendency to strengthen the Inspecting Agency for Primary Schools, which, I have no doubt, will serve a useful purpose; but before that, and I should say in the very forefront, the proper training of gurus and teachers and the multiplication of schools should find place. Sir, there is not much indication visible of the development of the commercial and industrial sides of the Primary Schools, for all that the bulk of the people must rest content with is, that kind of education which will help them to provide themselves with practical livelihood. What is wanted for the vast rural areas and rural population are rural schools, imparting education which will make them thriving agriculturists and artisans.

"I am not unmindful of the fact that the Government of India is seriously considering the laudable but ambitious scheme of making Primary Education free. If the financial possibility of such a scheme is established, it will augur the brightest prospect for India. Sir, the Maharaja of Baroda has already shown the way. At the Industrial Conference at Calcutta in 1905 he said, with legitimate pride and satisfaction: 'The measure (free and compulsory education) was being worked with satisfactory results in one part of the State for a number of years. Emboldened by the success of this experiment, I have decided to make Primary Education compulsory throughout the State and absolutely free.'

"Technical Education moves forward wearily slow. For the last two years and-a-half, we have been hearing of the Central Weaving School in Serampore, to which the smaller schools in different parts of the Province will be co-ordinated. Beyond the acquisition of land for the purpose of the Central School, nothing more has been done. The provision of Rs. 35,000 for Technical Education by which, I presume, the recurring expenses of the Weaving School is to be met, is being repeated year after year to no purpose. In response to the newly-awakened interest in industrialism amongst the people of Bengal, this Province should have been studded with industrial schools to educate skilled labour for all our industries. As it has been decided to remove the Engineering College from Sibpur to Ranchi, it is absolutely necessary that a Technological Institute should be established in or near Calcutta, for teaching such subjects as dyeing, designing and calico-printing, which may be regarded as necessary auxiliaries to weaving and which should be taught in the Central Weaving School of Serampore; and tanning, glass blowing, ordinary and artistic carpentry, smithery, pottery, brass and bell-metal manufacture and bamboo-weaving.

"Sir, the Hon'ble the Financial Secretary has said that an aggregate provision of more than six lacs have been made for Technical Education, in all its branches. I wish he had vouchsafed further information to explain what kind of Technical Education is to be furthered with this money, and whether it is a new item of expenditure or the annual normal expenditure.

"*Agriculture.*—The main industry of this country, and particularly in Bengal, is Agriculture. Out of a population of about 50½ millions of souls in Bengal, the rural population amounts to quite 47½ millions. In recent years, both the Government of India and the Provincial Government have commenced to make strenuous efforts for the promotion of Agriculture, by the establishment of a

[*Rai Kishori Lal Goswami, Bahadur.*]

College in Pusa for the study of the science of agriculture, and for researches and experiments on scientific lines. A number of experimental and demonstration farms have been established, one of which is, I believe, financed by my hon'ble friend, the Maharaj Adhiraj Bahadur of Burdwan.

"This year's budget provides for the building and equipments of an Agricultural College at Sabour. The Agricultural Department of the Engineering College of Sibpur will be merged in the new College. A new department devoted to Agriculture has been opened. Most laudable efforts are being made to encourage the opening of Co-operative Credit Societies which, according to the latest reports, are growing financially as well as numerically. And, lastly, six Travelling Inspectors have been appointed for the six divisions. All these show useful activities for the advancement of agriculture. But has practical fruits been achieved? Is not the agency for the diffusion of expert information, amongst the agricultural class, hopelessly insufficient and defective? I shall remind Your Honour of the well-known aphorism as to the excellence of statesmanship which can make two blades of grass grow where one grew before. If the improvement in the old traditional method of husbandry can bring about a larger outturn of food-grains, which would represent even an average increase of grains of the value of four annas per acre of land actually cropped an immense credit of reserve will be built against all scarcities, and it will constitute the best Famine Insurance Fund. In Bengal, the number of acres under food-grains, in 1905-06, was 36,522,400 acres. At the rate of four annas per acre, the figure works up to quite 90 lacs of rupees. To what an enormous extent will this improve the resisting power of the rural population in times of scarcity? Sir, he will be the greatest benefactor of this country who will help to place the husbandry of this country on a footing of equality with the agricultural countries of Europe.

"*Travelling Agricultural Instructors.*—Sir, the Pusa Agricultural College are issuing Scientific Tracts and Journals, and the Agricultural Department are issuing agricultural blue books and vernacular leaflets. But how can the valuable information contained therein be accessible to the mass of agriculturists? Most of them are illiterate and reside far out in the Mufassal, where even the vernacular leaflets never reach. Besides, it is absolutely necessary that the practical way of carrying out the instructions and suggestions, contained in the reports and leaflets, should be shown to the agriculturist. I am loath to believe that it is seriously contemplated that six Inspectors, located in the six divisions of this Province, will do this. At least a reasonable start can be made by employing in each district a Travelling Instructor, who should have a demonstration farm of 20 to 30 bighas in some central part of the district. He should go about from village to village. Agricultural Societies should be formed, composing of men of the stamp of the members of Union Committees and Panchayets, who may conduct their business in their own vernacular, and the Travelling Inspector might be the President of these rural societies. The members of these societies, as also other intelligent agriculturists, might be asked to see the operations of the demonstration farm of the district. These Associations may be federated in District Agricultural Associations, and District Associations federated in Divisional Agricultural Associations. I think I am not too sanguine in thinking that it is quite possible to find out 34 trained men—men who have passed out of the Agricultural Department of the Engineering College or out of Agricultural Schools in other places, who could be located in each of our 34 districts. I believe the pay of the Travelling Inspector will not exceed Rs. 100 a month. The expenditure of Rs. 3,400 a month for Travelling Inspectors, for all the districts, will be money most usefully employed—a hundredfold more useful than frittering away money over Agricultural Associations, such as we have at present; which, without meaning the slightest disrespect, are more ornamental than useful. These Travelling Inspectors, I am sure, Sir, will prove very valuable levers of agricultural progress.

"In this connection, I shall even, at the risk of being prolix, draw Your Honour's attention to a portion of the report of the Recess Committee, on a

[Rai Kishori Lal Goswami, Bahadur.]

department of Agriculture and Industries for Ireland in 1896. On page 74 of the printed report, the Commissioners say: 'We may here explain a feature of it (Educational system) which has a more direct reference to the promotion of agriculture than it has to education and which, as shown by the evidence, has been found one of the most effective means of improving the methods of the Agricultural class on the Continent. We refer to the system of Travelling Instructors which Ireland herself was one of the first counties to adopt.' And again: 'The functions of these experts would be (a) to conduct conferences and courses of lectures for the farming classes in their district; (b) to act as consulting advisers to the farmers of their district in the direct management of their holdings; (c) to superintend and assist in the agricultural course at the Primary Schools and (d) to direct the cultivation of Example Plots.' Each Travelling Instructor should be allotted a district, the size of which 'would be determined after experience by the new department.' These are conclusions arrived at after the most careful inquiry, and which in their practical application have achieved wonderful results in Ireland. I earnestly beseech Your Honour to conduct the operations of the Agricultural Department in channels, which will be of immediate sound results and which will help the agriculturists to grow two blades of corn where one or none grew before.

"The State aid to agriculture should be on a greatly more liberal scale than what the budget under discussion discloses. Advancement of agriculture will do more for this country than all other economic schemes of amelioration put together. One more word on this subject and I am done. In my humble opinion, the Head of the Agricultural Department ought to be a permanent official, with expert knowledge of the highest kind, and at the same time possessing the talent for organization.

"*Inspector of Septic Tanks in Factories.*—I find Rs. 31,900 is allotted for Inspector of Factories. I am not quite sure what is the exact nature of his function. All that I can say, and I feel I have a right to say as one whose residence is in close quarters of factories, is that it is absolutely necessary that a special expert in the practical working of septic tanks should be appointed to inspect the septic tanks attached to the many factories on either side of the river, between Budge-Budge and Chinsura on the one side and Garden Reach and Naihati on the other. Septic tanks are liable to get out of order when the effluents, which pass into the water, are not far removed from decomposed human excreta. The strictest watch should be kept over the septic tanks for the safety, health and comfort of the vast population that inhabit the riparian municipalities.

"*Grants for Water-supply in Bengal and Madras compared.*—Sir, the Hon'ble the Financial Secretary has said that 'we have provided liberal grants-in-aid towards local drainage and water-supply.' I am most deeply interested in one of the several filtered-water schemes referred to by the Hon'ble the Financial Secretary when he presented the Budget before the Council, and I am deeply grateful to Your Honour's Government for the hope of liberal help which has been held out. 'Liberal' is a term which, like many other things, admits of degrees of comparison. Again, Sir, I shall ask your attention to what is now being done in Madras—the so-called benighted Presidency. In the March number of the *Indian Public Health*, on page 313, the Editor says as follows:—

'The Government of Madras has decided to make a free grant of rupees three and-a-half lacs towards the cost of the Coimbatore Water-supply Scheme, and have offered the Municipality a sum of two lacs on the special condition of repayment in thirty years, with interest at 4 per cent. per annum. The scheme is estimated to cost, roughly, rupees five and-a-half lacs.'

"Again, the February number of the same journal informs us that, in view of the inability of the Municipality of Berhampore in the Madras Presidency to meet the entire cost of Water-works, which has been estimated to cost Rs. 3,03,920, the Madras Government will be prepared to make a free grant from Provincial Fund towards the cost of the scheme not exceeding Rs. 1,52,000, and will be prepared to apply to the Government of India for sanction for lending the balance of Rs. 1,51,920 to the Municipal Council

[*Rai Kishori Lal Goswami, Bahadur ; Mr. Sutherland.*]

from the Provincial Loan and Advance Account, on the special condition of repayment in thirty years with interest at 4 per cent. per annum. I shall earnestly ask Your Honour to graduate the liberality of grants for Water-supply scheme on the Madras scale.

*"Special grant for Sanitation in Urban Areas and Water-supply in the Riparian Municipalities.*—We are grateful to the Government of India for providing a recurrent grant of four and-a-half lacs of rupees a year to Bengal, for to use the words of the Hon'ble the Finance Member of India: 'expenditure on the improvement of the public health, with special reference to the prevention of plague and the sanitary improvement of the sanitary condition of urban areas.' I shall respectfully ask Your Honour to consider if, with the aid of the special grant, it would not be possible to finance the comprehensive scheme, prepared some years ago, for the supply of filtered water to all the riparian Municipalities, containing a large number of factories and septic tanks. If the cost of the initial outlay for the pumps, engines, filters and main pipes are borne by Government, I venture to think that the Municipalities acting in co-operation will, by the imposition of a reasonable Water-tax, be able to pay for the cost of maintenance of the main Water-works; as also pay the cost of distribution pipes within their respective areas. Sir, if a tax on Jute, which will largely be derived from the many jute factories, whose existence within these riparian Municipalities is a source of discomfort to and a menace to the health of the permanent citizens residing in them, is going to be utilized for the improvement of Calcutta, I confidently hope that Your Honour will regard it as a reasonable claim of these municipalities to look for a large share of the special grant to enable them to supply filtered water to the residents, including the numerous workers in the factories within their respective jurisdiction. I trust this question will receive Your Honour's sympathetic consideration.

*"Landlords' fees.*—Sir, the next question I respectfully crave Your Honour's attention to is the difficulties which the landlords labour under in withdrawing the large accumulation of landlords' fees now lying in deposit in Government Treasury. I had been in communication on this subject with Mr. Slacke, whose genial presence we so much miss to-day and who, I hope, will come back to this Council with renewed health. It is in contemplation that in each district lists of the unclaimed deposits lying severally to the credit of the landlords should be prepared, and copies of which should be available to the persons interested. As the time within which the deposits could be withdrawn is limited by law, I would respectfully ask Your Honour to pass necessary orders which will facilitate the withdrawal of the hitherto unclaimed deposits by the landlords.

*"Public Works Cess.*—In conclusion, allow me to assure you that the whole Province must be grateful to Your Honour for representing to the Government of India to set right the obvious injustice of applying the Public Works Cess to other than local purposes. It would be some satisfaction to the landlords and tenants if the contribution levied from them, in the shape of Cesses, should be devoted to purposes in which they are immediately interested. It will afford great consolation to the large body of Zamindars, who are not yet reconciled to the ingenious theory which seeks to make out that the imposition of the Cesses does not militate against the basal principles of the Permanent Settlement. I trust that in the next year the localization of the Public Works Cess will be an accomplished fact."

The Hon'ble MR. SUTHERLAND said:—"It has been the fashion in this Council, when we have a Prosperity Budget and a fat surplus, to congratulate the Hon'ble the Financial Secretary thereon. I have often wondered—however desirable such a surplus—if this state of things is a truer indication of prosperous development in a Province, than a Budget with a lean surplus like that which we have before us to-day.

"So long as our revenues are maintained I hold we may congratulate the Government and ourselves on the heavy expenditure entailed by a policy of progress and development, such as the last few years have shown. Of course,

[*Mr. Sutherland.*]

we shall ever ask for more ; it is only human but so long as economy must for a time be the order of the day it is perhaps idle to make appeals for further expenditure.

"I take it in a Budget debate it is the duty of each non-official Member, according to his lights to suggest in what directions it may seem to him economies might be effected, and where money in the future could be well and profitably expended.

"Now, it is obviously easier and more pleasing for Hon'ble Members to trot out their pet schemes for improvements, than to show where money can be saved ; but I propose to refer, in passing, to one or two items of possible economy.

"In the first place, I would mention the proposed Agricultural College at Sabaur, and in this matter I should perhaps make some personal explanation. We often hear criticisms of such and such a project, from persons having no sympathy with the particular object in view. In conjunction with others, I was instrumental in starting the farm for agricultural improvements at Dulsing Serai, in Bihar, some nine years ago. The late Sir John Woodburn and Sir Edward Law came to see the work we had inaugurated, under the able guidance of Mr. Bernard Coventry ; and partly, perhaps, as a result of their visit, schemes were matured which finally developed into the great Institute at Pusa. Be this as it may, the site chosen for the Institute was a few miles away from our farm, and Mr. Bernard Coventry became its first Director.

"I am closely connected with agricultural undertakings, and have for years taken a deep interest in what science is doing to improve agricultural methods in India. I shall, therefore, I hope, not be misunderstood when I venture to question whether the expenditure, and recurring expenditure too, which the proposed College at Sabaur will entail, should be embarked on at once ?

"At one time, I believe, Dehra Dun was thought to be a suitable site for the Agricultural Institute for all India ; but wiser counsels prevailed and Pusa was selected, fortunately for Bengal.

"At Pusa, the Government Scientists are in the heart of a highly cultivated district, with so intelligent and go a-head a body of men as the present Bihar Planters, scattered for miles around. In fact, the best possible medium, in the shape of the Planters, is to hand for the proper dissemination of scientific knowledge in a practical form to the raiyats, who after all, I venture to think, are the only people to whom it is worth teaching improved methods of agriculture.

"I doubt if at this stage a college to teach educated Indians the science of agriculture is really very practical, unless it is certain that the students will be drawn solely from the zamindar class ; and even so, my experience, as far as it goes, is that the educated Indian in Bengal is often less interested in scientific agriculture than the European in India.

"With all deference, therefore, I cannot help thinking, Sir, that it is possible we are going or trying to go, just a little too fast.

"In view of the personal explanation which I have made, I hope that I shall not be misunderstood when I say that although in theory the Sabaur project may be attractive, no harm would be done by allowing it to remain in abeyance for the present. We have already this splendid Institute at Pusa, with its unique advantages of position and with its large staff of scientific experts : and might we not wait a little and watch the results of its operation before embarking on this other scheme ?

"I should like to say, with regard to the remarks which fell from the Hon'ble Babu Gajadhar Prasad, I certainly hope the Government have no intentions of creating an Industrial College in Bihar. In my humble opinion, the College at Ranchi should be ample to meet the present wants of the Province.

"There is another direction in which I think some money might well be saved or, rather, made for a particular object. I refer to the grant of Rs. 50,00,000 for the Calcutta Improvement Scheme. We may apparently

[*Mr. Sutherland.*]

now rejoice that, like her other coy and backward sister the, Sara Bridge, the Calcutta Improvement Scheme is at last to see the light of day. I also ask, as the Hon'ble Mr. Larmour and others have done before me, why the 50 lakhs which is ear-marked for a specific purpose should not bear interest in the meantime?

"Surely, it should be a simple matter to place this money on fixed deposit with a Bank? I am quite aware that Government balances in the ordinary course cannot be so treated, but as I said this money is ear-marked and a thing apart from the ordinary balances of Government.

"Your Honour is so fully alive to the pressing need of opening up this vast and congested city, that it would be a mere waste of valuable time to dwell on this aspect of the subject; but I hope I shall be pardoned if I again draw attention to a matter I raised in this Council Chamber seven years ago, which is closely allied to any Calcutta Improvement Scheme. I then said:—

'The expansion of this city on sanitary lines is one of the problems which must be faced sooner or later, and, in my opinion, it is our business to look ahead and grapple with the problem sooner rather than later. Calcutta at present is like a person with only one lung, namely, the maidan, and we shall, I think, be conducing to her welfare and longevity if we provide her in accordance with Nature's precedent with a second lung, in the shape of a maidan towards Tollyganj. This can to-day be done comparatively cheaply by acquiring the land, which is at present available; while, if we delay, the natural expansion of the town may encroach on this free space to such an extent that the successful execution of such a scheme would entail an enormously greater financial outlay.'

"To this my friend Mr. Baker, the then Financial Secretary to the Government of Bengal, replied that he entirely agreed with me, the more so as if my scheme were taken up at once it would be comparatively inexpensive, and for that reason he smilingly referred me to the Corporation as the proper body to do it

"Now, Sir, I hold to day, as I held seven years ago, that Calcutta, a the capital of the Indian Empire, has a claim for help not only from the Province but from India as a whole, and indeed this is now admitted. If conditions, such as prevail in England, existed here some wealthy citizen might come forward and give the city a park on its southern side (the direction in which the town is inevitably extending), but we, Europeans in India, both official and non-official, cannot alas, be described as wealthy, and failing some Indian nobleman or gentleman wishing to place the City of Palaces under an everlasting debt of gratitude and thereby perpetuating his memory for all time, we perforce look to Government, in the interests of posterity, to provide the second city of the British Empire with a second lung, ere it is too late. The urgency for action, before the opportunity slips by, is my only excuse for re-interating this appeal.

"My predecessor, Mr. Bertram, asked for increased and better means of communication in the shape of roads in the mufassal. I should like to endorse what he said. Sometimes, when on a long dāk up-country I wish that Bengal enjoyed the splendid roads of Ceylon.

"No doubt in Lower Bengal, suitable road material is a difficulty and the wheels of the bullock cart are destructive; but it seems to me a reproach to the countrymen of General Wade and the late Mr. Macadam that after all these years our existing roads for the most part are so indifferent, while more new feeder roads to fresh lines of railway are not made.

"I began by saying I thought we should congratulate the Government on its expenditure of late years.

"I remember, Sir, in the days of a falling rupee, how little it was then possible for Government to do? From some of the criticisms that have fallen from Hon'ble Members and from what one occasionally reads in a section of the Press, one would almost suppose that the Government of Bengal was hardly capable of any good action for the public welfare. By all means criticise, but let us non-officials be fair. What are the facts?

"Large sums of money have in the last few years been spent on public works of great usefulness, more especially on the hospitals of Calcutta, which "

[Mr. Sutherland ; Babu Kali Pada Ghosh.]

are a living testimony to the benevolent rule we enjoy. Agriculture, improvements of waterways and fisheries of this Province have not been neglected; while grants have been given to help menials and men on low salaries, to cope with the present high prices of food-stuffs. But, beyond all this, liberal grants have been made for education, sanitary improvements and for the Police.

"Now with regard to the Police, I should like to emphatically disassociate myself from the comments one hears in some quarters where we are told that a great deal too much money is being expended on the Police. I do not imagine the Police in India are perfect. Who does? But every thoughtful man, if he is acquainted with existing conditions in the mufassal, must know that the police force and the village chaukidars are almost the only machinery we have as a medium between the Government and the people. Surely it is of paramount importance to do what may be possible to improve that machinery. I do not suggest that an increase of a few rupees pay will necessarily make a dishonest man honest; but a great and much-needed reform has begun, and I say we have no right to cry out because it costs money.

"In conclusion, Sir, while the financial horizon may be dimmed by a passing cloud, I desire to offer my congratulations to Your Honour's Government on the immense progress and development of this rich Province during the past few years."

The Hon'ble BABU KALI PADA GHOSH said:—Sir,—On the occasion, of last year's Budget debate, we invited Your Honour's attention to the desirability of making the Financial Statement more lucid and comprehensible than it has hitherto been, so that its perusal may enable an ordinary reader to find out how far the projects of reform, provided in the preceding year's budget, have been carried out; and, if for any cause their progress has been arrested, the cause which led to such arrest, and also such other details as will make the position of the Government intelligible to the public. Your Honour was also pleased to observe that, in regard to future budgets, it would be a very good thing if the Head of each of the principal Departments would draw up, in time for the budget discussion, a brief statement showing its actual expenditure and the work that it has done during the past year and also what he proposes to do during the coming year. But we are disappointed to find, that the Financial Statement placed before us follows, like its predecessors, the same mystic outline in matters of detail, and one will in vain tax one's brain to find out from it whether all or any of the works, shown in the last year's statement as 'Civil Works in charge of Public Works Department' or 'Civil Works in charge of Civil Officers', have been carried out or even taken up. For instance, Rs. 75,000 was allotted in the budget of 1906-1907 for drainage in Puri Municipality, and a similar sum was provided in last year's budget and in the present budget; also Rs. 1,00,000 has been provided for sanitary improvement and water-supply in Puri Municipality. There is nothing in the budget to indicate whether the same provision is being carried over from year to year or the present year's allotment is a supplementary grant. May we hope that the Hon'ble the Financial Secretary or the Secretary of the Department concerned will favour us with a statement showing how far the works, provided in the last year's budget, have been carried out and, if any of them have been abandoned, the cause which led to such abandonment.

"Looking into the detailed remarks on the current year's budget, we find, that the receipts under the heads 'Stamps', 'Excise', 'Assessed Taxes' and 'Registration' show a steady increase, and that the actuals of the first ten or eleven months of last year have largely exceeded those of the corresponding period of the preceding year. If this had been due purely to what is called 'Normal Expansion' or 'Progressive Increase', it would certainly be regarded as a matter for congratulation, as the increase of revenue means ordinarily the increase of prosperity in the country. But, when we bear in mind that the cause of this increase is attributable to abnormal circumstances, such as the increase of registration fees being due to the increased number of registrations on account of high price of food-grains, we are led to associate such increase with dismal surroundings.

[Babu Kali Pada Ghosh.]

" *Excise.*—As regards Excise, we are assured that the Government deprecates an expansion of the Revenue, which is the direct result of increased consumption, and that the Excise policy of the Government has never been influenced by Revenue considerations. We are thankful to the Government for advocating such a noble and humane policy. But, at the same time, we find that year after year the Excise revenue is increasing by leaps and bounds, and we are told that such increase is manifesting itself in spite of all checks that the Government is putting on the growth of drunkenness in the country. The inference we are invited to draw is, that it is due to a sudden influx of wealth among the low class people addicted to drink. But, when we find that the outstills, at least a large number of them, are even in the present day located on tempting sites, and that in spite of our having cried hoarse over the question of their removal from such sites, the Government did not think it proper to do so, we become rather sceptical in our belief as to how far the Government policy, based on non-revenue considerations, has hitherto been given effect to. The history of past years shows a lamentable disregard of the avowed policy of the Government. But we must gratefully acknowledge the attempts recently made in the direction of abolishing the outstills and extending the Distillery System in accordance with the recommendation of the Excise Committee. But, if the carrying out of the reform recommended by the Excise Committee takes time, which it is bound to take, the Government, to be consistent with its policy, should take steps for the removal of the outstills from their existing sites which are admittedly objectionable.

" Last year, I drew the attention of the Government to the evils arising from excessive growth of drunkenness in Chota Nagpur, and I am thankful that, in the district of Manbhum, the Distillery System has already been introduced, and that in other districts in the Division, the same system, as I am told, will be gradually introduced; but may I ask whether, pending final abolition, any of the outstills in the Division have been removed from their present objectionable sites? To offer temptations to the low class people to drink, by placing the liquor-shops on the roads and places frequented by them, is a policy which cannot be too strongly deprecated, and the sooner this blot in the Excise Administration of the Province is removed, the better.

" *Dearness of Food-grains.*—On the expenditure side of the budget, the first and foremost item that calls for attention is the provision made for compensation for dearness of food-grains. Last year when we discussed the budget, we consoled ourselves with the hope that with a favourable monsoon and favourable harvest the strain, caused by dearness of food-grains, will disappear in the near future. We find, however, that our expectations have not only been not realised, but that we are in a worse situation than before. It would hardly serve any useful purpose to trace the causes which have brought about this chronic dearness of food-grains, but it may not be out of place to mention here that the extensive encroachment which jute cultivation is making on paddy-lands, even in such districts where it was formerly either unknown or at any rate very rare, is affecting in some measure the out-turn of paddy. Moreover, the steeping of jute-plants, in tanks and other water-reservoirs, is also increasing the insanitary condition of the locality. This evil is increasing, and, unless some remedy is devised to remove or at least to lessen it, the paddy-lands of some of the important districts in West Bengal will in no distant date be converted into lands for jute crops and malaria; and other diseases, which are already rampant in rural areas, will make greater havoc. The question is deserving of attention at the hands of the Government, and the District Officers should be impressed with its seriousness so that they may, in consultation with the local bodies, try to devise means to check this growing evil.

" We are immensely thankful to Your Honour's Government for the provision made in the budget for Grain Compensation Allowance to all menials and ministerial officers, drawing pay of Rs. 30 and less *per mensem*. In the present situation, no money can be spent on a more useful object, and it is gratifying to find that the noble example initiated by the Government has been

[Babu Kali Pada Ghosh.]

followed in many other offices and departments, which are not under the Government. But we had expected that the relief in this direction would reach this year to a larger number of officers and that the standard would be raised from Rs. 30 to Rs. 50, if possible. We are rather disappointed to find that the provision made this year, *vis.*, Rs. 8,50,000, is lower than in the preceding year which was Rs. 9,50,000. The high prices of grains, which have been prevailing for some years past, have more seriously affected the position of the middle class people of the country, who are dependent on small fixed salaries, than even the poorer classes, who have no social position to maintain; and the Government will be entitled to the unspeakable blessings of our countrymen, if it can alleviate to some extent the distress of those *Bhadralogs* of the country, whose birth and social position make it impossible for them to seek public charity. In making this prayer, we are thoroughly alive to the responsibility which we cast upon the Government; but we may be permitted to mention that the country can very well afford to put up with the curtailment of the too liberal provision which has been made under other heads, such as Police, and even under such heads as inspection charges on Education; and the scheme for housing of Officials and purchase of Duff's College for the Calcutta Police, which is estimated at two lacs, can very well be deferred, as they are not of such an urgent character as affording relief to the poor officers of the Government, who find it really difficult to have two meals a day. We earnestly pray that Your Honour may be pleased to take our prayer into due consideration.

*"Scheme for Improvement of Salaries of Ministerial Officers.*—This question, of affording relief to the low salaried ministerial officers, makes us inquisitive about the fate of the scheme known as 'Improvement of Salaries of Ministerial Officers,' which has been in contemplation for some years past and for which the provision made in the budget is being carried over from year to year. On several occasions, questions were asked in the Council as to when the scheme would be finally given effect to, and the reply we have invariably received is, that the scheme is under consideration. If the relief which the scheme proposes to afford to these poorly paid officers had reached them in this time of famine and scarcity, it would have been greatly appreciated and gratefully acknowledged. May we ask when this long-deferred scheme will be carried out?

*"Sanitation.*—The ill-fated question of Sanitation in rural areas has scarcely made any appreciable advance in spite of our repeated appeals to the Government on this subject. The reply we have hitherto received is, that the Government is prepared to help the people if the people will help themselves. We are bound to say that such a reply is not commensurate with the heavy responsibility which lies on the Government on a question of life and death. Certainly the people should co-operate with the Government, otherwise no permanent good can result; but it is for the Government to lead the way and to initiate a definite and workable scheme. We were told last year, that the Government may be able to conduct here and there experiments, on approved lines, as an inducement to the people to take the matter up for themselves. May we know how many experiments were made in rural areas during the year which has just closed? In view of the supreme importance of the matter, the duty of the Government should go further than merely making a fixed contribution to the District Board and telling the people to seek their remedy from that body. We may be permitted to suggest that a grant out of the Provincial Fund should be ear-marked for this purpose; the District Officers should be asked to take the matter up in right earnest, and if necessary to form a Special Committee consisting of local men to appeal to the public for subscriptions; and, if the people find that the District Officer is taking a keen interest in the matter, they will readily join hands with him to carry out the reform, and the scheme is bound to be fruitful of results. It is feared that, in many parts of the country, to suggest that jungle should be cut down round the villagers' houses, would cause a rising of the population. But we need have no fears on this point, as the cutting down of jungles or trees