

HEADS.	ACTUALS.			1912-13.		1913-14.	REMARKS.
	1909-10.	1910-11.	1911-12.	Sanctioned estimate.	Revised estimate.	Budget estimate.	
1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8
	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	
Reserve Medical Officers and Subordinates			19,190	6,500	8,000	15,000	
Bonus ... ..			1,660	.....	.....	...	
Total	5,02,000	4,95,000	5,25,129	5,11,500	5,32,000	5,34,000	The actuals of 1911-12 include supervision charges in Eastern Bengal.
Hospitals and Dispensaries—							
Presidency Hospitals and Dispensaries—							
Medical College Hospital ... ..			3,34,259	3,42,000	3,46,000	3,29,000	Revised includes larger expenditure on stores.
General Hospital ... ..			2,44,773	2,47,000	2,51,000	2,50,000	
Campbell Hospital ... ..			1,24,401	1,25,000	1,25,000	1,35,000	Budget includes Rs. 5,280 for additional nurses.
Albert Victor Asylum for Lepers ... ..			33,278	35,000	36,000	37,000	
Mufassal Hospitals and Dispensaries ... ..			69,290	87,000	85,000	84,000	
Grants to Hospitals and Dispensaries ... ..			2,34,456	1,22,600	1,80,000	1,18,000	
Medical charges in connection with the Inland Labour Transport Fund ... ..			1,733	2,200	1,000	1,500	
Bonus ... ..			5,223	.. ..	.....	.....	
Total	8,57,000	9,80,000	10,47,413	9,60,800	10,24,000	9,54,500	
Sanitation and Vaccination ... ..	3,19,000	3,35,000	4,31,025	4,39,200	3,81,000	5,08,000	The actuals of 1911-12 include charges for the Sanitary Commissioner of Eastern Bengal. The decrease in the revised is for smaller purchase of quinine. Budget includes Rs. 22,000 for three additional Deputy Sanitary Commissioners, Rs. 26,000 for contribution to Municipalities for Health officers, Rs. 50,000 for experiments on jungle clearing and Rs. 6,000 for training of Sanitary Inspectors.
Grants for medical purposes—							
Expenses during the prevalence of plague ... ..			13,323	4,350	15,000	4,350	
Contribution to Lady Minto's Nursing Association ... ..			3,554	3,000	... ..	.....	
Expenses during the prevalence of epidemics ... ..			3,352	10,600	4,000	4,000	

Value of Medical Stores supplied to charitable institutions ... ..			795	250	1,000	1,000	
Bonus ... ..			25	.....		...	...
For rounding ... ..			.. ...	.....		...	—350
Total grants for medical purposes ... ..	37,000	27,000	21,049	18,200	20,000	9,600	
Medical Schools and Colleges—							
Medical Colleges ... ..			2,49,881	2,90,000	2,89,000	3,33,000	Budget includes larger provision for teaching allowance, new appointments of Professors and for serological work.
Medical Schools ... ..			1,03,900	1,10,500	1,09,000	1,23,000	Budget includes provision for additional teachers and Demonstrators and for increase of salaries of teachers already employed owing to revision of pay of Assistant Surgeons.
Bonus ... ..			695	...	.....	...	
Total ... ..	3,75,000	3,68,000	3,54,476	4,00,500	3,98,000	4,56,000	
Lunatic Asylums ... ..	1,54,900	1,57,000	1,60,878	1,61,500	1,65,000	1,72,000	
Special Hospitals ... ..	11,000	10,000	10,040	10,000	10,000	11,000	
Chemical Examiner ... ..	48,000	52,000	59,185	54,000	55,000	67,000	Budget includes provision for the appointment of a probationary Chemical Examiner.
Refunds ... ..	7,000	13,000	14,748	14,300	13,000	14,500	
Lump grant for non-recurring expenditure on sanitation ... ..	.....	.....	.....	7,25,000	1,00,000	.....	The decrease in the revised is for the transfer of the 6½ lakhs to Civil works in charge of Civil officers and partly to the Public Works and other Departments.
Ditto ditto ditto ... ..	...	...	...	.....	...	6,75,000	
Ditto for recurring grant ... ..	...	...	...	.....	...	5,00,000	
Grant for medical relief ... ..	...	...	...	...	...	1,09,000	
Lump grant for School of Tropical Medicine ... ..	...	...	...	4,00,000	.....	1,00,000	The budget grant of four lakhs has been transferred to the Public Works Department for land acquisition. The balance of the Imperial grant (one lakh) has been entered in the budget.
GRAND TOTAL ... ..	23,10,000	24,37,000	26,14,743	36,95,000	26,88,000	41,01,000	

## 25.—Political—

Political Agents ... ..	.....	10,000	14,648	14,000	12,000	14,000	The decrease in the revised is due to the absence of the Political Officer (Hill Tippera) on leave.
Entertainment of Envoys and Chiefs ... ..	.....	1,000	...	10	.....	...	
Darbar presents and allowances to Vakils, etc. ... ..	11,000	17,000	7,872	18,700	19,500	10,600	The decrease is due to smaller provision for Presidency payments on account of <i>khillats</i> .
Miscellaneous ... ..	.....	3,000	102	1,290	1,500	1,600	
Total ... ..	11,000	31,000	22,622	34,000	33,000	27,000	



HEADS.	ACTUALS.			1912-13.		1913-14.	REMARKS.
	1909-10.	1910-11.	1911-12	Sanctioned estimate.	Revised estimate.	Budget estimate.	
1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8
	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	
Veterinary and stallion charges ...	1,76,000	2,06,000	2,02,035	2,01,500	1,91,000	1,89,000	The decrease in the revised is for lapses in contingencies and to delay in provincialization of District Board Veterinary Assistants.
Donations to Scientific Societies ...	12,000	14,000	14,950	11,600	12,000	11,600	
Agriculture ...	3,76,000	3,95,000	4,03,479	3,66,400	3,45,000	4,84,000	The actuals of 1911-12 included supervision charges of the Eastern Bengal districts. The decrease in the revised is for non-utilization of the full provision for new farms. The increase in the budget is chiefly for extension of sericulture.
Provincial Museum ...	2,000	1,000	.....	1,000	.. ..	1,000	
Cinchona plantations ...	2,59,000	4,02,000	3,85,751	5,82,000	6,64,000	2,54,200	The increase in the revised is for larger purchase of cinchona bark.
Public exhibitions and fairs ...	.....	1,000	379	4,600	1,000	...	
Botanical and other public gardens ...	1,85,000	1,89,000	1,74,598	1,92,000	1,74,000	2,06,000	Budget includes provision of Rs. 10,000 for additional grant to Zoological garden.
Emigration ...	22,000	22,000	19,454	23,000	23,000	23,000	
Inspector of Factories ...	45,000	52,000	65,022	70,800	63,000	72,000	The decrease in the revised is for absence of officers on leave.
Census ...	2,000	2,000	1,634	1,600	2,000	2,000	
Gazetteer and Statistical Memoirs ...	28,000	1,000	3,135	18,000	4,000	14,000	.
Registration of railway traffic ...	11,000	12,700	11,167	12,600	12,000	8,000	
Ditto of river-borne traffic ...	4,000	6,000	10,412	11,900	2,500	3,600	The budget for 1912-13 included certain special charges of the Eastern Bengal districts which were not required.

Revised Financial Statement, 1913-14.

[13TH MARCH.

Provincial statistics	...	...	30,000	20,000	25,216	26,000	30,000	26,400	
Preservation and translation of ancient manuscripts	...	...	9,000	7,000	5,850	9,300	9,000	9,000	
Examinations	...	...	1,000	1,000	441	400	500	500	
Inspector of Mines	...	...	.....	...	265	300	300	300	
Bacteriology	...	...	10,000	10,000	10,272	11,300	12,000	11,500	
Registrar of Co-operative Credit Societies	...	...	43,000	57,000	80,391	56,000	63,000	73,000	The actuals of 1911-12 included the Eastern Bengal charges. Revised includes charges for repairs of the steam-launch. Budget includes additional establishment and the cost of the upkeep of the steam-launch recently placed at the disposal of the Registrar.
Inland Labour Transport Fund	...	...	26,000	29,000	29,030	26,800	23,000	22,000	
Miscellaneous (Smoke Nuisance and Fishery charges)	...	...	18,000	33,000	37,331	60,000	45,000	1,23,000	The decrease in the revised is for smaller charges of the Fishery Department. Budget includes Rs. 98,000 for Fishery (including Rs. 45,000 for the provision of a steam-launch), and Rs. 25,000 for Smoke Nuisance.
Imperial Institute	...	...	.....	...	8	100	.....	...	
Refunds	...	...	.....	2,000	108	700	700	500	
Lump provision for agriculture and allied objects	...	...	...	.....	...	75,000	40,000	30,000	Rupees 30,000 was transferred to Forest and Rs. 40,000 will be spent in 1912-13 on land acquisition and other charges in connection with the Rangpur Dairy Farm. The balance Rs. 30,000 has been provided for in the budget for 1913-14.
Ditto ditto	...	...	.....	...	.....	.....	...	1,50,000	This have been added by the Government of India.
Lump deduction as probable savings	...	...	...	.....	.....	-50,000	...	.....	
Total	...	...	12,62,000	14,61,000	14,80,938	17,13,000	17,40,000	17,15,000	

29.—*Superannuation*—

HEADS.	ACTUALS.			1912-13.		1913-14	REMARKS.
	1909-10.	1910-11	1911-12	Sanctioned estimate.	Revised estimate.	Budget estimate.	
1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8
	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	
Governated Civil Service pension ...	...	...	43,750	43,000	44,000	44,000	Provision has been made for the normal growth of expenditure. Budget based on actuals.
Superannuation and Retired allowances ...	24,71,000	25,78,000	27,13,887	27,75,000	28,34,000	29,50,000	
Compassionate allowances ...	9,000	10,000	2,683	7,900	3,000	5,000	
Gratuities ...	8,000	25,000	16,380	9,500	13,000	14,000	
Ports and Pilotage pensions ...	10,000	9,000	8,603	10,000	8,500	8,500	
Refunds ...	.....	..	334	600	500	500	
Total	24,96,000	26,22,000	27,85,637	28,46,000	29,03,000	30,32,000	Revised based on the actuals of the first nine months.

30.—*Stationery and Printing*—

Forms Department at the Presidency ...	55,000	50,000	53,391	54,000	63,000	59,000	Budget includes Rs. 5,000 for revision of establishment.
Stationery purchased in the country ...	23,000	26,000	24,869	29,000	25,000	25,000	
Government Presses ...	7,34,000	6,44,000	6,74,169	6,26,000	6,94,000	6,24,000	
Printing at Private Presses ..	18,000	4,000	5,129	5,000	4,000	4,000	
Stationery supplied from Central Stores ...	9,73,000	9,30,000	8,19,035	6,46,000	6,46,000	6,46,000	
Refunds ...	1,000	...	2,428	1,000	2,000	2,000	
Lump deduction ...	.....	.....	..	- 1,06,000	.....	..	
Total	18,04,000	16,54,000	15,79,021	12,55,000	14,24,000	13,80,000	The increase in the revised is due to non-realization of probable savings in budget for 1912-13 which was relied upon to provide for the Dacca Jail Press

32.—*Miscellaneous*—

Miscellaneous charges for the treatment of patients of the Pasteur Institute ..	.....	1,000	1,492	1,400	2,000	1,600	
Travelling allowances to officers attending examinations ... ..	7,000	4,000	3,774	3,300	6,000	3,600	
Reward for proficiency in Oriental languages, and allowance to the Language Examination Committee ..	4,000	8,000	7,200	3,000	5,000	9,000	
Cost of books and publications ... ..	*1,000	16,000	47,503	700	3,000	3,000	The actuals 1910-11 and 1911-12 included payment to the <i>Sulabh Samachar</i> and the revised represents payments to <i>Biswa Barta</i> of Dacca. Budget includes provision for the purchase of <i>Near East</i> .
Donations for charitable purposes ...	1,31,000	1,57,000	1,83,618	1,59,800	1,60,000	1,60,000	
Charges on account of European vagrants ..	8,000	5,000	4,603	7,000	9,000	7,000	
Rewards for destruction of wild animals ...	10,000	9,000	18,503	7,200	15,000	14,000	Budget based on actuals.
Petty establishments ..	35,000	48,000	50,291	47,700	49,000	43,500	
Special Commissions of Enquiry ...	1,28,000	40,000	484	20,000	60,000	19,000	Revised includes Rs. 44,000 for Dacca University Committee, Rs. 16,000 on account of Public Service Commission. Budget includes Rs. 4,000 for Dacca University and Rs. 15,000 for other unforeseen charges.
Irrecoverable temporary loans written off ...	9,000	7,000	4	4,300	.. ..	1,000	
Rent, rates and taxes ... ..	38,000	38,000	54,106	53,400	54,000	54,000	
Contributions ... ..	2,37,000	2,33,000	1,75,287	2,31,300	24,000	4,000	The provision of Rs. 2,07,000 made in the budget for 1912-13 for equilibrium grants to District Boards for education in the Eastern Bengal Districts has been transferred to the head Education. The decrease in the budget is for exclusion of grants to Municipalities in Eastern Bengal from this head.
Miscellaneous and unforeseen charges ...	7,000	3,000	7,245	2,69,400	8,000	2,62,000	The decrease in the revised is for adjustment to the proper heads of account, the grants made by His Excellency out his petty grants allotment and reserve for unforeseen requirements. Budget includes 1 lakh for His Excellency's petty grants, Rs. 1,50,000 as general reserve for unforeseen requirements and Rs. 4,000 for King's portraits and Rs. 8,000 for other charges.
Miscellaneous refunds ... ..	1,000	8,000	8,261	4,100	8,000	8,500	
Extraordinary items ... ..	.....	.....	.....	300	.....	.....	
Annual stipend to holders of literary titles ...	.....	.....	.....	.....	4,000	3,000	Represents pensions of Mohamohopadhayas and Shamsul Ulamas granted as a Royal boon at the Coronation Durbar of 1911.
Lump provision for grain compensation allowance for all departments ...	.....	.....	.....	.....	1,50,000	3,60,000	
For rounding ... ..	.....	.....	.....	+100	.....	.....	
<b>Total</b> ...	<b>6,16,000</b>	<b>6,77,000</b>	<b>6,60,371</b>	<b>8,13,000</b>	<b>5,57,000</b>	<b>9,53,000</b>	Revised based on the actuals of the first nine months.

1913.]

Revised Financial Statement, 1913-14.

## 48.—Irrigation—Major Works (Working Expenses)—

HEADS	ACTUALS.			1912-13.		1913-14.	REMARKS.
	1909-10.	1910-11.	1911-12.	Sanctioned estimate.	Revised estimate.	Budget estimate	
1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8
	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	
Productive Works—							
Midnapore Canal ... ..			2,43,964	1,92,500	2,41,500	1,87,000	The increase in the revised is due to larger expenditure on silt clearance and repairs to lock gates in the Midnapore Canal.
Hijili Tidal Canals ... ..			33,122	32,500	31,500	53,000	
Total ... ..	2,77,000	2,65,000	2,77,086	2,26,000	2,76,000	2,40,000	Revised based on the actuals of the first nine months.
Provincial Share .. ..	2,77,000	2,65,000	1,38,543	1,13,000	1,38,000	1,20,000	

## 49.—Irrigation—Major Works (Interest on Debt)—

Interest ... ..	3,39,000	3,39,000	3,41,301	3,39,000	3,53,000	3,52,000	
Provincial Share ... ..	3,39,000	3,39,000	1,70,650	1,69,000	1,76,000	1,76,000	

## 50.—Minor Works and Navigation—

IN CHARGE OF THE CIVIL DEPARTMENT.							
Embankments under the contract system—							
Establishments ... ..			2,375	1,512		2,000	
Contingencies ... ..			81	40		500	

Maintenance charges of the Howrah and Rajapur drainage projects ...			1,426	.....		...
Refunds ...			6	500		500
Temporary establishment ...			.....	.....		.....
Travelling allowance ...			.....	.....		.....
Grain compensation allowance ...			.....	.....		.....
Bonus ...			71	.....		.....
Add—For rounding ...			...	52		...
Total in charge of the Civil Department ...	7,000	3,000	3,909	2,000	2,000	3,000
Provincial Share ...	7,000	3,000	1,954	1,000	1,000	1,000
<b>IN CHARGE OF THE PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT.</b>						
<b>IRRIGATION AND NAVIGATION WORKS.</b>						
<i>Works for which Capital and Revenue Accounts are kept</i>						
<b>CAPITAL.</b>						
<i>Works in Progress.</i>						
Midnapore Canal ...			(-) 3,942	2,400	1,200	2,400
Hajali Tidal Canal ...			..			
Calcutta and Eastern Canals ...			(-) 96,978*	—8,250	—77,819	—77,600
Madanipur Bhil Scheme ...			4,69,082	72,450	2,30,013	2,26,400
Utterbagh lock ...			14,788	87,000	71,000	26,800
Total Capital			3,72,960	1,53,600	2,24,394	1,77,000
<b>REVENUE.</b>						
Orissa Coast Canal ...			19,016	20,000	22,000	26,000
Calcutta and Eastern Canals ...			3,01,057	4,81,800	3,86,680	5,88,000
Madanipur Bhil Scheme ...			7,310	28,700	80,014	63,000
Total Revenue			3,27,283	5,30,500	4,88,694	6,77,000
Total Works for which Capital and Revenue accounts are kept ...			7,00,243	6,84,100	7,13,088	8,54,000

\* Inclusive of Rs. 426 on account of survey of Tolly's Nala and Rs 572 on account of the ship canal.

## 43.—Minor Works and Navigation—concluded.

HEADS.	ACTUALS.			1912-13.		1913-14.	REMARKS.
	1909-10.	1910-11.	1911-12.	Sanctioned estimate.	Revised estimate.	Budget estimate.	
1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8
	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	
<i>Works for which only Revenue accounts are kept.</i>							
WORKS IN PROGRESS.							
Nadia Rivers ... ..			80,226	1,18,000	1,42,172	1,23,500	* Inclusive of Rs. 258 on account of the Peali Sircle.
Gaighatta and Buxi Ktals ... ..			4,680*	5,400	7,750	500	
Total Works for which only Revenue accounts are kept ... ..			84,906	1,23,400	1,49,922	1,24,000	
<i>Works for which neither Capital nor Revenue accounts are kept.</i>							
WORKS IN PROGRESS.							
Eden Canal ... ..			28,341	36,000	33,352	38,000	
Improvement of navigable channels—Ganges river ... ..			22,543	35,000	33,000	35,000	
Dredging the Bhagirathi entrance ... ..			60,530	...	17,262	7,000	
Ditto Gorai entrance ... ..							
Other works ... ..							
Dredging the Dhaleswari and Buriganga rivers ... ..							
Bandalling and putting on spurs on the Dhaleswari and Buriganga rivers ... ..				79,900	67,900	88,000	
Grant-in-aid for bandalling the Ganges near Rampur Boalia ... ..							
Improving the channel of the Karnafuli ... ..							
Repairs ... ..							
Total Works for which neither Capital nor Revenue accounts are kept ... ..			1,11,414	1,60,900	1,51,514	1,68,000	
Total Irrigation and Navigation Works ... ..			8,96,563	9,58,400	10,14,524	11,46,000	

AGRICULTURAL AND DRAINAGE WORKS.						
<i>Works for which only Revenue accounts are kept and for which neither Capital nor Revenue accounts are kept.</i>						
WORKS IN PROGRESS						
Government embankments .. ..	}	.	6,70,544	6,85,200	5,85,476	6,96,000
Midnapore Takavi embankments under contract ... ..						
Rajapur and Howrah drainage ... ..						
Magra Hât drainage project ... ..						
Total Agricultural ... ..	.....	.....	6,70,544	6,85,200	5,85,476	6,96,000
Reserve ... ..	.....	.....	.....	21,400	.. ..	24,000
Total in charge of the Public Works Department ... ..	17,80,000	17,40,000	15,87,107	16,65,000	16,00,000	18,66,000
Provincial share ... ..	17,80,000	17,40,000	7,83,553	8,32,000	8,00,000	9, 3,000

## 45.—Civil Works—

IN CHARGE OF THE CIVIL DEPARTMENT.						
Provision for Sub-Overseers in each Sub-division in Bengal to report on the real condition of rural water-supply .. ..			.....	...	.....	38,000
Ferry charges ... ..			2,485	6,094	6,600	6,827
„ refunds ... ..			7,517	10,317	6,728	12,000
Staging bungalows ... ..			4,223	7,754	8,200	6,996
Encamping grounds ... ..			17	500	500	500
Arboriculture ... ..			13,764	.....	20,000	.. ..
Contributions in aid of Excluded Local Funds and Municipalities .. ..			8,28,989	7,84,264	13,41,716	14,95,320
Other items ... ..					4,595	4,650
Grant to the Calcutta Improvement Trust .. ..	}	}	11 64,461	12,12,267	11,50,000	11,50,000
Contribution to District Funds and District Road Funds ... ..			10,06,283	8,11,494	8,58,661	3,07,934
Lump addition ... ..			.....	3,50,703	.. ..	.....
Deduct—Probable savings ... ..			.....	+ 627	.. ..	—1,227
Total in charge of the Civil Department ... ..	17,17,000	16,74,000	30,27,729	32,00,000	33,94,000	30,20,000

This includes the grant for the improvement of Sanitation.

Budget includes Rs. 50,000 for feeder roads, but excludes Rs. 5,84,000 by which amount the grants to District Boards will be reduced from 1913-14 owing to the localization of the Public Works Cess.



HEADS.	ACTUALS.			1912-13		1913-14.	REMARKS.
	1909-10	1910-11	1911-12.	Sanctioned estimate	Revised estimate.	Budget estimate.	
	2	3	4	5	6	7	8
<b>IN CHARGE OF THE PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT.</b>	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	
<i>Original Works.</i>							
Civil Buildings { In progress ...	..			{ 15,13,800	{ 40,60,000	{ 11,88,000	
{ Not commenced ..	..			{ 17,73,927		{ 27,34,100	
Communications { In progress ...	..			{ 99,500	{ 1,47,000	{ 58,000	
{ Not commenced ..	..			{ 42,000		{ 3,15,000	
Miscellaneous { In progress ...	..			{ 8,800	{ 44,000	{ 40,000	
Public Im- { Not commenced ..	..			{ 53,300		{ 3,300	
<b>Total</b> ..				34,91,327	42,51,000	43,38,400	
<i>Repairs.</i>							
Civil Buildings ... ..	..			7,56,000	8,07,000	} 19,60,000	
Communications ... ..	..			7,67,000	8,23,000		
Miscellaneous Public Improvements ...	..			77,500	84,000		
<b>Total</b> ...				16,00,500	17,14,000	19,60,000	
<b>Establishment</b> ... ..				10,09,173	10,32,000	10,94,600	
<b>Tools and Plant</b> ... ..				70,000	52,000	37,000	
<b>Stock and Suspense</b> ... ..				29,000	51,000	..	
<b>Total in charge of Public Works Department</b>	59,81,000	63,65,000	61,52,000	62,00,000	71,00,000	74,30,000	

**SCHEDULE OF NEW SCHEMES ESTIMATED TO COST MORE THAN Rs. 5,000 IN ANY ONE YEAR, WHICH IT IS PROPOSED TO UNDERTAKE DURING 1913-14.**

1913.]

*Obligatory schemes which have been provided for in the Budget for 1913-14.*

Major budget head and sub-head under which provision has been made.	Nature of scheme.	ESTIMATE OR ULTIMATE MAXIMUM COST.			ESTIMATE OF EXPENDITURE IN 1913-14			REMARKS.
		Non-recurring.	Recurring.	Total.	Non-recurring.	Recurring.	Total.	
1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9
<b>3.—Land Revenue—</b>		Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	
Charges of District Administration.	One additional appointment of District Magistrate.	.. ...	18,000	18,000	.....	18,000	18,000	Owing to administrative needs five appointments for additional District Magistrates were created (Secretary of State's Despatch No. 154 Public, dated 4th November 1910) in Eastern Bengal and Assam. Of these, three were permanently included in the cadre of the Indian Civil Service and two sanctioned up to 31st December 1912. On the reconstitution of the province, the three permanent additional appointments have been allotted to Bengal. One of the two temporary appointments has been given to Assam, and the other to Bengal. This appointment will be continued.
Ditto ...	Increase of pay of Kanungoes	.....	9,000	9,000	.....	9,000	9,000	The scheme is now under consideration, and final decision has not yet been arrived at. A lump provision of Rs 6,000 for increase of pay and Rs. 3,000 for increase in the grant of travelling allowance has been made.
<b>Total Land Revenue ...</b>		.....	27,000	27,000	...	27,000	27,000	
<b>7.—Excise—</b>								
District Executive establishment—Sudder establishment.	Re-organization of the Excise Department and its amalgamation with the Salt Department.	.....	2,66,808	2,66,808	.....	50,000	50,000	A proposal has been submitted to the Government of India for the re organization of the Excise Department and its amalgamation with the Salt Department. The cost of the proposed amalgamated establishment will be Rs. 9,68,560 showing an increase of Rs. 2,66,808 over the present sanctioned scale. A provision of Rs. 50,000 has been made towards the introduction of the new schemes in the event of its being sanctioned during

Revised Financial Statement, 1913-14.

Major budget head and sub-head under which provision has been made.	Nature of scheme.	ESTIMATE OF ULTIMATE MAXIMUM COST.			ESTIMATE OF EXPENDITURE IN 1913-14.			REMARKS.
		Non-recurring.	Recurring.	Total.	Non-recurring.	Recurring.	Total	
1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9
11.—Forests.								
Conservancy and Works	Purchase of elephants ..	Rs. 9,000	Rs. . . .	Rs. 9,000	Rs. 9,000	Rs. . . . .	Rs. 9,000	Provision has been made for the purchase of three elephants for the use of the Conservator of Forests while on tour in Jalpaiguri and other divisions. These rest-houses are necessary for administrative purposes.
	Construction of two rest-houses at Jalpaiguri and Dobacheri in Chittagong Division.	8,000	. . .	8,000	8,000	...	8,000	
Total Forests	...	17,000	.....	17,000	17,000	... ..	17,000	
12.—Registration—								
Superintendence	Revision of establishment of Inspector-General's office.	... ..	5,400	5,400	... ..	5,400	5,400	This has already been sanctioned
District charges. Sub-Registrars.	Revision of cadre of Sub-Registrars.	.....	12,300	12,300	.....	12,300	12,300	This is for re-grading of Sub-Registrars according to the sanctioned scale, in the proportion of 2:5, 5:6. The new scale would provide :— Rs. 1st grade 37 ... 5,550 2nd do. 92 ... 11,500 3rd do. 92 ... 9,200 4th do. 110 ... 8,250  34,500 per month or 4,14,000 a year against a budget grant of Rs. 4,01,700 in 1912-13. The excess expenditure is Rs. 12,300.
Ditto	Proposal for opening new Sub-Registry offices.	.....	10,000	10,000	.....	10,000	10,000	The Inspector-General asked for Rs. 13,800, but Rs. 10,000 has been provided for.
Ditto	Revision of ministerial establishment.	.....	35,000	35,000	.....	35,000	35,000	The Inspector-General asked for Rs. 71,000, but Rs. 35,000 has been provided for in the budget for the revision of the District headquarters offices. This is in accordance with the recommendation of the Ministerial Officers' Salaries Committee; an increase has been sanctioned for both Civil and Criminal Courts, and it is now necessary to give effect in the offices of District Registrars.

Revised Financial Statement, 1913-14.

[13TH MARCH,

	Increase of rate of remuneration of extra establishments employed at Sadar and Mufassil Sub-Registry offices and the appointment of paid probationers.	.....	36,000	36,000	.....	20,000	20,000	The schemes are under consideration of Government.																																										
Total Registration	.....	.....	98,700	98,700	...	82,700	82,700																																											
<b>A.—Law and Justice—</b>																																																		
<b>Courts of Law.</b>																																																		
Magistrate and Sessions Courts and Courts of Small Causes ...	Re-grading of Munsifs .. Additional Judge ..	.. 15,000	50,000 ...	50,000 15,000	... .. 15,000	50,000 .....	50,000 15,000	The question is under consideration. A temporary Additional Judge has been sanctioned for the Calcutta Small Cause Court for six months. His salary at Rs. 1,000 and establishment at Rs. 250 per mensem have been provided for. As the appointment is a temporary one, the figures are shown as non-recurring. Provision has been made for one year, as it might be necessary to extend the terms of the appointment.																																										
Criminal Courts	Chaukidari Panchayat ..	...	40,500	40,500	.	22,000	22,000	The details are as below :—																																										
								<table><tr><th></th><th>Estimated cost</th><th>Cost during 1913-14.</th></tr><tr><th></th><th>Rs</th><th>Rs</th></tr><tr><td>Temporary clerks ...</td><td>5,000</td><td>5,000</td></tr><tr><td>Clerks for Circle officers ..</td><td>4,800</td><td>4,800</td></tr><tr><td>Munshi Chaukidars</td><td>2,400</td><td>2,400</td></tr><tr><td>Additional Sub-Deputy Collectors—</td><td></td><td></td></tr><tr><td>For 6 months, { 10 proba- ... 4,500</td><td></td><td></td></tr><tr><td>tioners.</td><td></td><td></td></tr><tr><td>{ 1 1st grade 2,250</td><td>33,300</td><td>15,000</td></tr><tr><td>{ 3 2nd „ ... 5,400</td><td></td><td></td></tr><tr><td>{ 6 2nd „ ... 9,450</td><td></td><td></td></tr><tr><td>{ 6 4th „ ... 8,100</td><td></td><td></td></tr><tr><td>{ 4 5th „ ... 3,600</td><td></td><td></td></tr><tr><td>Total ...</td><td>45,500</td><td>27,200</td></tr></table>		Estimated cost	Cost during 1913-14.		Rs	Rs	Temporary clerks ...	5,000	5,000	Clerks for Circle officers ..	4,800	4,800	Munshi Chaukidars	2,400	2,400	Additional Sub-Deputy Collectors—			For 6 months, { 10 proba- ... 4,500			tioners.			{ 1 1st grade 2,250	33,300	15,000	{ 3 2nd „ ... 5,400			{ 6 2nd „ ... 9,450			{ 6 4th „ ... 8,100			{ 4 5th „ ... 3,600			Total ...	45,500	27,200
	Estimated cost	Cost during 1913-14.																																																
	Rs	Rs																																																
Temporary clerks ...	5,000	5,000																																																
Clerks for Circle officers ..	4,800	4,800																																																
Munshi Chaukidars	2,400	2,400																																																
Additional Sub-Deputy Collectors—																																																		
For 6 months, { 10 proba- ... 4,500																																																		
tioners.																																																		
{ 1 1st grade 2,250	33,300	15,000																																																
{ 3 2nd „ ... 5,400																																																		
{ 6 2nd „ ... 9,450																																																		
{ 6 4th „ ... 8,100																																																		
{ 4 5th „ ... 3,600																																																		
Total ...	45,500	27,200																																																
Magistrate and Sessions Courts and Courts of Small Causes ...	...	15,000	90,500	1,05,500	15,000	72,000	87,000	Usually provision of Rs. 5,000 is made, but on account of extension of the Chaukidari Circle system an increased provision of Rs. 22,000 is made in 1913-14. The ultimate increased cost will be Rs. 40,000.																																										

For budget head and sub-head under which provision has been made.	Nature of scheme.	ESTIMATE OF ULTIMATE MAXIMUM COST.			ESTIMATE OF EXPENDITURE IN 1913-14.			REMARKS.
		Non-recur- ring	Recurring.	Total	Non-recur- ring	Recurring	Total.	
1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9
<i>B.—Courts of Law—Jails</i>	Charges for moving prisoners.	...	Rs. 7,000	Rs. 7,000	Rs. .....	Rs. 7,000	Rs. 7,000	This is on account of subsistence allowance for two extra days, i.e., 5 annas a day, to the prisoners on release. The proposal has been submitted to the Government of India for approval.
<i>20.—Police—</i>								
<i>Magistrate Police—</i>								
<i>Calcutta Police</i> ...	Re-grading of Sub-Inspectors.	...	6,600	6,600		6,600	6,600	To promote 4 Sub Inspectors from 150 to 175 " 17 Sub-Inspectors from 140 to 150 " 19 Sub-Inspectors from 125 to 140  This is in accordance with the scheme sanctioned by the Secretary of State, and will be given effect from next year
Ditto ..	Approved service increments of constables.	...	33,936	33,936	...	33,936	33,936	This is in accordance with the scheme already sanctioned allowing the constables to draw a rupee increment after 3, 10 and 17 years of approved services. The additional cost in 1913-14 is—  Rs.  Calcutta Police ... 30,744 Dock and Bridge Police ... 1,512 Police supplied to private individuals 864 River Police ... 816  33,936

## Calcutta Police

... Additional police force  
to raise the reserve to  
its authorized strength.

.....

29,600

29,600

.....

29,600

29,600

The employment of 13 Sergeants, 11 Head constables and 157 constables are required to raise the reserve of the Calcutta Police to its authorized strength. The present reserve is very low—

	Rs.	A.
Pay	40,108	7
Clothing	3,376	0
Contingencies	4,010	0
House-rent	1,200	0
Total	48,694	7

Deduct asset-off the cost of the armed guard sanctioned for the Bank of Bengal and the Mint which will not be required for duty 19,075 15

29,618 8  
or Rs. 29,600 0

Ditto

... Purchase of a motor  
prison van.

8,000

1,052

9,052

8,000

1,052

9,052

The prison van drawn by horses does not provide for the full requirements, and it has been decided to purchase a motor prison van at a cost of Rs. 8,000. Rupees 786 is required for establishment and Rs. 266 for contingencies.

District Police

... Re-organization of sub-  
ordinate police in  
Eastern Bengal.

3,71,435

1,66,598

5,38,033

1,75,000

1,17,014

2,92,014

The whole scheme for the re-organization of the subordinate police in the Eastern Bengal districts has been sanctioned by the Secretary of State, and effect is being given gradually.

Ditto

.. Revision of the superior  
police cadre.

...

69,825

69,825

.....

5,700

5,700

The scheme is to appoint two District Superintendents, two Assistant Superintendents and eight Deputy Superintendents of Police, so that a larger number of gazetted officers may be employed in heavier subdivisions. It is thought two Additional Superintendents are urgently required for Midnapore and the 24 Parganas. Provision has been made for two officers for three months of next year.

Ditto

... Establishment  
Constables' Training  
School at Dacca, a  
combined school at  
Sarda and revision of  
other schools.

.....

36,587

36,587

... ..

34,142

34,142

This has already been sanctioned and given effect partly in 1912-13. The increase is only temporary for three years or so, i.e., until Sarda school is completely ready, when the schools at Berhampore and Rampur Boalia will be closed.

1913.]

Revised Financial Statement, 1913-14.

Major budget head and sub-head under which provision has been made.	Nature of scheme.	ESTIMATE OR ULTIMATE MAXIMUM COST.			ESTIMATE OF EXPENDITURE IN 1913-14.			REMARKS.
		Non-recurring.	Recurring.	Total.	Non-recurring.	Recurring.	Total.	
1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9
<i>80.—Police—continued.</i>		Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	
District Police—continued.	Reorganization of Dacca Town Police.	1,000	10,065	11,065	1,000	9,000	10,000	This is over and above the sanctioned strength as passed in the Report of the Police Commission. It is proposed to employ additional force of eight Head constables and 70 constables.
Ditto	Approved service increment of constables.	.....	30,100	30,100	.....	28,000	28,000	This is in accordance with approved service rules passed by Government. This is necessary to remove the grievances of constables who are eligible for increments of pay.
Ditto	Temporary establishment for Training College of Sub-Inspectors.	.....	8,370	8,370	...	8,370	8,370	This is for temporary force, etc., for the Training College, Sarda. <div style="text-align: right;">           Rs.            3 Inspectors (Rs. 150 each per mensem) ... 5,400            1 Head constable (Rs. 17-8) ... 210            12 Syces (Rs. 10 each) ... 1,440            1 Pandit (Rs. 50) ... 600            Purchase of grass ... 720  <hr/>           8,370         </div>
Ditto	Enlistment allowances to recruits.	.....	10,504	10,504	...	10,504	10,504	The amount is based on the average number of recruits enlisted in the past three years, viz., 1,616 at Rs. 6-8 each. The allowance has been sanctioned by the Government of India.
Ditto	Purchase of elephants and horses.	9,500	...	9,500	9,500	.....	9,500	Two elephants are required for the Superintendent of Police, Jalpaiguri, to replace one of the two which is dead and for the Inspector in charge of Alipur Duars subdivisions, and horses for the Inspector and Sergeants of the Dacca reserve and town. Without the elephants the inspection work cannot be done with satisfaction.

Ditto	...	Purchase of boxes	...	10,053	.....	10,053	10,053	.....	10,053	Deed boxes are required for keeping confined- tial papers, case diaries, etc., by investigating police officers, 1,117 at Rs. 9 each.
Ditto	...	Purchase of books and publications.		9,180	.....	9,180	9,180	....	9,180	Dr. Ryan's Law of Criminal 'Ra. Evidence ... 480 District and jurisdiction maps 1,120 Purchase of Bradshaws for 26 districts ... 130 Zaffar Umar's Police Manual 4,500 Newspapers ... 1,000 Captain Hirst's Hand-book of Surveying .. 1,950 <hr/> 9,180
Ditto	...	Grant to Athletic Club	.....	8,000		8,000	....	8,000	8,000	This is for travelling allowance of hockey teams and has been sanctioned by the late Eastern Bengal and Assam Government.
Ditto	...	Purchase of furniture ..		10,000	... ..	10,000	10,000	...	10,000	Most of the existing police stations in the Eastern Bengal districts are very badly fur- nished. The provision is intended for supplying furniture to old and new stations and to the police sergeants who are in need of them
Ditto	...	Strengthening of Police guards of sub- treasuries.		2,760	22,756	25,516	2,760	15,394	18,154	The strength of police guards in sub- treasuries as sanctioned under the re-organisa- tion scheme is in most places considered to be inadequate. The men are relieved once a fortnight only in East Bengal districts and once in three weeks in West Bengal districts. There is therefore, a risk of the men being overworked and not properly on the alert, as they do not get a sufficient number of nights in bed. It is proposed to bring the number of guards to a sufficient strength by appointing 54 head constables and 84 constables.
Ditto	...	Increase in the rate of pay of Armed Reserve.	.....	{ 62,520 + 4,689 (Pensionary charges )		67,209	.. ...	25,000	25,000	It is impossible to get suitable men at the present rate of pay of Rs. 9, as it is less than what is earned by coolies, servants, etc. It is proposed to raise the pay of 2,605 constables by Rs. 2 per mensem.
Ditto	...	Construction of steamers and cutters		1,46,541	36,107	1,82,648	75,186	.....	75,186	Steam-launches are wanted by the Superin- tendents of Police, Tippera, Bogra, Deputy Inspector-General of Dacca, and Assistant Superintendents of Patuakhali and Muushiganj. Without these proper police supervision cannot be expected in the river districts.



Major budget head and sub-head under which provision has been made.	Nature of scheme.	ESTIMATE OF ULTIMATE MAXIMUM COST.			ESTIMATE OF EXPENDITURE IN 1913-14.			REMARKS
		Non-recurring.	Recurring.	Total.	Non-recurring.	Recurring.	Total.	
1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9
80.—Police—concluded.		Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	
Other Police. Police—River	Re-organization of River Police, Dacca	6,28,015	1,61,825	7,89,870	3,00,000	1,49,555	4,49,555	The cost during the year 1912-13 is— Rs. Recurring ... 73,640 Non-recurring ... 6,000 Total 79,643  It has been decided to provide in the next year's budget Rs 4,49,555.
Ditto ...	Station boat scheme ...	... ..	58,709	58,709	... ..	45,000	45,000	Rs. Faridpur and Dacca (already sanctioned) ... 27,626 Tippera and Mymensingh (do) 13,641 Addition for Faridpur, Dacca and Barisal 17,442 Total 58,709  It is proposed to allow Rs 45,000 in 1913-14 against Rs 30,000 sanctioned in 1912-13. These boats are most useful and the reduction of crime must be largely attributed to them.
Ditto ..	Re-organization of the Dacca and Hooghly Military Police. .	11,253	8,429	19,682	11,253	8,429	19,682	This is for the re-organization of the Dacca Military Police battalion and for converting the Hooghly Military Company into a Jharua Company and amalgamating it with the Dacca battalion. The cost is for recruitment of sepoy, purchase of kits, armoury and ammunitions, etc.
Total Police ...	.....	12,07,767	7,66,272	19,74,039	6,11,932	5,35,296	11,47,228	

<b>Education— Direction</b>	...	Re-organisation of the office of the Director of Public Instruction	.....	25,186	25,186	.....	9,480	9,480	The proposal is under consideration. In 1913-14 it has been proposed to give— Rs. 6,000 for Director of Public Instruction's office 3,000 for the office of the Assistant Director of Public Instruction for Muhammadan education. 480 for probationers to be made permanent.  9,480
<b>Inspection</b>	...	Re-grading of Sub-Inspectors.	... ..	12,000	12,000	...	12,000	12,000	This is for re-grading the subordinate inspecting staff. The scheme is not yet ready.
<b>Government Professional.</b>	Colleges,	An additional Professor of Mechanical Engineering, Civil Engineering College.	. ...	6,000	6,000	.....	6,000	6,000	This is intended for the creation of an Indian Educational Service appointment for the Civil Engineering College in place of an appointment in the Provincial Educational Service which will be available on Mr. Bruhl's retirement
<b>Government General— Secondary Schools for girls. Middle English Schools.</b>	Schools,	New preparatory class in the Dow Hill School.	... ..	6,450	6,450	....	6,450	6,450	This is a sort of preparatory class for small boys in the girls' school before they are transferred to boys' school. The details are— Rs. Boarding charges ... .. 4,672 Servants ... .. 728 Prize and library allowance . . 50 Contingencies . . . . . 300 Apparatus ... .. 300 Nurse-matron .. . 600  Total ... 6,450
<b>Government Special—Normal Schools</b>	Schools,	Re-organisation of 1st grade Training Schools.	.....	6,800	6,800	. ...	6,800	6,800	As the sanctioned budget for 1912-13 which included the amount in full was not issued till July when the training school session was far advanced the full amount has not been appropriated, but it is proposed to give effect to the scheme at once.

Major budget head and sub-head under which provision has been made.	Nature of scheme.	ESTIMATE OF ULTIMATE MAXIMUM COST.			ESTIMATE OF EXPENDITURE IN 1913-14.			REMARKS.
		Non-recur- ring.	Recurring.	Total.	Non-recur- ring.	Recurring.	Total.	
1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9
		Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	
<b>22.—Education—continued.</b>								
Government Schools, Special—continued.	Reforming the system of training in Eastern Bengal districts.	.....	29,000	29,000	.....	29,000	29,000	The non-recurring charges for equipment and building will be met from the Imperial grant. It is only for recurring charges that a provision is necessary. The scheme was approved by the Secretary of State and will be brought into operation as funds permit. It is proposed to start ten schools next year and the details of the charges are as below :— <div style="text-align: right;"> Rs.  Staff ... .. 24,000  House-rent ... .. 1,000  Substitutes of teachers to be  trained ... 4 000  <hr/> 29 000 </div>
Ditto ... ..	Provincialization of Victoria Technical In- stitute, Chittagong, and Diamond Jubilee Industrial School.	23,400	14,775	38,175	10,600	...	10,600	The Director of Public Instruction asks for the provision of Rs. 11,000 (non-recurring Rs. 1,200 and recurring Rs. 7,400) for Victoria Technical Institute. Until the building is completed recurring charges will not be necessary. The proposal is to provide Rs. 2,200 for non recurring charges in 1913-14. The Director of Public Instruction asks for provision of Rs. 15,775 (non-recurring Rs. 8,400 and recurring Rs. 7,375) for Diamond Jubilee Industrial School. Until the building is completed recurring charges will not be necessary. The proposal is to provide Rs. 2,400 for non-recurring only in 1913-14.
Ditto ... ..	Improvement of Madrasahs, Eastern Bengal districts.	.....	15,000	15,000	...	5,000	5,000	The scheme is under the consideration of Government and a small provision of Rs. 5,000 is made here to give effect to the scheme partially.

Engineering and Survey Schools.	Survey Schools	75,000	10,000	85,000	40,000	10,000	50,000	This is on account of opening new survey schools under the Director of Surveys, Bengal and Assam. At the request of the Director of Surveys a lump provision of Rs. 50,000 has been made
Miscellaneous	Supply of maps	16,000	.....	16,000	16,000	...	16,000	This is for the supply of school maps. The Director of Surveys wants Rs. 6,000 each year for five years at present and the balance Rs. 10,000 is wanted by the Director of Public Instruction for the supply of maps to certain schools, etc.
Total Education	...	1,14,400	1,25,211	2,39,611	66,600	84,730	1,51,330	

<i>24.—Medical.</i>								
Medical establishment, Superintendence	Appointment of an Indian Medical Service Personal Assistant to the Inspector-General of Civil Hospitals.	.. ..	10,800	10,800	..	9,600	9,600	
Medical Schools and Colleges	Professor of Physics and an Assistant Professor of Physics and Chemistry, Medical College, Calcutta	.....	15,300	15,300	...	8,400	8,400	<div>Rs.</div> <div>Pay of Professor of Physics .. 420</div> <div>Pay of Assistant Professors (180 + 100) ... 80</div> <div>700 x 12 = 8,400</div>
Ditto	Lieutenant-Colonel Sutherland's Special Serological work.	32,000	.....	32,000	20,000	.....	20,000	<div>Rs.</div> <div>Dr. Sutherland's salary (1,650 + 150) ... 1,950</div> <div>Pay of Assistant Surgeon (150 + 50) .. 200</div> <div>Servants ... 27</div> <div>2,177</div> <div>Rs.</div> <div>For seven months 15,189</div> <div>Working expenses 1,875</div> <div>17,065</div> <div>Contingencies, etc. 2,935</div> <div>20,000</div> <div>The charge for five months will appear in 1912-13.</div>

1913-14

Revised Financial Statement, 1913-14.

Major budget head and sub-head under which provision has been made.	Nature of scheme.	ESTIMATE OF ULTIMATE MAXIMUM COST.			ESTIMATE OF EXPENDITURE IN 1913-14.			REMARKS.																																
		Non-recurring.	Recurring.	Total.	Non-recurring.	Recurring.	Total.																																	
1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9																																
24.—Medical—concluded.		Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.																																	
Medical Schools and Colleges—continued.	Allowances to the Resident Surgeon and Resident Physician, Medical College Hospital.	.....	7,200	7,200	... ..	7,200	7,200	<div style="text-align: right;">Rs. 2 Resident Surgeons at 200      400 1 Resident Physician at 200      200  Total ...      600 × 12  7,200</div>																																
Hospitals and Dispensaries	Appointment of additional nurses in the Campbell Hospital.	.....	5,280	5,280	.....	5,280	5,280	<p>This is required in consideration of the large amount of teaching work they have to do in connection with the college.</p> <p>The Inspector-General of Civil Hospitals wanted an allowance of Rs. 100 per month for the Apothecary, but this has not been approved.</p> <p>It is proposed to appoint six additional nurses on the following rates of pay and allowances:</p> <table><tr><td></td><td>Pay.</td><td>Diet allowance</td><td>Lodging allowance</td></tr><tr><td></td><td>Rs.</td><td></td><td>Rs.</td></tr><tr><td>1 Nurse for operation</td><td>60</td><td>+ 15</td><td>+ 20</td></tr><tr><td>1 Assistant to matron</td><td>50</td><td>+ 15</td><td>+ 20</td></tr><tr><td>1 Ditto</td><td>30</td><td>+ 15</td><td>+ 20</td></tr><tr><td>4 Nurses</td><td>90</td><td>+ 45</td><td>+ 60</td></tr><tr><td></td><td>230</td><td>+ 90</td><td>+ 120</td></tr><tr><td></td><td colspan="3">= 440 × 12 = 5,280</td></tr></table>		Pay.	Diet allowance	Lodging allowance		Rs.		Rs.	1 Nurse for operation	60	+ 15	+ 20	1 Assistant to matron	50	+ 15	+ 20	1 Ditto	30	+ 15	+ 20	4 Nurses	90	+ 45	+ 60		230	+ 90	+ 120		= 440 × 12 = 5,280		
	Pay.	Diet allowance	Lodging allowance																																					
	Rs.		Rs.																																					
1 Nurse for operation	60	+ 15	+ 20																																					
1 Assistant to matron	50	+ 15	+ 20																																					
1 Ditto	30	+ 15	+ 20																																					
4 Nurses	90	+ 45	+ 60																																					
	230	+ 90	+ 120																																					
	= 440 × 12 = 5,280																																							
Sanitation and vaccination	Three new Deputy Sanitary Commissioners and their establishments.	... ..	25,000	25,000	.....	25,000	25,000	<div style="text-align: right;">Rs. 3 Deputy Sanitary Commissioners      22,000 Establishment ...      3,000  25,000</div> <p>One of these officers will be from the Indian Medical Service.</p> <p>This has already been sanctioned by the Government of India</p> <p>They will be posted to Dacca, Rajshahi and Burdwan Circles.</p>																																

Ditto	...	Contribution towards the pay of 1st and 2nd class Health officers.	.. ..	26,100	26,100	.....	26,100	26,100	The entertainment of six 1st class and 17 2nd class Health officers has been sanctioned on the understanding that Government will contribute half the pay of these officers, and the municipalities to which they will be attached would bear the other half. This amount represents the Government share of the pay of these officers, which the Government of India have promised to contribute.	
Ditto	...	Jungle clearing	...	50,000	..	50,000	50,000	.....	50,000	This amount has already been paid by the governing body of the Indian Research Fund for carrying out experiments in the decrease of malaria by jungle-clearing in notoriously malarious tracts.
Chemical Examiner	...	A Probationary Officer	...	9,000	9,000	...	7,200	7,200	This appointment has been sanctioned by the Government of India.	
Total Medical	...	.....	82,000	98,680	1,80,680	70,000	88,780	1,58,780	.	
26.—Scientific and other Minor Departments—										
Agriculture	...	Other demonstrations and experiments.	25,000	..	25,000	25,000	...	25,000	The provision is intended for the following purposes:— Rs Bonemeal demonstration ... 10,000 Purchase of seed potatoes for free distribution among cultivators... 10,000 Crop-cutting experiments by district officers— Cost of experiments to be undertaken to test the efficiency of the measures recommended by Mr. Lefroy for combating the mango weevil ... } 5,000 25,000	
Ditto	...	Rangpur Dairy Farm...	.....	16,000	16,000	.....	16,000	16,000	A non-recurring expenditure of Rs. 40,000 will be incurred in 1912-13.	

Major budget head and sub-head under which provision has been made.	Nature of scheme.	ESTIMATE OF ULTIMATE MAXIMUM COST.			ESTIMATE OF EXPENDITURE IN 1913-14.			REMARKS
		Non-recurring.	Recurring.	Total.	Non-recurring.	Recurring.	Total.	
1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9
16.—Scientific and other Minor Departments—continued. Agriculture—continued. ...	Contribution to Tea Association.	Rs. 4,000	Rs. ...	Rs. 4,000	Rs. 4,000	Rs. ....	Rs. 4,000	This is required in connection with the experimental station at Toklai in Assam.
Ditto ...	Sericulture—opening and extension of central nurseries.	51,500	8,000	59,500	51,500	8,000	59,500	This is for the following nurseries—  <div style="text-align: right;">           Rs.            Extension of Mirganj nursery ... 9,400            Malda scheme ... 20,700            Bogra do. ... 3,700            Extension of Chandpur nursery ... 9,000            Ditto of Kamarpur nursery ... 5,700            Other experiments ... 11,000  <hr/>           59,500         </div>
Miscellaneous ...	Steam launches for Fishery Department.	45,000	6,000	51,000	45,000	6,000	51,000	A launch is essential for the working of the Department.
Total Scientific and other Minor Departments.	....	1,25,500	30,000	1,55,500	1,25,500	30,000	1,55,500	
43.—Irrigation—Minor Works and Navigation in charge of Public Works Department.	Dredging of the entrance of Gorai River.	...	7,000	7,000	.....	7,000	7,000	This is strongly recommended by the Standing Committee for water-ways.
	Provincial share ...	.....	3,500	3,500	.....	3,500	3,500	

45.—Civil Works in charge of Civil officers.									
Contribution to municipalities—									
Special grants at the disposal of Divisional Commissioners.	To meet minor local requirements without the delay incidental to a reference to headquarters.	23,500	.....	23,500	23,500	.....	23,500	The system has worked well and it is proposed to increase the allotment to one lakh against the present grant of Rs. 76,500 in the budget.	
Special grant at the disposal of District Magistrates.		52,000	.. ..	52,000	52,000	.....	52,000		It is proposed to place similar allotments at the disposal of District Magistrates in order that minor defects brought to their notice may be promptly remedied.
		38,000	.. ..	38,000	38,000	... .	38,000		
Appointment of overseers of water-supply enquiry.									
Total Civil Works in charge of Civil officers.	.....	1,13,500	.. ..	1,13,500	1,13,500	... .	1,13,500		
GRAND TOTAL	.....	16,75,167	15,13,671	31,88,838	10,19,532	9,81,006	20,00,538		



[Dr. Nilratan Sarkar.]

## RESOLUTION ON THE REVISED FINANCIAL STATEMENT.

EXPENDITURE—Heads 19 B—Jails; 24—Medical; 45—Civil Works.

The Hon'ble DR. NILRATAN SARKAR moved the following Resolution :—

This Council recommends to the Governor in Council—

- (a) that a further sum of Rs. 2,00,000, in addition to the sum already budgetted for improvements of jails, be provided for—
  - (i) improving the accommodation and dietary for invalids in jails, and
  - (ii) establishing a sanitarium in some healthy station (not necessarily in Bengal) for such prisoners as require change of climate; and
- (b) that this charge be met from the fund placed at the disposal of Government for discretionary grants.

He said—

“My Lord, I thankfully acknowledge the benevolent efforts of Government for improvement in the sanitary conditions of our jails, which were only a few years back notorious for their high sick-rate and mortality among the prison population. But it cannot be denied that much yet remains to be done in this direction. The insanitary condition of the jails of this Presidency has been causing great anxiety not only among the people themselves, but among the officials in charge of the department who have always called attention to the defective arrangements and the inadequacy of accommodation in the jails, especially in some of the Eastern Bengal districts.

“The Sanitary Commissioners have referred to the over crowding which exists in some of the Bengal jails, and the comparatively heavy death-toll which tuberculosis levies on the prison population of Bengal. Some time back the Inspector-General of Prisons recorded with regret that the opportunity of obtaining the jail at Berhampore for the segregation of tuberculous prisoners had disappeared, and noted that the disease could not be effectively controlled until a separate jail for infective cases were provided. In the latest report for Bengal, Lieut.-Col. Buchanan observes once more that the great need for a separate jail for isolation and separation of these cases still remains. ‘It is needed,’ he goes on to say, ‘in the interest of the patients themselves, and even more so in the interest of the healthy patients who have to associate with them in jails.’ Major B. J. Singh likewise testifies to the overcrowding which existed in most of the jails in Eastern Bengal last year, and the statistics which he gives of the deaths from malaria and tuberculosis are indeed very disquieting.

“On a reference to the report for 1910 of the Sanitary Commissioner with the Government of India, we find that, while the average jail mortality per 1,000 of strength was 19·29 for all India, that for Bengal was 22·56. There were in the year under report about 20 jails in all India, with a death-rate above 40 per thousand of prisoners, and of these as many as 8 or more than one-third of the total number are in Bengal. In a schedule of the unhealthy jails this report mentions 24 as being the figure for all India. And it may interest the Council to know that 10 of these are now included in the Bengal Presidency. Again, of some 39 central jails in all India, 6 are in Bengal. But while only 8 of this total number of 39 figure on the list of unhealthy jails, Bengal contributes 3, or half of her share of central jails, to make up the 8 insanitary central jails for all India. So also, out of a total number of some 200 district jails in India, Bengal claims about 23. But while only 15 of the district jails are enumerated in the black list for all India, 7 are from Bengal. The insanitary state of the Bengal jails can also be gauged from the ‘constantly sick rate’ which for all India is 25·5 per thousand of strength, and which stands at the high figure of 39·5 in Bengal.

[Sir William Duke.]

"In 1910, the admission rate of prisoners for tuberculosis was 8·7 per 1,000 strength for India, as compared with 9·7 for Bengal. And while the death-rate for this fell disease was 3·41 per thousand of the entire prison population of India, 4·49 represented the same for Bengal.

"In view of these facts, I think I am justified in pressing this scheme of reform upon the attention of Your Excellency's Council. All that I say is that another and better accommodation should be provided for the prisoners, that a better dietary should be sanctioned for the invalids, and that a sanitarium—which would serve the purpose of an isolation jail—should be established in some healthy station for such diseased prisoners as may require a change of climate."

The Hon'ble SIR WILLIAM DUKE said :—

"My Lord, since I share in the enthusiasm of the Hon'ble Member for the promotion of sanitary conditions in jails, and to a very great extent sympathise with his views, it would have been a pleasure to me if I could have accepted his resolution as it stands; but although we can go some way with him, I am afraid it is not possible formally to accept the resolution as it stands, nor indeed altogether to admit the conclusions which he draws from the facts he has stated as to the proper remedies to be adopted. I do not know whether the Hon'ble Mover is disposed to regard health in jails as a matter entirely dependent upon good administration, or whether he admits that climate is also a factor in the case. If the former, if he thinks it is entirely a matter of administration, I would point out that in Bengal, as it was previously constituted, the death-rates have been steadily reduced. They have for some time been exceptionally low—as low as 18 per 1,000 in 1910 and 17 per 1,000 in 1911—results which may be regarded as excellent. The jails in Eastern Bengal have now come under the same administration; and if it depended on administration alone, it might be held that the former Bengal standard would before long be attained in the new Presidency; but if he admits that climate is an important item in the case, then, considering the extreme unhealthiness of some of our northern districts, the rate for the last year in the Presidency of Bengal as it now is constituted namely, 22 per thousand, is, I think, fairly satisfactory. I do not, of course, pretend that the conditions are ideal, but I do not wish to admit too much. There is one point in the motion to-day to which I cannot agree, and that is that any special measures are required to provide improved dietary for the sick in jails. As a matter of fact, Government believes that everything that can make for the health of sick prisoners is provided and is used, and that nothing that would reasonably promote their health and comfort is withheld, and that therefore in that respect no very special measures are required. As regards accommodation, in the western part of Bengal—the old part of Bengal—the jails have already been provided with well equipped hospitals. In Eastern Bengal, however, there is still something to be accomplished in this respect, but it is being done as rapidly as it can be done. At the present moment better accommodation for the sick is being provided in the jails at Tippera, Mymensingh and Bogra. Whatever else may be found necessary in this respect will be provided as rapidly as possible, and that can be done, we anticipate, without any necessity of making a special grant or interfering with our ordinary financial arrangements. Government is fully alive to the importance of caring for and isolating prisoners suffering from tuberculosis. Separate wards have already been provided in all the Western Bengal jails, and special steps taken to ensure separation being effected in all the jails on the eastern side also. But Government has before it a more important scheme for the thorough segregation of tuberculous prisoners than such measures can ever amount to. That is proposed to be done by converting the present Berhampore Lunatic Asylum into a jail entirely devoted to prisoners suffering from tubercular disease. That will be done as soon as the buildings can be given up, and that will be when the new lunatic asylum at Ranchi, for which a scheme has already

[Sir William Duke; Babu Surendra Nath Banerjee.]

been prepared and funds kept in reserve, is opened. When these steps have been taken, and when their effects on the health of the jails and of the tuberculous prisoners has become apparent, the question raised by the Hon'ble Mover of establishing a sanitarium in some healthy station, which he suggests need not necessarily be in Bengal, will probably come under consideration. By that time perhaps something will have been done on the same basis for the free population of a sanitarium, and from the effect of what may be done it may be possible to judge whether anything in the same line can be done for prisoners. I do not wish to seem lukewarm upon this question, and therefore I may point out that there is a matter connected with the health of prisoners which causes us deeper anxiety, and for which there is more immediate need for effort than there is even in dealing with tuberculosis, and that is that in several jails our great difficulty is the pre-disposition amongst prisoners to dysentery. It is this really which makes certain jails seriously unhealthy, and which causes us anxiety. The subject has received unremitting attention, and will continue to do so, but it is both difficult and obscure, because sometimes, after all possible cases of contamination have been examined and dealt with, although the number of cases is always reduced in the process, still the disease cannot always be entirely got rid of, and, indeed, it may demand the only certain means of amelioration that we know, i.e., the reduction of pressure on the accommodation. In present conditions in Bengal, as we are not overcrowded, reduction of pressure may generally be effected without much difficulty. I may mention that the Government of India are assisting us in our efforts in this direction, in discovering and dealing with cases of dysentery in jails, by deputing an Indian Medical Service officer, under the auspices of the Indian Research Committee, to make a special inquiry on the subject in Bengal. I have adverted to this subject, because it is really the most important difficulty in this province in connection with the health of jails, and to emphasise the fact that we must deal with first things first. The subject of tuberculosis is constantly kept in sight and being dealt with, I therefore hope that the Hon'ble Mover will recognise that Government is doing what can be done in the case, and will not be disposed to press his resolution."

The Hon'ble BABU SURENDRA NATH BANERJEE said :—

"I was for some time a visitor of the Central Jail at Alipore. I used to attend to my duties pretty carefully, and I must bear testimony to the high character for humanity which distinguished generally the Jail administration; but, my Lord, there are one or two points which are apt to be overlooked, and which, I think, have not been taken sufficient note of. Are the authorities quite sure that the food which is provided for the prisoners is actually obtained by the prisoners? I am afraid that although considerable sums of money are provided for suitable food to be given to the prisoners, they do not get the kind of food that is meant for them. I think that in that respect the administration of jails is capable of considerable improvement. Then, my Lord, there is another point which has often struck me, and has, I think, struck most visitors who have been associated with our jails. There are prisoners and prisoners. Sometimes respectable people, *bhadraloks* as we call them, get entangled in the meshes of criminal cases, and are sentenced to hard labour. They get precisely the same kind of food as is given to the poorest convict. Now, ordinarily the food of the *bhadralok* is different from the food of the poorer classes. The *bhadralok* class get fish every day; the poorer classes do not. Now, I found that, in the Alipore Jail, fish was a scarcity, was hardly ever given to the *bhadralok* prisoners, was given only once a week, or perhaps twice. Now, this is a matter which I think is deserving of consideration. Then, my Lord, with reference to the question of mortality to which the Hon'ble Member has referred, we would like to know whether he has compared the mortality of the jail to the mortality in its particular district, because the Hon'ble Member has referred to the climatic condition as an important factor in determining the rate of mortality. Everybody will accept that; but in order to understand whether in a particular jail the rate of mortality is too

[*Babu Prasanna Kumar Ray ; Dr. Nilratan Sarkar ; Mr. Chakravarti.*]

high, I think it is essential that we should know what the rate of mortality is prevalent in the particular district in which the jail is located. In that respect I think the Council would be grateful, and I, at any rate, would be grateful, if my hon'ble friend were in a position to give us some information. I think, my Lord, my hon'ble friend's motion is one which is deserving of the sympathy of Government ; and although Government may not be in a position to accede to the request he makes, I trust that the matter will be borne in mind, and that sooner or later, and sooner rather than later, Government will take definite steps in the direction indicated. My Lord, I beg to support the resolution."

The Hon'ble BABU PRASANNA KUMAR RAY said :—

"My Lord, I beg to support the resolution moved by the Hon'ble Dr. Nilratan Sarkar. Only a very few words are necessary from me in respect of it. The question of the improvement of the sanitary condition of the jails in Bengal has not failed to attract the notice of Government, but the resolution now moved refers to specific measure in that connection. The secret of the high rate of mortality amongst the prisoners in our jails fully justifies the provision of better accommodation and of improvement in the dietary, especially that of invalids. The other portion of the resolution namely, the establishment of a sanitarium for prisoners, speaks for itself. It is evident that a change of climate is to be resorted to when other methods fail. The amount asked for is very small in comparison with the benefit that would be effected by the measures which it is proposed should be taken. I trust the resolution will commend itself to Your Excellency's Council without any opposition. I hope and trust that the resolution just moved will have the sympathy of Government, and it is gratifying to see that Government has already taken the subject into consideration, and what my hon'ble friend Dr. Sarkar wants is to make a small addition to the grant which has already been budgeted.

"With these few words, I support the resolution."

The Hon'ble DR. NILKATAN SARKAR said :—

"Just a word in connection with what we have heard from the Hon'ble Sir William Duke. With regard to the causes of these diseases in jails, I believe that, so far as Bengal is concerned, the climate is more responsible than the administration ; but still remedies could be found by proper administrative measures. As regards tuberculosis, it is quite possible that climate may have something to do with the causation of this disease. At the same time we cannot forget infection is one of the most important elements in the causation of the disease ; and if a healthy prisoner acquires tuberculosis during his stay in a jail by infection from another prisoner who is suffering from that disease, then the State should take the responsibility of providing for him proper medical treatment and also the benefit of a change of climate. I do not propose a sanitarium, by which I mean simply an isolation jail, as a luxury. What I mean is that if any of these convicts who enter jails in good health get infected by some such disease, I think he can claim some consideration at the hands of Government in the matter of treatment. That is my whole argument. Sir, I am extremely grateful to Government for what they have already done, and what they are still doing in this matter, and under the circumstances, I do not think it necessary to press this resolution further, and I beg leave to withdraw it."

The resolution was then withdrawn.

#### *Expenditure—Head 21—Scientific and other Minor Departments.*

The Hon'ble MR. BYOMKES CHAKRAVARTI the moved following resolution :—

2. This Council recommends to the Governor in Council—

(a) that a sum of Rs. 50,00,000 be set apart for laying down to permanent pasture on scientific lines a selected area of not less than 100 acres, and



[Mr. Chakravarti.]

- (b) that the cost be met from the non-recurring assignment for discretionary grant of Rs. 12,00,000.

He said :—

“ I move the Resolution which stands in my name ; but, in doing so, I desire, at the outset, to point out to the Council that, either in the copy sent by me, or in printing, there is a mistake in the first part of it. The resolution ought to run in this form :—

This Council recommends to the Governor in Council—

- (a) that a sum of Rs. 5 lakhs to be set apart for laying down permanent pasture on scientific lines in selected areas, not less than 100 acres each, and  
 (b) that the cost be met from the non-recurring assignment for discretionary grant of Rs. 12,00,000.

“ In this connection may I be further allowed to point out that from the Draft Financial Statement and the observations made by various official members on various heads of the Draft Financial Statement it is well-nigh impossible for any Hon'ble Member of this Council to find out the real position of affairs with regard to any of the important heads, and this observation applies eminently to agricultural receipts and agricultural disbursements. I defy any Hon'ble Member to tell us from the Draft Financial Statement as to what they are. Still, Bengal is essentially an agricultural country, and I have no doubt that the Government is very keen on giving facilities for the improvement of agricultural process and the dissemination of agricultural education. That being so, one has a right to expect that the Department of Agriculture strictly so called should receive greater attention in the Financial Statement and the speeches introducing them into this Council.

“ Be that as it may, in this Presidency where the population is so overwhelmingly agricultural, cattle is essential, for it is required for draught purposes, for agricultural operations and for the production of milk. Therefore provisions for food, the health, and the improvement of the cattle are almost as important as those of the people owning the cattle. It becomes almost a national concern, demanding the primary attention of the Government, being quite as important as maintaining peace and order in the Presidency. Although the importance of the subject has been admitted on all hands from time to time, I cannot find from the materials at my disposal that either adequate attention has been given to this subject, or suitable provision has been made for its accomplishment. I find that the Government records describe ‘the cattle in Bengal as generally poor and under-fed.’ The Government publications also show that ‘in Bengal pasture is very scanty, where every inch of land grows crops and the cattle have to be content with such scanty herbage as the road-sides, tank-banks and field boundary ridges afford.’ That being so, it is singular that the question of providing adequate pasture-lands has not so far engaged the attention of the Government to the extent that its importance deserves. Though something, however little, has been done in recent years by the Government for the encouragement of agricultural education, the attention of the Government towards the improvement of cattle has been directed only recently. The subjects with which the Government appear to be concerned at present are the improvement of the breed of cattle and the establishment of a dairy farm at Raugpur. I think these objects cannot be successfully attained without in the first place making provision for adequate and permanent pasture. To overlook it would mean failure, sure and certain. Moreover, from what I know—or rather knew at one time—I can safely say that pastures on scientific lines are bound to yield a fair return, and they will prove a profitable investment for the Government.

“ But we should not look at this important question only from the standpoint of returns. Once the success of permanent pastures is brought home to the millions in Bengal, I have no doubt private enterprise will be attracted

[Mr. Chakravarti; Mr. Kerr.]

towards them, and it will not only have the effect of improving the cattle and providing food for it throughout the land, but will open up a new channel for the employment of a large number of our youths who at present find great difficulty in finding suitable occupation for themselves, and are on that account discontented and dissatisfied not only with themselves but with everything and everybody. .

“Those are objects worth achieving, and financial considerations, although not to be overlooked, should not be allowed to stand in the way. On a perusal of the Government publications I find that the Agricultural Department since its start has been hampered for want of funds. Both Mr. Gourlay and the Hon'ble Mr. Cumming when in charge of the Agricultural Department complained about the inadequacy of the funds at their disposal to effect an improvement in the agricultural requirement of the country. I find that, out of the ordinary annual revenue of 5·74½ crores, the Government does not spend more than Rs. 4,00,000 annually on the requirements of this important department in which is included the not very kindred Department of Fisheries. Out of these 4 lakhs, nearly a lakh and-a-half goes towards the salaries of the superior officers and experts, about another lakh in the maintenance of the Veterinary College at Belgachia, and I have no doubt a fairly large amount in the maintenance of the Sabour College of Agriculture now in the province of Bihar and Orissa. If I am right in my estimate, and I believe I am, then what is left for the improvement of cattle and for other pressing requirements of agriculture. It must be an insignificant sum compared to the minimum requirements of agriculture in this Presidency. So far as I can make out, the Government could only allow the sums of Rs. 47,420 in 1910-11 and Rs. 37,230 in 1911-12 to specific agricultural purposes. And the present Financial Statement offers only a sum of Rs. 1,04,500 for purely agricultural requirements, in which is included the sum of nearly Rs. 60,000 for sericulture. Under these circumstances, I think the Government will be well advised to allot the sum of Rs. 5 lakhs out of the discretionary grant towards the objects mentioned in the resolution, so that the Agricultural Department will be enabled in the near future by starting about half a dozen pastures on scientific lines in different places to accomplish an object which is certainly one of the most important that can concern any Government, viz., the prosperity of the people committed to its care, by promoting their interests as they understand them, and which will further have the effect, above and beyond everything else, of conducing to the popularity of the Government with the teeming agricultural population of this province. That is a consummation devoutly to be wished for, and Government has at present the means to accomplish it. Let not this golden opportunity be thrown away. I therefore move the resolution standing in my name.”

The Hon'ble MR. KERR said :—

“Since I received notice of the Hon'ble Member's resolution on Saturday last, I have been racking my brains to discover how he proposed to spend 5 lakhs on converting a hundred acres of land into pasture. A hundred acres of suitable land could probably be acquired in most districts for something under Rs. 10,000. So practically what the resolution invites us to do is to spend Rs. 5,000 an acre in laying down land to permanent pasture on scientific lines. Now I have no doubt that for a good deal less than Rs. 5,000 an acre we could provide pasture lands which would enable us to rear as fine and fat a stock of cattle as any in the world, but a hundred acres would not give us more than 50 or 75 cattle at a time, and I fail to understand what good a demonstration costing Rs. 5,000 an acre would do to the ordinary cultivator who cannot afford to spend even Rs. 5 an acre on his scanty pasture land.

“It now appears that the Hon'ble Member's resolution does not really mean what it says, and that what he wants us to do is to spend 5 lakhs on setting apart a hundred acres in half a dozen places for pasture land. The Hon'ble Member complains that the budget is not particularly clear, but his own resolution is admittedly far from clear. If I understand his present proposal aright, we should have about Rs. 80,000 to spend in each district, and

[Mr. Kerr.]

should be able to devote about Rs. 800 an acre to the laying down of fodder crops. I am far from denying that a certain amount of good might possibly be done in this way, but the benefit would be very limited and the expenditure far out of proportion to any permanent results which could be expected. A few score cattle in each district would benefit, but the scheme would not touch thousands of other cattle in the district, for the ordinary raiyat could not be asked to spend Rs. 800 any more than Rs. 5,000 an acre on his pasture lands. The Hon'ble Member says pasture lands laid out on this scale would yield a fair return, but I have very grave doubts about this. In all schemes for agricultural development in this country it must be recollected that it is sheer waste of money to embark on projects which the ordinary cultivator cannot be expected to imitate. Government by lavish distribution of money in limited areas can produce magnificent results; but such results are useless unless they can be repeated by the millions of small cultivators in the country. It is for this reason that the experiments which have been made from time to time with fodder crops have not come to very much. The most Government can do is to point out a path which it is possible for the cultivator to follow. In matters relating to cattle breeding more especially it is useless to ask the Indian cultivator to follow methods which might be adopted by a capitalist cattle farmer in America.

"At the same time Government has sincere sympathy with the Hon'ble Member's apprehensions as to the growing dearth of grazing grounds in this province and also with his desire to find employment on the soil for his educated fellow countrymen. But a scheme which is economically unsound will never provide employment, and this problem of grazing is essentially an economic one, and as in the case of most economic problems the influence which Government can exert towards its solution is very limited. Waste land is being brought under cultivation simply because the development of the country makes it more profitable for the cultivator to grow crops on the land than to reserve it for grazing purposes. The sale of the crops puts money into his pocket, and he overlooks the deleterious effects on his cattle. It is, however, very difficult, if not impossible, for Government to find a remedy for this state of affairs. Government has no control over the extension of cultivation in ordinary private estates in this province, and legislation giving Government power to enforce the reservation of grazing lands would touch many vested interests and would be attended with grave difficulties, the seriousness which nobody will realise better than the Hon'ble Member who is himself a distinguished lawyer as well as a representative of the land-holders in this Council. The problem is indeed no new one, and the Hon'ble Member is mistaken in supposing that it has never engaged the attention of Government. It came under investigation more than twenty years ago, when Sir Charles Elliott summed up the situation in these words: 'Where fodder reserves are wanted, there is no spare land; and where there is land, no fodder reserves are wanted.' Measures to secure the proper feeding of cattle are in fact almost entirely in the hands of the owners of cattle themselves. It is probable that in time it will come to be realised in this country, as it has already been realised in other countries, which are more advanced from the agricultural point of view, that successful agriculture can only be practised if the farmer looks to the condition of his stock as well as to the growing of his crops. In other words mixed farming in some form or other will have to be adopted. Now mixed farming is one of the objects of the Rangpur scheme which I explained to the Council last week in introducing the agricultural head of the budget. It is hoped for a sum of about half a lakh of rupees to acquire a thousand bighas of land in Rangpur, and to equip it as a mixed farm for dairy and cattle breeding purposes as well as for the growing of ordinary crops. The dairy part of the scheme is expected to yield a profit, and the manure which will be obtained will improve the cultivation of ordinary crops. The scheme is intended to demonstrate to the cultivator that it pays to feed his cattle well and to improve them by careful selection in breeding. I do not claim by any means that the scheme is bound to be a success. There are many difficulties in the way, some of which have been foreseen and others no doubt will only arise

[Mr. Kerr ; Dr. D. P. Sarbadhikari.]

when the project gets into working order. But I do claim that the scheme is worth trying, and that it gives a greater promise of success than the proposal of the Hon'ble Member, in so much as if the Rangpur dairy farm is a success, there is nothing in it which cannot be adopted by the ordinary cultivator or by co-operative societies consisting of ordinary cultivators. I would submit, therefore, to the Council that we should await the results of the comparatively modest Rangpur scheme before adopting a roughly conceived and very expensive project such as that put forward by the Hon'ble Member. There is no fear of the question being lost sight of, but we should do more harm than good by rushing into hasty and unconsidered action. For these reasons, I must oppose the resolution, and perhaps in view of the explanation which has been given, the Hon'ble Member will be willing to withdraw it."

The resolution was then withdrawn.

#### *Expenditure—Head 22—Education.*

The Hon'ble DR. DEBA PRASAD SARBADHIKARI moved the following resolution :—

3. This Council recommends to the Governor in Council—

- (a) that a non-recurring grant of Rs. 24,000 be provided in the budget for the purpose of granting a special allowance to ten members of the Provincial Educational Service, pending the final consideration of the question of their pay and prospects ; and
- (b) that the said grant be met out of the non-recurring assignment for discretionary grants (Rs. 12,00,000) shown in page 2 of the amended Draft Financial Statement.

He said:—

"My Lord, this is a small remedial measure in regard to a somewhat long-standing question around which a great deal of hardship has clustered. For the removal of these hardships the question has often been ventilated in this Council, in the Press, and through individual memorials of officers concerned, and we are glad to know and feel that the sympathies of Government have right through been with the long-suffering deserving officers. The grievances of the members of the Provincial Educational Service as it is now constituted have often been admitted, and remedial schemes have been suggested from time to time. However, they have somehow or other failed right at the last moment, and the grievances have just continued on. Some time ago we understood that the Bengal Government had formulated a scheme which had the sanction of the Government of India, and that the Secretary of State had viewed it favourably, and orders were about to be passed. The Public Service Commission in the meantime was appointed, and according to a recent communique the Government of India finds it difficult, although it has some scheme ready, to give effect to the recommendations that had been decided on. We quite see and appreciate the difficulties of the position. The Public Service Commission has not been able to take up the question this year. They will probably take it up next year or the year after. Then there will be their report which will go before the Government of India and the Secretary of State, and delay is thus unavoidable. In the meantime, what these people have long been waiting for and have practically been promised will be deferred. I see there is no help for it. My resolution therefore asks that the more deserving senior officers should be given an acting allowance, as a sort of temporary solatium, pending the final determination of the larger question which the Public Service Commission go into. There are certain appointments in the Imperial Educational Service which have long been supposed to be ear-marked for members of the Provincial Educational Service, and these are the appointments to which we are looking forward for the promotion of deserving men from the Subordinate Service. The question is of the "King Charles' head" order, which



[Dr. D. P. Sarbadhikari.]

has been brought up and sent back often without any result. I have for the time being, therefore, asked that selected members should be given a small acting allowance, amounting to Rs. 24,000, which may well come out of the non-recurring discretionary grant of 12 lakhs of rupees. This sum may without serious objection, I think, be provided for the purpose of giving relief to some deserving officers, pending the determination of the larger question."

The Hon'ble Mr. KÜCHLER said :—

"My Lord, I may say at the outset that the Government is in full sympathy with any proposal to improve the status of the Provincial Educational Service. As the Hon'ble Member has himself indicated in the course of his remarks, a scheme for the permanent improvement of that service has long been under consideration. It had certainly been hoped that the proposals which were therein made would have come to fruition by this time. Unfortunately, the consideration of the whole question had to be postponed owing to the appointment of the Public Service Commission. That this was a good and sufficient reason for the postponement of the consideration must be admitted by everyone, and in some ways the fact that the whole question will come under examination by this Commission will be an advantage so far at least as the permanent reorganization of the service is concerned. It is much more likely I think that recommendations which are made by the Commission will be of a complete character, and that they will be carried out in their entirety than if the scheme which has been framed by the Bengal Government and considered by the Government of India had been given effect to. However, the members of the service who had long been looking forward to the attainment of their hopes have been bitterly disappointed by this postponement, and the question arises in what form relief should be given to them, at least to the more senior members on whom the hardship falls more nearly. The Government of India have themselves fully recognized the necessity for some measure of temporary relief, and, as is obvious, temporary relief can only take the form of personal allowances. As soon as it was decided that the Public Service Commission should be appointed to enquire into the conditions, not only of the Provincial Educational Service, but all the services in India, the Government of India came to the conclusion that it would be necessary to give relief to the members of the Provincial Educational Service by the institution of certain number of personal allowances. The matter therefore is at present under consideration. It may perhaps be already under the consideration of the Secretary of State. At any rate, I think that the Hon'ble Member will see the futility of asking this Council to pass a resolution which is only intended to effect what has already been done. It is true that the Hon'ble Member has given specific numbers in his resolution, but I think that the question of details in a matter of this kind must be left to the Executive authority, and the Hon'ble Member has himself implied this. He says that in assigning the number '10' he has only intended the maximum, and in the same way I presume with regard to the value of the individual allowances.

"I would ask, therefore, if the Hon'ble Member would not be satisfied by having this question ventilated in this Council, and whether he would be willing to withdraw the resolution. As a matter of fact, there is no possibility of its being accepted by the Council for other reasons. The Hon'ble Member has proposed to make what is in its nature a recurring grant, a charge on a non-recurring allotment. I need hardly say that this is financially impossible, and it would certainly not, even if recommended by Council, be accepted by the Financial Department. Secondly, he has also proposed that this grant should come out of what is called the discretionary grant. Well, unfortunately up to the present moment we are not at all aware as to what amount of discretion will be left to the Local Government in the apportionment of this grant, and that being so, it is clearly impossible for this Council to take out of that grant a sum of money for any specific purpose. On these grounds, my Lord, I very much regret that I must ask the Council to reject this resolution, unless the Hon'ble Member is prepared of his own accord to withdraw it."

[Mr. Kuchler.]

The Hon'ble Dr. DEBA PRASAD SARBADHIKARI said :—

"My Lord, if that which is described as discretionary is not really discretionary, as the remark of the Hon'ble Member opposite implies, the Council, or at least the outside members of the Council not 'in the know,' are perfectly helpless. The whole matter is, as I said, discretionary, and appositely enough I thought it might come out of the discretionary grant. As regards its non-recurring character, the reason why I chose that particular shape of grant was that the question was being considered by the Public Service Commission and by the time that we were contemplating another budget we might be able to frame a more definite scheme, and therefore for the time being a non-recurring grant might be useful. For another reason I am glad that I asked that the grant should be non-recurring. By reason of my defective legislative education, I ventured to bring up questions of certain recurring grants relating to the Judicial, Police, Executive and other services, and asked them to be paid out of the Free balance, which we are told can never be touched for purposes like these. For these reasons, my resolutions regarding the Excise, Police, Executive and Judicial and other services had to be ruled out of order. Therefore I am glad that this particular grant had the comparative good fortune of being non-recurring, as it gives me an opportunity of getting a very valuable piece of information which even wild horses could not drag out of the Hon'ble the Director of Public Instruction this morning. In these circumstances, I see the futility of pressing this resolution. As the question is before the Government, and pending the determination of the larger measure some of these long-suffering people whose woes have been admitted by my friend are likely to have some temporary relief of some shape or another, my purpose has been partially won, and in view of this fact, I see no use in pressing this motion. I accordingly beg to withdraw it."

The resolution was then withdrawn.

The Hon'ble Dr. DEBA PRASAD SARBADHIKARI moved the following Resolution :—

•4. This Council recommends to the Governor in Council—

(a) that a non-recurring additional grant of Rs. 10 lakhs be provided to enable the University of Calcutta—

- (i) to acquire the market to the south-east of the Senate House,
- (ii) to help in strengthening the colleges affiliated to it, and
- (iii) generally, to improve and promote University work ; and

(b) that the said grant be met out of the provision of Rs. 24,80,000 entered for expenditure during 1913-14 from the Imperial non-recurring educational grant of Rs. 75,00,000.

He said :—

"The grant of Rs. 10 lakhs asked for is in addition to the amount already provided in the Draft Financial Statement. Since it was presented in this Council, the Hon'ble Sir Harcourt Butler has announced that Rs. 8 lakhs are to be provided for the Calcutta University as a non-recurring grant, and Rs. 15 lakhs are to be provided for the Dacca University as a non-recurring grant, and Rs. 5 lakhs are to be granted to the Dacca University as a recurring grant. It is not open to us to discuss the merits of these grants, and I shall confine my observations to the scope of the Resolution, namely, the needs of the Calcutta University. In emphasizing these needs I put forward the claims of not only what is termed high education in a restricted sense, but of all education, chiefly primary and secondary, for those who firmly believe in filtration downwards in matters educational will not be able to persuade themselves that without a large body of trained men to take the place of teachers, such as sound

[Dr. D. P. Sarbadhikari]

University teaching alone can provide, you will not be able to do real and abiding service to the cause of primary and secondary education.

"I therefore invite Your Lordship's Government to supplement the benefactions of the Government of India, for as such we look upon the Rs. 8 lakhs, the gift of which to the Calcutta University has been announced by the Hon'ble Sir Harcourt Butler. If the Calcutta University is to do all the work that it had set to itself, the least that it can do it with would be a non-recurring grant of 32 lakhs and a recurring grant for the present of Rs. 45,000 a year, in addition to the grants already provided. A strong case was made out by the Hon'ble the Vice-Chancellor and the Syndicate in asking the Government of India for a sympathetic treatment of the case last December. The facts and the arguments then adduced hold good in a stronger manner to-day.

"Sir T. Palit has made to the University a princely gift of money and property of the aggregate value of nearly Rs. 15 lakhs for the purpose of founding a College of Science and for the general improvement of scientific and technical education. Welcome as the windfall might appear and undoubtedly is, it has added not a little to the difficulties of the University. Under the terms of the deed of gift, the University is bound to maintain, from the income of the endowment, a Chair of Physics and a Chair of Chemistry, and to institute a Science scholarship, the University is also bound to establish a laboratory for advanced teaching and research, and to contribute towards this object at least Rs. 2½ lakhs out of its own funds. But this sum is quite inadequate for the establishment of a laboratory of the kind contemplated. We are anxious that the fullest advantage should be taken of this unique opportunity of establishing a Residential College of Science in Calcutta, and if the necessary funds are available, the object can be speedily accomplished without any difficulty. The estimated cost of the project is Rs. 15 lakhs.

"The acquisition of the fish market situated to the south of the Senate House and east of the new University buildings is urgently needed for further extension of University buildings. There can also be no doubt that, from a sanitary point of view, the market ought not to be tolerated in its present place immediately to the north of the Medical College Hospital and to the east of the hostels for medical students and University law students. The University has definitely undertaken post-graduate teaching, and there can be no doubt that advanced teaching for M.A., M.Sc., Ph.D. and D.Sc. degrees—for which the time is fully ripe—must be concentrated in Calcutta, so far, at all events, as Western Bengal is concerned. The standard prescribed by the regulations for the degrees of Master and Doctor is too high, and adequate instruction in this respect cannot be expected to be imparted by private colleges, possibly not even by isolated Government colleges, which have to bear the burden of undergraduate teaching. Besides, the difficulty of securing the services of competent teachers for advanced instruction has been found to be so great that M.A. and M.Sc. instruction in several centres is beyond the range of practical politics. Even in Calcutta, the Presidency College, with an exceptionally strong teaching staff and up-to-date equipments, is able to provide for the post-graduate teaching of not more than a very limited number of students in selected groups out of six subjects for the M.A. and M.Sc. Examinations. The affiliation in Geology has not yet been accomplished owing to difficulties that are soon expected to be removed. The anomaly of the Sanskrit College being without M.A. affiliation in Sanskrit, to which I drew attention three years ago, still continues, and the University ought to do the work.

"Under these circumstances, it is not surprising that the arrangements made by the University for post-graduate study have met with striking success. At the present moment, there are over 500 students attending systematic courses of lectures on various M.A. subjects under University Lecturers appointed and paid by the University; and there is reason to believe that their number will substantially increase next session. If

[*Dr. D. P. Sarbadhikari; Mr Küchler.*]

this large body of post-graduate students is to be properly educated and kept under discipline, the question of lecture rooms, seminars and hostel accommodation at once urges itself upon our attention. If the site now occupied by the market were acquired for the University and a substantial grant made for the further extension of the University buildings, the need for which is keenly felt, the question of teaching and residence of post-graduate students would in a great measure be solved. It has been estimated that the acquisition of the market would cost Rs. 8 lakhs. and another Rs. 7 lakhs would be required for the proposed buildings. Proposals for the acquisition of the market have, from time to time, been discussed for several years past in the Bengal Legislative Council and elsewhere : meanwhile, the value of the property has rapidly increased, and further delay would mean further rise in value and payment of a heavier sum as compensation to the owner, unless my friend the Hon'ble Mr. Bompas takes it up as a part of his improvement scheme and makes a gift of it to the University. Immediate acquisition would, therefore, prove to be ultimately economical, since the fish market must be acquired, sooner or later, for educational if not sanitary purposes, situated as it is in the heart of a locality studded on all sides with handsome educational buildings.

"The completion of the University Law College Hostel buildings, towards the erection of which the Government of India have generously made a grant of Rs. 3 lakhs (the land having been acquired by the University for a lakh and a half out of its own funds), is also urgently needed. A grant of one lakh for furniture, fittings and appliances for the 175 students who will be in residence from June next, as well as for the extra cost of construction of the building, is necessary. The recent Government Resolution on Educational Institutions has more than a good word to say in praise of the good work which the Law College has been doing.

"The University Library cannot be properly strengthened for less than a lakh of rupees. And for three additional Chairs in Applied Mathematics, Modern History, and Comparative Philology, a recurring grant of Rs. 45,000 a year would be necessary, with which my present Resolution does not deal.

"The University is entitled to special consideration by reason of the determined and sustained effort it has hitherto successfully made to carry out loyally the reforms contemplated by the Indian Universities Act of 1904. It cannot be disputed that this University has achieved a high measure of success in its endeavour to undertake and promote higher teaching amidst enormous and growing difficulties, and all friends of education venture to express the hope that no Governments concerned will be reluctant to place adequate funds at their disposal to continue, and place on a wide and sound basis the work already begun. We realize of course that, having regard to the other demands, the whole of the needful sum cannot be provided this year. The Government of India has partially met the situation, and we invite your Lordship's Government to do the rest.

The Hon'ble Mr. KÜCHLER said :—

"My Lord, I think we shall all agree with the Hon'ble Member that the University of Calcutta is deserving of our deepest admiration for the work it has done in the past in the sphere of education, and it also deserves our fullest sympathy in the efforts which it is making to increase the scope of its work. I have been associated personally with the University of Calcutta for the past 25 years, and have taken a humble part in promoting the advance of education during that period. I am therefore the last man to ask that recognition should be withheld from the University for the good work which it has done, and I should also be extremely glad if I could assist in any way in securing further funds for the University to enable it to carry out the numerous projects which the Hon'ble Member has referred to in the course of his remarks. However, unfortunately, this is not the question which is before the Council. I am afraid here, again, finance is the stumbling block, and I am not sure whether my hon'ble friend has not got into a worse



[Mr. Kuchler ; Dr. D. P. Sarbadhikari.]

financial difficulty at the present occasion than he did in connection with the previous resolution. He has in the first place asked for an assignment of Rs. 10 lakhs out of the total non-recurring grant of Rs. 75 lakhs which has been made by the Government of India. Now, it is perfectly clear from the report of the budget speech in the Imperial Council that the whole of this Rs. 75 lakhs has been absolutely earmarked by the Government of India. The Hon'ble Member has himself told us that according to that earmarking Rs. 8 lakhs had been assigned to the University of Calcutta. I do not quite understand from the Hon'ble Member's remarks whether what he now wishes is an additional Rs. 2 lakhs in order to bring the grant of Rs. 8 lakhs up to Rs. 10 lakhs in all, which he originally desired, or whether he wishes Rs. 10 lakhs in addition to the Rs. 8 lakhs which the Government of India have given. In either case, the principle is the same. It is perfectly clear that we shall not get more, or rather that the University will not get more than Rs. 8 lakhs ; and as the total amount of the Rs. 75 lakhs has been definitely assigned for specific purposes, I do not think it is any use to ask the Council to pass a resolution giving any more than what has been determined on by the Government of India. Although personally, therefore, I should be very glad to see the University get a great deal more, I feel it incumbent upon me to ask the Council to reject this resolution. If the Hon'ble Member was content with Rs. 10 lakhs in the first place he probably would not cavil at the amount being reduced to Rs. 8 lakhs, because after all the additional Rs. 2 lakhs will not go very far towards carrying out the numerous projects to which he has referred. If the Hon'ble Member is prepared to accept this, although he has deprecated such a course on my part, I might again ask him to withdraw the resolution which he has now put forward with so much energy. As I have pointed out, there is no use asking for more than Rs. 8 lakhs ; and as the objects to which this grant of Rs. 8 lakhs is to be devoted practically coincide with the objects which the Hon'ble Member has himself enumerated, I think on that ground at least he has no cause to complain. It is indicated with sufficient clearness in the report of the budget debate in the Imperial Council that a greater portion of this grant is intended for the acquisition of a site for the extension of University buildings. I think it is extremely probable that the site which is here intended is the fish market to which he has referred. I fully agree with the Hon'ble Member that the fish market is a most offensive site, and the sooner it is acquired the better for the comfort of the Senators of the University, especially the Syndics, and the better also for the aesthetic appearance of the neighbourhood of College Square. The Hon'ble Member, as he has himself indicated in the course of his remarks, has often had cause to complain of the unsavoury proximity of this site to our meeting places in the University, and I would certainly rejoice with him if it were definitely decided that the money which has been granted by the Government of India is to be specifically assigned for the purpose of acquiring it."

The Hon'ble DR. DEBA PRASAD SARBADHIKARI said :—

" Having asked for Rs. 10 lakhs at the outset, and having got the not very unexpected windfall of Rs. 8 lakhs from Delhi, I cannot with any propriety ask for an additional Rs. 10 lakhs. If my hon'ble friend would be good enough to enter into a *Concordat* and give me the additional Rs. 2 lakhs for the present out of such funds as he can lay his hands on, the University may be able to get on for a time. My Lord, I begin to get very anxious and nervous when my friend is very sympathetic, and it strikes me now and again that a little more pronounced antipathy might further our views more than his sympathy does. Of course, it is no use asking for a thing that is sure to be denied, and like the old gentleman whose name is unaccountably believed to have been Hobson, my choice under the circumstances narrated by my "sympathetic" friend is limited to withdrawal or getting the resolution defeated. But as my friend has fully recognized the difficulties and the needs of the situation, and Your Excellency will soon be a personal witness to such needs, we hope that some means will be found to enable the University to carry on its very difficult and delicate work."

The resolution was then withdrawn.

[Dr. D. P. Sarbadhikari.]

The Hon'ble Dr. DEBA PRASAD SARBADHIKARI moved the following Resolution :—

5. This Council recommends to the Governor in Council—

(a) that the following non-recurring grants be provided in the Budget in addition to the sums shown in the Draft Financial Statement under the head 22—Education :—

(i) Primary	Education	...	...	1 lakh,
(ii) Secondary	ditto	.	...	2 lakhs,
(iii) Female	ditto	...	...	1 lakh,
(iv) Technical	ditto	...	..	50 thousand,
(v) European	ditto	...	...	20 „
(vi) Muhammadan	ditto	...	...	50 „
(vii) Hostels		...	...	1 lakh
(viii) Training of Teachers		..	...	2 lakhs,
(ix) Moral Education		...	...	50 thousand ; and

(b) that the said grant be met out of the provision of Rs. 24,80,000 entered for expenditure, during 1913-14, from the Imperial non-recurring Educational grant of Rs. 75,00,000.

He said :—

“The case of the different heads for which I suggest larger grants has been strongly made out in the Hon'ble Mr. Kuchler's striking and exhaustive speech in introducing the items of expenditure in Council last week. The whole-hearted devotion with which the Hon'ble Mr. Kuchler applied himself to his difficult work deservedly won high approbation of all who had any idea of the work, and his difficulties were considerably added to since the recent territorial distribution, in a way that would have taxed the patience of a less strong and capable man. Of this he gave but a passing indication in his opening speech, and we must, in our reasoned imagination, fill in the rest of the picture. Those who know his work and his difficulties must be very sorry to lose him at this most critical stage of the educational history of the province, and our regret must be keener than ordinary, because he will not have the piloting of our affairs in comparatively calmer waters and with augmented resources—for which larger resources we are supremely thankful to the Government of India. Our best wishes will follow him in his retirement, and whoever succeeds him in his delicate and difficult task will have reason to be thankful if he can lay down his office amidst as much approbation as the Hon'ble Mr. Kuchler will be doing. His accession to office helped in pouring oil over troubled waters in the service, for he got back to the service what the service justly regarded as its own—the Directorate of the service. It will be no help to the service or to the cause of Education if, for any reason, the waters were again to be similarly troubled. It would be no help to the proper recruiting and manning of the service, if it was to be known abroad that undoubted and admitted claims of deserving members of the service were apt to be sacrificed for no potent and patent reasons. And the utter worthlessness of the service cannot be better demonstrated than by no one being found worthy of directing it. The Hon'ble Mr. Kuchler's tenure of the Directorate will be remembered and remarkable as a turning point in this respect and many others.

Under all the heads referred to in my resolution, young Twist is abroad with his annual cry, the Budget provision is too little and increase is necessary all round. Government readily recognizes the justice of the demand—more readily than it used to do in the near past, and fortunately for us its capacity and willingness to help are yearly augmenting. Expansion in all directions and of all descriptions is urgently needed, as the Hon'ble Mr. Kuchler has detailed ; the chief of our present needs is the improvement of sound secondary education, for we must admit that more than the first step

[Dr. D. P. Sarbadhikari.]

towards betterment of University education has been taken. The field of recruitment must be improved immediately, and our matriculates have to be immediately and vastly better strengthened if University work is to progress all along the line. Unless secondary education is thoroughly well grounded, and unless particularly the private schools, the life history of many of which is a perfect tragedy, are materially assisted, proper University education will be impossible. My observations have nearly equal application to our girls, for whose improved education much remains to be done, and the basis of education has to be considerably expanded for the merely intellectual basis pursued so far is felt to be too cramped and ineffective. A Government Committee has been appointed to investigate the question of female education, and another has already investigated the question of moral education. The provision I ask for under these heads will be none too extravagant for a great deal of work that requires to be done immediately. Mr. Gould, the agent and demonstrator of the Moral Education League of London, whose methods had complete sanction of the recent International Moral Education Congress at Hague, was invited by the Government of Bombay, and he gave useful assistance to the Government in regard to the work begun there. I ventured to bring his work to the notice of your Excellency's Government, and the Hon'ble Mr. Kuchler and the Hon'ble Mr. Nathan, who is on special duty with regard to certain educational questions, were good enough to invite him to come, but he could not do so on account of his other engagements. As the Government has been good enough to extend this recognition to the work of the League, it is to be hoped that Mr. Gould, or some one else in his place, will be able soon to come and help our work. As regards female education, we are ahead or behind the suffragette movement and are in a position to, and do, demand the fullest measures. Paucity or incompleteness of schemes can be no plea to these or the other demands included in the resolution. Our chief difficulty is about the training of teachers, and the work that is being done in our training colleges and schools has to be augmented in a manner much in advance of what the Hon'ble Mr. Kuchler has foreshadowed. The hostel grant of previous years has, to a certain extent, been indirectly impaired by the University Institute grant, and this I seek to get repaired by another lakh of rupees being added to what has been provided. We are supremely thankful to Your Lordship's Government for the very material assistance that is to be given to that highly useful and promising institution, the University Institute, and we can never forget Your Lordship's services and those of the Hon'ble Sir William Duke, the Hon'ble Mr. Cumming, the Hon'ble Mr. Kuchler and Mr. Gourlay in this concern. In this connection, though not immediately arising of it, we have to express our obligations that the Sahitya Parishad has been conceded some recognition in the Budget, though too little by itself, it will help much in securing enlarged public support. Assembled *literati* of Bengal at Chittagong next week will not fail, I am sure, to take note of and be grateful for this recognition. And what to them will be a greater pleasure, will be to know that in Your Lordship they have a devoted though yet a finished votary of their dearly loved Vernacular, the purity of which they are trying to, and will try to, maintain against threatened inroads. The claims of Muhammadan education at Dacca have been largely recognized, but Muhammadans outside Dacca are quite large in number and importance, and special treatment is undoubtedly necessary to meet their educational requirements. The eloquent words of the Hon'ble the Vice-Chancellor of the Calcutta University at the recent Mohsin Centenary at Hooghly remind us that, but for the vast beneficence of that Prince of men, Muhammadan education of the province would have lagged behind still more. Thanks to that benefaction and continued special treatment, for which I have always advocated, Muhammadan education is making appreciable advance, and, in the satisfactory and promising stage that it has arrived at, it is but meet that some more help should be given. As the Hon'ble Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur, and the Hon'ble Mr. Abul Kasem have got special resolutions on the subject, it is needless for me to retrace at length grounds that, on previous occasions, I have often taken before the Council. And having regard to the Hon'ble Dr. Nilratan Sarkar's resolution on Female Education, I have

[Dr. D. P. Sarbadhikari; Mr. Kuchler.]

left it to him to elaborate the details of this important problem. The principles of all our resolutions are the same. The details are for Your Excellency's Government to determine. For the proper educational advance of the province it is of supreme importance that all communal interests should be duly correlated, and we feel that the European education question is daily becoming more acute. For the benefit of the community as a whole, it is of the utmost importance that greater public attention should be given to it, for the community itself has undoubtedly done much in this direction. It is of importance that the claims of education should not be under-rated by the domiciled community, and that half-educated people should not get into positions of power and trust and abuse them. They have so far been quick in occupying the field of technical education, such as is given in docks and workshops. It is of importance that the basis of education should be materially strengthened.

"Technical education is daily becoming more popular in Bengal, and a special officer is now attached to the office of the Director of Public Instruction to help in the spread of this work. His hands have to be strengthened, towards which a small extra grant would be a great help.

"And last comes primary education, though first in my list in the resolution. The recent resolution of the Government of India makes it abundantly clear that, though legislation for promoting primary education has been dis-countenanced, for reasons that will appeal to some as satisfactory, the claims of primary education, upon which His Gracious Majesty the King-Emperor laid deserved stress, will not be neglected or overlooked. The field is vast; the resources are limited. Though fairly large grants have been provided, a little more within the allowable limits would be distinctly welcome.

"These are all well-trodden grounds, regarding which it would be no economy of time to labour. The claims under all these items are conceded, both in the resolution of the Government of India in its bewildering diversity, as well as in the Hon'ble Mr Kuchler's speech. I plead for a little more liberal treatment of the situation. The difficulties about ear-marking by the Government of India ought to disappear on suitable representation."

The Hon'ble MR. KÜCHLER said :—

"I have to thank my hon'ble friend for the friendly remarks which he has made with regard to my work as Director of Public Instruction. My only regret is that, in the face of those encomiums, I have again to oppose the resolution which has been put forward by the Hon'ble Member. But it is not that I am out of sympathy with him, though I hesitate to use this word after what has fallen from him in connection with the previous resolution. It is not that I am out of sympathy with him, but it is purely on technical grounds. As will have been seen from the Budget report of the Government of India, the Imperial grants, as I have already pointed out, have been ear-marked for specific branches of Education, though it has not been announced as yet what assignments under these heads will be given to Bengal. I might just briefly, for the sake of convenience, refer to the totals which are contained in the report of the Budget proceedings. In the first place a grant of Rs. 67 lakhs has been made for hostels. A grant of Rs. 48 lakhs has been made for Universities. This, of course, is for the whole of India. For colleges and secondary schools including training institutions, there is an allotment of Rs. 35 lakhs. Then, again, the Government of India have given Rs. 25 lakhs towards the claims of training institutions, educational, hygiene, gymnasia, play-grounds, swimming baths, reading-rooms, gardens, common rooms, etc. For manual instruction Rs. 7 lakhs have been given, and for girls' schools, technical and special schools, Rs. 25 lakhs, and lastly for European education Rs. 20 lakhs. If we take the recurring grant of Rs. 55 lakhs, Rs. 6 lakhs are being held in reserve, and of the remaining Rs. 49 lakhs, Rs. 6½ lakhs are given to Universities. Rs. 20 lakhs for primary education, Rs. 5 lakhs for girls' education, Rs. 3 lakhs for colleges and training institutions, Rs. 9 lakhs for secondary and



[Mr. Küchler; Dr. D. P. Sarbadhikari; the President.]

Rs. 1½ for technical and special education, Rs. 1 lakh for manual training, and Rs. 3 lakhs for European education.

"It will be obvious from what I have read out here that the grants of the Government of India cover practically all the objects which are enumerated in the Hon'ble Member's list, so that it is only a question of how these grants are to be divided.

"It is clear, from the magnitude of the grants which is indicated in the Government of India's announcement, that a far more liberal allotment, if we take the whole of the allotment, will be made than that which is now proposed by the Hon'ble Member, so that I do not think that the Hon'ble Member, in view of these circumstances, should actually press for a smaller allotment than we are likely to get according to the instructions of the Government of India. In any case, I think it is highly objectionable to have a meticulous division made in the Council of a grant of this kind, and a meticulous assignment to individual heads. Such a division would necessarily be embarrassing the Government. For instance, if one lakh is given to one head, it might be found later on that it would be wise to spend Rs. 1½ or Rs. 2 lakhs. I do not think, therefore, that it is advisable or expedient that this Council should definitely, on the information which is at present before it, which practically amounts to very little, make a new division of the grant such as the Hon'ble Member has suggested. Nor, as I have pointed out, is this necessary, in view of the fact that the actual assignments by the Government of India are almost sure to be on a more liberal scale than those which he has himself proposed. I am reluctant to use the old formula, and to ask the Hon'ble Member to withdraw, but at the same time I am perfectly certain that it must have been brought home to him, by what I have now said, that he would have absolutely nothing to lose by withdrawal and everything to gain, and therefore I now make this proposal with more confidence than I did on the former occasion."

The Hon'ble Dr. DEBA PRASAD SABADHIKARI said —

"My Lord, we are not often accused of modesty, but in this case I have been, and I plead guilty. But 'sub-heads of division' are no discovery of my own, however ingeniously I may be inclined. I have simply improved upon the headings which were furnished by my hon'ble friend and I asked for more.

"However, my Lord, if by not asking for more I am likely to get more, having regard to the very persuasive way in which my friend has couched his reasons for withdrawal, I readily withdraw. In doing so, I do not however withdraw the words of encomium which were not a part of what has unfortunately struck my friend as a bargain. In the domains of education at all events, we are not 'petty traders,' and what I have given in this regard I have given freely, though often and bitterly have my friend and I fought on either side of the house here as elsewhere. I wish him god-speed and much better engagement in the retirement to which he will soon be going."

The resolution was then withdrawn.

The PRESIDENT said :—

"I wish to make a statement. We are going through the business fairly rapidly. I should now naturally call upon the mover of the next resolution, but I understand that for certain reasons it will be more convenient if Resolutions 6, 9 and 10 were taken one after the other, and this may take rather longer to discuss than you would care to sit to-day. I shall therefore call on Hon'ble Dr. Nilratan Sarkar to move the Resolution which stands in his name, and I understand that it will be in consonance with the views of Hon'ble Members that after this Resolution is dealt with, we should adjourn till to-morrow."

[Dr. Nilratan Sarkar<sup>5</sup>; Mr. Kuchler.]

The Hon'ble DR. NILRATAN SARKAR moved the following Resolution:—

7. This Council recommends to the Governor in Council—

- (a) that special facilities be provided for the education of the depressed classes, principally at the primary stages, by opening ordinary *patshalas* and schools and establishing night schools, wherever necessary; and that a sum of Rs. 5,00,000 be earmarked for the purpose;
- (b) that special accommodation be provided for students of the above-mentioned classes, wherever necessary, in hostels attached to secondary schools or colleges, and that special stipends, scholarships or prizes be offered to students belonging to such classes; and
- (c) that the expenditure which may be incurred for the purpose of giving effect to the above proposals be provided from the lump sum grants made by the Government of India under the head of "Education."

He said :—

"My Lord, it is generally admitted that among the primary rights of citizenship in a civilized State, is the right to receive education. This right supposes a corresponding duty on the part of the State to provide education to its people, and the obligation is all the greater when the people are inarticulate and helpless and cannot, therefore, secure what is but their due.

"It is for such a voiceless and unprogressive section of our people that I plead in this Council. Apart from any other consideration, it is their backwardness that constitutes their first and foremost claim to special treatment at the hands of your Lordship's Government.

"On a modest computation the submerged population that represents the social outcasts of Bengal are about 65 lakhs, or one-seventh of the total population of the Presidency. This large number cannot be said to have any recognized status in society, and only a little over three *per cent.* are literate. Most of them live in a state of chronic poverty, and this, coupled with the serious social disabilities under which they labour, militates against their availing of the existing arrangements for popular education. The schools which are suited to the requirements of the more prosperous and advanced sections of the people, cannot be equally well utilized by the poorer and backward classes, most of whom have to toil for their bread during the day time, and on whom, moreover, the social ban of ostracism sometimes operates too harshly even in schools. These social difficulties become insuperable in hostels, where the members of the so-called lower castes are very seldom the recipient of considerate treatment at the hands of the boys of the higher castes.

"It is education alone that can elevate the social status of the depressed classes. And as Government has of late in a manner committed itself, very properly as I should say, to a policy of affording special facilities in matters of education to comparatively non-progressive sections, it is to be hoped that it will not grudge this boon to the backward communities of Bengal.

"I feel the importance of the question very strongly, as I believe that no nation or race can ever make any real progress when a considerable section of it is left behind."

The Hon'ble MR. KÜCHLER said :—

"Government has been long alive to the necessity of making some provision for the education of what are called depressed classes. I presume that what the Hon'ble Member intends by this term are the classes that belong to

[Mr. Küchler.]

the very lowest classes of the Hindu social system or are outside the pale of caste altogether, though I must say that in one part of his speech he seems to identify these classes merely with the poorer and backward classes of the community which of course is a much wider term indeed. The problem of dealing with the depressed classes is admittedly a very difficult one. It is not merely a question of poverty, because poverty is not altogether peculiar to the depressed classes, but is shared by a large portion of the general community, and poverty as a matter of fact is not always present in the depressed classes. It is more a question of social ostracism against which they have to contend, and of their general indifference to education altogether. I do not agree, however, with the Hon'ble Member when he contends that there is a very great difficulty in the matter of admission of boys of the depressed classes to the primary schools. This has not been my experience in Bengal. The method that we have adopted in Bengal to attract pupils of these classes is either to admit them free or give a capitation grant to the individual gurus, and we have found these methods fairly successful. At the same time, in localities where these classes happened to be settled in fairly large numbers, it has also been our policy to open special schools. I must, therefore, oppose the first part of the Hon'ble Member's resolution, viz., that which is included in section (a), and I must also oppose it on other grounds. As usual, the grounds are financial. The Hon'ble Member has asked for a specific allotment. Now in the first place this allotment does not err on the side of modesty, which was the fault that I had to find with the Hon'ble Dr. Sarbadhikari's resolution, but errs on the other side altogether. If the Hon'ble Member will take a note of the amounts which have been assigned by the Government of India to primary education throughout the whole country, he will see that he proposes to take practically the whole of the amount for the education of the depressed classes, if we make a reasonable calculation as to what particular proportion of the whole grant will come to Bengal. I had already indicated in my speech on the Financial Statement that it had been hoped out of Rs. 9 lakhs grant to make provision for the opening of special schools not for the depressed classes only, but for the backward classes and in backward areas. I also indicated there that, though it had not been found possible to make the nine lakhs go far enough for the purpose, the new grants which we were receiving from the Government of India would enable Government to carry out its avowed policy in this respect. I am able to satisfy the Hon'ble Member to this extent that we shall go as far as we possibly can with the funds at our disposal to provide for facilities for the education of the depressed classes; but it is impossible to accept this resolution which mentions a distinct allotment.

"The same objection, however, does not apply to the second part of this resolution, in that the Hon'ble mover is fortunate enough to escape the pitfall of which other Members have been victims—of mentioning specific assignments, and there is no doubt that the question to which he calls attention in this part of the resolution is one which requires urgent treatment. The great difficulty that the members of the depressed classes experience in utilizing the facilities for education which are open to the whole community is in the matter of hostel accommodation. It is perfectly certain that, in the case of these classes, it is necessary to provide separate hostels, and certain steps have already been taken in this direction, especially in Eastern Bengal. A hostel for 36 Namasudra boys has been built at Jhalakati in the district of Bakarganj. At Pirojpur, in the same district, a Namasudra hostel for 20 boys will be built next year. It is also proposed to erect two other hostels next year, viz., a Rajbansi hostel for 32 boys at Rangpur, and a Yogi hostel for 20 boys at Chittagong. A proposal is under the consideration of the department to form Namasudra hostels at Barisal, Faridpur and Dacca. There is a Mahisya hostel at Dacca, which receives a monthly grant not exceeding Rs. 30. It will be seen from these that Government is already taking steps to provide proper hostel accommodation for boys belonging to the depressed classes. This policy will, of course, be extended with the help of the funds which are now placed at our disposal.

[*Babu Surendra Nath Banerjee; Mr. Küchler; Dr. Nilratan Sarkar.*]

"In exactly the same way special scholarships are now given\* not expressly for the depressed classes but for a much wider range of boys who are included in what are called the backward classes. These scholarships are open to the depressed classes as well. There is no doubt that if we had more funds at our disposal, we could do a great deal more in this direction, as we are enabled by the generosity of the Government of India to spend more on education than has been possible in former years. There is not the slightest doubt the Government of India will consent to the allotment of a considerable portion of the Imperial grant for this purpose. The Government is, therefore, quite willing to accept the second and third parts of the resolution, but I would ask the Hon'ble Member, in view of what I have said, to withdraw the first part of his resolution."

The Hon'ble BABU SURENDRA NATH BANERJEE said :—

"May I put a question to the Hon'ble the Director of Public Instruction in connection with the hostel accommodation for the Namasudra boys? The Hon'ble Member has referred to the hostels being established at Chittagong and some other places in Eastern Bengal. But there is a considerable number of Namasudra boys in Calcutta, and, speaking from my own personal experience, we have had very considerable difficulty in getting hostel accommodation for Namasudra boys in Calcutta, and we have been obliged to put them here and there. We had to contend against considerable difficulties. Will the Hon'ble Member be pleased to consider the desirability of attending hostel accommodation for Namasudra boys in the town of Calcutta as part of the general scheme which he has been good enough to sketch."

The Hon'ble MR. KÜCHLER said :—

"There would be no objection to that being done provided the conditions which are to be attached to the Government of India grant permit us to extend these hostels to Calcutta."

\*The Hon'ble BABU SURENDRA NATH BANERJEE said :—

"I beg to thank the Hon'ble Member for his kind assurance. I will give him a list of the Namasudra boys in the Calcutta colleges and schools."

The Hon'ble MR. KÜCHLER said :—

"I am afraid I shall not be of much help, as my term will expire in a short time. But I am sure the adjudication will be carried out by my successor."

The Hon'ble DR. NILRATAN SARKAR said :—

"My Lord, I am obliged to the Hon'ble Mr. Küchler for his sympathetic attitude, and I hope he will transmit it to his successor before he leaves Calcutta. I readily withdraw the first part of my resolution, and I beg to express my gratitude to the Hon'ble Member for his kind acceptance of the latter part."

The resolution was then put to the vote in the following form and carried :—

This Council recommends to the Governor in Council—

- (a) that special accommodation be provided for students of the depressed classes, wherever necessary, in hostels attached to secondary schools or Colleges, and that special stipends, scholarships or prizes be offered to students belonging to such classes ;  
and

[*Dr. Nilratan Sarkar.*]

- (b) that the expenditure which may be incurred for the purpose of giving effect to the above proposals be provided from the lump sum grants made by the Government of India under the head of "Education."

The Council was then adjourned to Friday, the 14th March, 1913, at 11 A.M.

CALCUTTA,

F. G. WIGLEY,

*The 22nd March, 1913.*

*Secy. to the Bengal Legislative Council.*

*Abstract of the Proceedings of the Bengal Legislative Council assembled under the provisions of the Indian Councils Acts, 1861, 1892, and 1909, and the Government of India Act, 1912.*

---

THE Council met in the Council Chamber in Government House on Friday, the 14th March, 1913, at 11 A.M.

**Present :**

His Excellency the Right Hon'ble THOMAS DAVID, BARON CARMICHAEL OF SKIRLING, G.C.I.E., K.C.M.G., *Governor of the Presidency of Fort William in Bengal, presiding.*

The Hon'ble SIR FREDERICK WILLIAM DUKE, K.C.I.E., C.S.I., *Vice-President.*

The Hon'ble MR. P. C. LYON, C.S.I.

The Hon'ble NAWAB SYED SHAMS-UL-HUDA.

The Hon'ble MR. E. W. COLLIN.

The Hon'ble MR. J. G. CUMMING, C.I.E.

The Hon'ble MR. C. J. STEVENSON-MOORE, C.V.O.

The Hon'ble MR. N. D. BEATSON BELL, C.I.E.

The Hon'ble MR. B. K. FINNIMORE.

The Hon'ble MR. J. H. KERR, C.I.E.

The Hon'ble MR. H. L. STEPHENSON.

The Hon'ble MR. B. B. NEWBOULD.

The Hon'ble MR. J. DONALD.

The Hon'ble MR. S. L. MADDOX, C.S.I.

The Hon'ble MR. G. W. KÜCHLER, C.I.E.

The Hon'ble RAI PRIYA NATH MUKARJI BAHADUR.

The Hon'ble SIR FREDERICK LOCH HALLIDAY, KT., C.I.E., M.V.O.

The Hon'ble SIR FREDERICK GEORGE DUMAYNE, KT.

The Hon'ble MR. S. P. SINHA.

The Hon'ble DR. NILRATAN SARKAR.

The Hon'ble MR. R. GLEN.

The Hon'ble MR. BYOMKES CHAKRAVARTI.

The Hon'ble SIR BIJAY CHAND MAHTAB, K.C.S.I., K.C.I.E., I.O.M., *Maharajahdhiraja Bahadur of BURDWAN.*

The Hon'ble MAHARAJA JAGADINDRA NATH RAY.

[*Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur.*]

The Hon'ble RAJA SHOSHI KANTA ACHARYYA CHAUDHURI BAHADUR.

The Hon'ble DR. DEBA PRASAD SARBADHIKARI.

The Hon'ble MR. J. G. APCAR.

The Hon'ble RAI RADHA CHARAN PAL BAHADUR.

The Hon'ble MR. NORMAN McLEOD.

The Hon'ble MR. J. C. SHORROCK.

The Hon'ble MR. W. T. GRICE.

The Hon'ble MR. V. WOODS.

The Hon'ble MR. A. W. C. CHAPLIN.

The Hon'ble MR. GOLAM HOSSEIN CASSIM ARIFF.

The Hon'ble MAULVI ABUL KASEM.

The Hon'ble NAWAB SAIYID HOSSAM HAIDER CHAUDHURI KHAN BAHADUR.

The Hon'ble MAHARAJA RANAJIT SINHA of Nashipur.

The Hon'ble RAI NALINAKSHA BASU BAHADUR.

The Hon'ble RAJA MAHENDRA RANJAN RAY CHAUDHURI.

The Hon'ble NAWAB SAIYID, NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, KHAN BAHADUR.

The Hon'ble BABU PRASANNA KUMAR RAY.

The Hon'ble BABU SURENDRA NATH BANERJI.

The Hon'ble BABU SURENRA NATH RAY.

The Hon'ble BABU MAHENDRA NATH RAY.

The Hon'ble RAI HARI MOHAN CHANDRA BAHADUR.

The Hon'ble BABU ANANDA CHANDRA RAY.

The Hon'ble BABU UPENDRA LAL RAY.

#### THE REVISED FINANCIAL STATEMENT, 1913-14.

THE HON'BLE Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur, moved the following resolution :—

This Council recommends to the Governor in Council—

(a) that a substantial sum out of the provision of Rs. 24,80,000 entered for expenditure during 1913-14 from the Imperial non-recurring Educational grant of Rs. 75,00,000 be applied—

(i) towards providing better facilities for the education of Muhammadan boys in existing colleges, schools and madrasas. and

(ii) towards starting new educational institutions with similar facilities in centres of Muhammadan population ; and

(b) that a fair and reasonable amount out of the recurring educational grant (Rs. 13,20,000) be appropriated in that behalf.



[*Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur.*]

He said :—

“ MY LORD,

It is with a sense of gratitude that I express my thanks to the Government for the very substantial recognition of the prior claims of education in the Presidency. Throughout the Presidency if there is any feeling above all, it is that of genuine appreciation for the large provision in the Educational Budget of the coming year. Nobody more sincerely wishes it than myself that with this provision, better facilities for education will be provided for the people. the educational machineries of the State will be largely strengthened and permanent improvements will be made in all directions. It is the duty of all of us to offer help in this cause, and my object in moving the resolution now before the Council is merely by way of still more furthering it, so that the benefits may penetrate deeper and deeper to reach all sections of the people. Past experience will instruct us that it is possible that a section of the people will not get full and proportionate advantage which the Government offers to all. If on the judgment of facts it is accepted that a portion could not and cannot take its share in the educational advantages, the legislature and the executive should co-operate to find a remedy for it.

“ I confess I speak this with not a little grief, that after more than half a century, during which time the Government has been making such strenuous efforts to spread the light of Western knowledge and culture all over the country, the Muhammadans have not yet been able to bring themselves up to the normal level. In spite of the fact that all the enlightenment and life-giving forces, which have followed British rule, have concentrated in Bengal, they have not been able to take full advantage of the greatest blessing of the British rule. Is it not lamentable to consider that a large section of the people is still plunged in ignorance after half a century of vigorous efforts to forward the work of education? My Lord, it is idle to lay the blame on one party or the other. We cannot ignore facts as they are and must find some solution of the problem, however complicated it may be.

“ My Lord, this all-embracing question should not be postponed for long. Better facilities must be given to the Muhammadans if we want the Muhammadans to prosper. We do not desire the Government to depart from its recognised principle. We are not wanting anything new. All authorities have constantly pressed the claims of Muhammadan Education for special consideration. The Education Commission, the most representative body that ever investigated the entire problem of education in India, after making a careful and exhaustive enquiry into the subject, clearly grasped the situation and formulated the following recommendations for the encouragement of Muhammadan Education :—

1. That the special encouragement of Muhammadan Education be regarded as a legitimate charge on Local, Municipal and Provincial Funds.

2. That indigenous Muhammadan schools be liberally encouraged to add purely secular subjects to their course of instruction.

3. That in localities where Muhammadans form a fair proportion of the population, provision be made in middle and high schools, maintained from Public Funds, for imparting instructions in the Hindustani and the Persian languages.

4. That higher education for Muhammadans, being the kind of education in which that community needs special help, be liberally encouraged.

5. That where necessary, a graduated system of special scholarships for Muhammadans be established to be awarded (a) in primary schools and tenable in middle schools, (b) in middle schools and tenable in high schools, (c) on the result of the Matriculation and the First Arts Examination and tenable in colleges.

6. That in all classes of schools, maintained from public funds, a certain proportion of free studentships be expressly reserved for Muhammadan students.

[*Nawab Sayid Nawab Ali Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur.*]

the fact that the educational expenses are very high in the professional and technical lines and Muhammadan students are mostly poor.

"In secondary and primary schools, though the percentage of Muhammadan students is a little hopeful in the lower classes, yet it strikes every cautious mind to find that in the higher classes the number gradually dwindles down—a fact which has been noted by successive Directors. It is high time that we must devise adequate means to remedy this state of affairs or else the future will be very gloomy.

"My Lord, I have said that the new regulations of the University, which have put restrictions in the number of admission into all educational institutions, have caused great hardships in the way of Muhammadan students. I do not for a moment mean that the new regulations are not beneficial or not desirable. They are necessities of efficiency in education; but if, along with it, we do not start more institutions, it would cause disaster to the community. It is therefore incumbent on the Government that in centres of Muhammadan population, new educational institutions should be immediately started with better facilities for Muhammadans, if Muhammadan Education is not to starve in these places. We must at the same time offer better facilities to Muhammadans in the existing institutions. It is notorious that Muhammadan students are not attracted to aided and private institutions owing to want of provision for teaching Persian and Arabic, and we must liberally strengthen the hands of the school authorities that they may appoint Persian and Arabic teachers to attract Muhammadan students thereto.

"My Lord, I am conscious of the fact that the only effort that is likely to succeed is ultimately that of people themselves. But the present practice of asking the public to defray two-thirds of the expenses in establishing educational institutions has not the desirable result among the Muhammadans, and I believe, it is high time that the practice should be changed for a better one.

"My Lord, without trespassing into the domain of controversial politics, I hope I will be pardoned if I make a passing reference to the inestimable blessing that the Government of Eastern Bengal and Assam brought to the people of that portion of the Presidency, where the Muhammadans form the majority of the population. Throughout the land there were signs of new life and vigour as the outcome of educational overhauling that underwent therein. No language can be more glowing than the words of Lord Hardinge himself when His Excellency bore eloquent tribute to the good work done in matters educational by the Government of Eastern Bengal and Assam. In reply to the Dacca University deputation, His Excellency said that since 1906 the Province made great strides forward. "In that year there were 1698 collegiate students in Eastern Bengal and Assam and the expenditure on collegiate education was Rs. 1,54,358. To-day with the same number of institutions the corresponding figures are 2,580 students and Rs. 3,83,619. Nor has the improvement been confined to colleges. Educational courses and schemes were formed with reference to local conditions. From 1905-11, the number of pupils in public schools rose from 699,051 to 936,653, and the expenditure rose from Rs. 11,96,510 to Rs. 22,05,330, while the local expenditure direct and indirect rose from Rs. 47,91,833 to Rs. 73,05,260."

"My Lord, the Muhammadans, who form the majority of the population, consequently received an increased attention and the number of Muhammadan scholars rose from 368,396 males in 1905-06 to 460,768 in 1908-09, and from 29,974 to 60,999 females. In spite of the fact that there were such rapid strides, the want was only partially met; and year after year the Muhammadans had to ask for a more adequate recognition of the demand. My Lord, is it not only natural that the Muhammadans would now urge for forwarding the work already begun? Throughout the Presidency, there remains the same demand, the same necessity still exists. I would say that the necessity is increasing day by day, and I hope the Government will not turn a deaf ear to the persistent demand on the part of the Muhammadans.

[Mr. Kuchler.]

"I have said enough as to the necessity of accepting the resolution before us. It is not in violation of the recognised principle and policy of the Government. Government spends a large amount specially for European education in Bengal and between 1899 and 1909, about thirty-five lacs of rupees have been devoted for the purpose from the Provincial Fund. But my resolution merely wants new educational institutions in centres of Muhammadan population. It wants grant of money to bring about reforms in the existing Madrasas and Maktabas and to start new ones wherever there seems to be any demand. It demands facilities in the shape of hostels, stipends, new colleges, schools, remission of fees and in such other ways as the Government may think it proper and necessary

"In asking for this I need not make any apology. It is so little to give and so much to receive that I hope the Government will be pleased to accept it. My Lord, of late there has been much talk of special treatment and special privileges. We do not want here any such thing. We do not want that the Government should educate us more than others. We do not want to enjoy the loaves and fishes of anything. But, my Lord, we have a right to have ourselves educated as much as others. If the existing organisation and arrangement cannot educate us, we have a right to ask for adjusting the machineries in accordance with our needs. That is never a special treatment. Change of method is not the change of principle.

"My Lord, a new era has begun in Indian life and thought. His Majesty the King-Emperor has sent to all the message of Hope. The words in the gracious reply of His Imperial Majesty the King-Emperor in response to the address presented by the University of Calcutta are still ringing in our ears. They are inscribed in letters of gold in every Indian mind. His Imperial Majesty says to us:— "Six years ago I sent from England to India a message of sympathy. To-day, in India, I give to India the watchword of Hope. On every side, I trace the signs and stirrings of new life. Education has given you hope, and through better and higher education you will build up higher and better hopes." With full confidence, therefore, I bring the resolution before the Council in the firm faith that the Hon'ble Members present will be fully alive to the needs of my community and that the Government will be true to its past pledges. With these words, I commend the resolution to the Council and hope it will meet with their whole-hearted acceptance."

The HON'BLE MR. KÜCHLER said :—

"My Lord, there is fortunately no financial objection to this resolution, as the Hon'ble Member has not asked for the allotment of any specific sum, but has merely asked for a substantial contribution from the Imperial grant which is being made for the general purpose of education. Moreover, the resolution, as will be noticed, is couched in general terms, and these terms are in entire accord with the policy which has been laid down by the Education Commission in 1884 towards Muhammadan Education, and which I take it has been consistently followed by Government ever since. There can be no objection, therefore, on the part of Government to the acceptance of this resolution by the Council. It is necessary, however, that I should say a few words to make the position of Government clear with regard to this matter. The Hon'ble Member, I am glad to say, is not unmindful of the liberal assistance which has been given by Government in the past towards Muhammadan education, but I regret very much that the same recognition has not always been forthcoming in the numerous representations which have been made to Government on the subject by representative Muhammadan public bodies, and by representative Muhammadan newspapers. It is desirable therefore that I should indicate very briefly what has been done by Government in the past, and what Government is doing at the present moment in the way of providing better facilities for the education of Muhammadan boys. Especially is this useful with a view to ascertaining in what direction it will be possible and desirable to give further assistance in future. I do not think I can do better in this connection than to take the heads

[Mr. Küchler.]

of Education enunciated by the Education Commission which made its pronouncement in 1884, and I propose therefore to run briefly through these heads, and to see what has been done already, and what can be done in the future. The first head is of a general nature, and the adoption of the resolution by the Council will practically endorse the recommendation which was made by the Commission.

"The second head shows that indigenous Muhammadan schools should be liberally encouraged to add purely secular subjects to their course of instruction. This will enable me to say a few words about special Muhammadan institutions, because it is institutions of this class which are referred to in this particular recommendation. Now, in the year 1908, an important reform of Madrasa education was sanctioned by Government. Under that scheme of reform an improved staff and curriculum for the Hooghly and Calcutta Madrasas were sanctioned, and this reform involved a very considerable cost to Government. Almost all the recommendations, which were made by the Committee which dealt with the matter, previously to its being submitted to Government, have now been carried out and I think I may safely say that these two institutions have very materially benefited by the reforms which were then introduced. Over and above this, proposals were sanctioned for increased grants-in-aid to both senior and junior Madrasas throughout the western province. In a great number of cases, increased grants-in-aid have, in accordance with these recommendations, been made to the various Madrasas, but it has been up to date of course impossible to carry out in its entirety the whole scheme because the execution of the scheme depended largely upon the amount of assistance which was forthcoming from the Muhammadan community itself. In a very large number of instances, I am glad to say, the Muhammadan community has been extremely liberal in supplementing the contributions which have been made by Government, but, in some cases, it has not yet been possible to bring the junior and senior Madrasas up to the pitch of efficiency which it is hoped they will ultimately attain. In Eastern Bengal, nothing has yet been done as far as the Government resolution is concerned to effect a scheme of reform for Madrasa education, but at the same time, as is well known to the Muhammadan gentlemen present, an important conference dealt with this question a year or so ago. The recommendations made by that conference were ready for submission to Government, but in the meantime a modification had become essential owing to the scheme which had been proposed for the introduction of a department of Islamic studies in connection with the Dacca University. That scheme necessitated a slight change in the proposals which were then made. I am glad to say, however, that the subject has since then been further considered, and I think there will not be very much greater delay in giving effect to the recommendations as subsequently modified which were made by the Education Committee. This scheme, if carried into effect, will cost a very large sum of money indeed, and I think that there is no doubt it will be adopted by Government, and Government in adopting it will show, as it has always shown I maintain, its readiness to give every facility and every assistance to the cause of Muhammadan Education.

"Another class of indigenous institution, which was dealt with by the Committee in Eastern Bengal, was that of Maktabas, and it was decided by this Committee, and the recommendation of the Committee was subsequently accepted by Government that these Maktabas should receive special grants-in-aid in addition to those which were ordinarily given by district boards. Since these recommendations were given effect to, a large number of Maktabas in Western Bengal have received assistance under the new grant-in-aid system and at the present moment an annual sum of Rs. 55,000 is being spent in this way. In Eastern Bengal, the conference which dealt with the whole question of Muhammadan Education came to the conclusion that while Maktabas were entitled to special assistance, no special curriculum except in so far as there should be a slight simplification of that adopted in primary schools should be introduced. The recommendations of this Committee have not yet been given effect to, but they will be given effect to and the grants which have now been made by the Imperial Government will enable us to give very considerable extra assistance to the teachers of these institutions.



[Mr. Küchler.]

"Another special reform which was introduced in Western Bengal was that in connection with the training of Muhammadan teachers and this, as will be seen, forms the substance of head No. 7 of the recommendations of the Education Commission, viz., that where necessary normal schools or classes for the training of Muhammadan teachers should be established. Such institutions in the case of primary school teachers, which are called mainji training schools, have been introduced in the western divisions of Bengal. But the same conference, to which I have already referred, which sat in Eastern Bengal, came to the conclusion that special arrangements were not necessary nor desirable in Eastern Bengal and it was not therefore proposed to take any steps with regard to Maktabas and primary schools for Muhammadans in that part of the Province.

"The next head of the recommendations made by the Education Commission is to the effect that in localities, where Muhammadans form a fair proportion of the population, provision from public funds should be made for imparting instruction in Hindustani and Persian languages. This matter was already dealt with yesterday in a question which was asked in Council, and I have little to add to the reply which was then made by the Hon'ble Mr. Kerr. It has always been the policy of Government to provide instruction in High and Middle schools throughout the province in Persian, Arabic and Urdu, where there is a clear demand for such instruction, but I do not think that it can be expected that Government should provide teachers in these subjects where it is obvious that there is no need for them and if they were supplied no pupils would be forthcoming. Many reasons have been advanced why it is that pupils in our schools in Eastern Bengal prefer to take up, in a large number of cases, Sanskrit instead of Persian or Arabic for the Matriculation examination. But I think there is no doubt that one of the reasons which have been mentioned to me is the chief reason and that is that the examination for the Matriculation in Persian and Arabic is rather a stiff examination and the pupils of Eastern Bengal schools find it easier to pass in Sanskrit; and this is not the only reason. We must remember that Bengali is the vernacular of the Muhammadans certainly in Eastern Bengal and practically of the greater part of them in West Bengal. That being so, it is less difficult for them to go on afterwards with a classical language like Sanskrit than it is with Persian specially when it is combined with Arabic, as their vernacular, viz., Bengali, leads them naturally to the study of Sanskrit. I consider that this reason is a sound one. I consider also that it is a reason which really accounts in great part for the very curious fact that there is so little demand for Persian in a large number of schools throughout the province. I can only repeat that where any such demand is represented to the Department of Public Instruction, the Director has always been willing and will be willing in future to meet the wishes of the Muhammadan community.

"The next head of the recommendations of the Education Commission is that higher education for Muhammadans, being the kind of education in which they need special help should be liberally encouraged. The particular kind of encouragement, i.e., the particular form in which that encouragement should be given would probably be in the main through the institutions of scholarships and stipends. I will deal with that presently, because the subject of scholarship forms the next head of the recommendation. But there is another way of course, in which the higher education of Muhammadans, by which I take it education in our colleges is understood can also be fostered and facilitated, and that is by the provision of an adequate amount of hostel accommodation. It has long been a demand on the part of the Muhammadan community that increased hostel accommodation should be provided for them in connection with higher education in colleges. Though no doubt the supply has not yet overtaken the demand, I may fairly say that Government have been liberal in their attempts to meet the wants of the Muhammadan community in this respect.

"In one of the resolutions, which will be moved presently—I may perhaps be excused for referring to it now—the need of a Muhammadan hostel in the

[Mr. Küchler.]

neighbourhood of College Square is especially referred to. In this connection I may point out that in the vicinity of College Square we have already the Elliott and the Baker Hostels, and there are 95 seats in the Baker Hostel and 125 in the Elliot Hostel. Well, it was found this year that the accommodation is insufficient to meet the demands on the part of the Muhammadan student community, and a project has been sanctioned for an extension of the Baker Hostel at a cost of Rs. 91,000. When this project is completed, which it will be in the course of the coming year, it will be possible to provide for 60 more students. This will of course relieve a small number, but in addition to this measure of relief, further relief will be afforded by a condition which has been laid down by Government in connection with the grants-in-aid which have been made from the Imperial allotment to private colleges. It has been stipulated in the case of the City, Bangabasi and Ripon Colleges which have a large number of Muhammadan students reading in them that a fifth of the seats provided in the new hostels which will be financed from Imperial grant should be reserved for Muhammadans. It has also been recommended to a number of other colleges that a similar reservation should be made. Though I am not prepared to say that the additional accommodation which will thus be provided will meet all the wants of the student community, I think we may fairly expect that a very considerable measure of relief will be afforded thereby. I do not think that it can be said that Government has been at all illiberal in the measures which it has taken to give relief in this respect.

"Before I pass on to the next head, I should also say that with regard to the two lakhs grant which was made in the present financial year by the Imperial Government for the provision of hostels outside Calcutta and Dacca, the greater portion has this year been assigned to Muhammadan hostels, so that I do not think that here in this case there is any cause for complaint on the part of the Muhammadan community.

"Now I pass on to the fifth head of the recommendations of the Education Commission, viz., that where necessary a graduated system of special scholarships for Muhammadans be established in primary schools and middle class schools. Well, in this connection I should like to point out what is the provision of scholarships which at present obtains for Muhammadan students or for Muhammadan pupils in schools. There is naturally a difference which has not yet been abolished between the provision that has been made in the Eastern Bengal and Western Bengal Divisions, and I am compelled therefore to take these parts of the Province separately. There are six special junior scholarships and eight special senior scholarships in Western Bengal besides the two Madrasa scholarships. In addition to that, I should mention that 35 students are admitted every year to the Presidency College at a reduced fee of Rs. 2, and I am glad that it presents me an opportunity of correcting a statement which crops up repeatedly notwithstanding the contradictions which have been made of late that the cost of this reduction of fees is met from the Mohsin Fund. It is not met from the Mohsin Fund, but it is met from Provincial funds, and although I have stated this on many occasions, I always find that the same mistake steadily recurs. The Mohsin Fund is a fund which of course affords great benefits to the Muhammadan community, but it has been my painful duty to warn the members of the Muhammadan community that it is not an elastic fund and the present impression seems to be that the Mohsin Fund can cover the expenditure of a perfectly indefinite kind. Unfortunately, on the contrary, we have now reached the limits to which the Mohsin Fund can be extended, simply for this reason that the demands on the part of the Muhammadan community for increased education have so largely increased.

"The reduction of fees which is made in the Presidency College is financed from Provincial revenues, and I think that the Muhammadan community ought to acknowledge this. It is a very important privilege which is given to the Muhammadan community, because not only are the fees remitted in the case of these students, but they are given the first right of admission to the Presidency College and the same criteria for admission are not enforced in their case as are enforced in the case of other students of colleges.

[Mr. Kuchler. ]

"Passing now, to Eastern Bengal, we find still more liberal provision of scholarships which is only natural of course, because the proportion of the Muhammadan population is much greater there than in the Western Bengal. There are 20 junior college scholarships of Rs. 10 each and 6 senior college scholarships of Rs. 10 and 6 also for Rs. 15. There are, moreover, 5 Engineering scholarships of the value of Rs. 10, 3 Law Scholarships of the value of Rs. 10 and 1 post-graduate scholarship of the value of Rs. 30 available for both Muhammadan and backward classes in Eastern Bengal and Assam; besides these there are scholarships which are granted from endowment funds given by private individuals. Passing to other classes of scholarships, and taking first of all the high and middle schools throughout the Province, I would call attention to the free studentships which are here granted. The free studentships are granted up to the limit of 13 per cent. of the school population (exclusive of scholarship-holders and time-expired scholars) of which 8 per cent. are reserved for Muhammadan boys. Here, too, therefore, we have a very liberal allotment in favour especially of the Muhammadan schoolboys. Besides these, in Eastern Bengal, we have given 17 Middle English School scholarships of the value of Rs. 4 each and 24 Upper Primary scholarships of the value of Rs. 3 each. No special provision of this kind has been made for Western Bengal, but if the conditions attached to the Government of India grant permit, these scholarships might well be extended to Western Bengal, and over and above this Government is perfectly prepared to recommend an even larger provision.

"I may point out that the great difficulty in the way of the Muhammadan community availing themselves of the facilities of education which are open to others is their universal poverty. Their extreme poverty prevents them from taking advantage of the opportunities open to others, and the only way to get rid of the difficulty is by making a fair provision for scholarships and free studentships. At the same time, the Muhammadan community must bear in mind that this can only be a temporary measure. As the Muhammadan community advances in education, it may be presumed that it will also advance in material prosperity, and as it advances in material prosperity the necessity for giving temporary relief in this form must gradually disappear. Not only will the parents and guardians be then able to pay the necessary fees, but the richer members of the community will, it is hoped, as they have done in the past, give endowments for providing scholarships for the benefit of the poorer members of their own community.

"My Lord, I have already dealt with the sixth head of the recommendations of the Education Commission, viz., that in all schools maintained from public funds a certain number of free studentships be expressly reserved for Muhammadan students as also with the seventh, that where necessary normal schools or classes for the training of Muhammadan teachers be established.

"I think that what I have said above fairly covers the heads to which the Hon'ble Member himself referred in his own speech. He has, however, specially mentioned the case of establishing new schools in centres of Muhammadan population. Well, whether it is a centre of Muhammadan population or it is a centre of Hindu population, it has always been the recognized policy of Government to establish such schools, where there is a decided demand for them and where the local community is itself willing to co-operate. In this connection the Hon'ble Member has called attention to what he considers—the two-thirds rule—that two-thirds of the total cost should always be met by the local community themselves. But this rule, though it is a general rule, has been relaxed on occasions, and there is no reason why in special circumstances, it should not be relaxed in future. The relaxations, however, cannot be very numerous, for this simple reason that the demands for education are extremely numerous. As we wish to extend, as far as possible, the benefits of any grants that provincial revenues afford, it is obvious that we ought to be able to depend, to a large extent, on the assistance provided by the people themselves. However, in special cases, this two-thirds rule has been relaxed and especially so lately in connection with the Imperial grants which have been given for the purpose of erecting hostels.



[Mr. Kuchler ; Dr. D. P. Sarbadhikari.]

"I need perhaps say no more on the subject. I have tried to show clearly what is the position which Government takes in the matter, and as I have already intimated that Government will offer no objection to the acceptance of this resolution on the part of the Council, it is not necessary for me to say more than that no apprehension need have been felt on the part of the Muhammadan community that their claims would be neglected, if they had read the remark made by the Hon'ble Sir Harcourt Butler in his speech at Delhi in connection with the Imperial Budget. He there states that the Government of India are about to address the Local Governments on the question of encouraging Muhammadan education generally, and they have no doubt that Local Governments in distributing grants will make provision for special Muhammadan education, and elsewhere in his speech he says that out of the recurring of fifty-five lakhs out of the income of the ensuing year six lakhs is held in reserve for requirements such as the proposal for the development of Oriental studies and Muhammadan education.

"I think that this is an ample assurance and the Muhammadan community need therefore feel no fear that their claims are likely to be neglected."

The HON'BLE DR. SARBADHIKARI said :—

"In spite of assured victory for this resolution, I desire to associate myself with the principles of the demand contained in it. The educational question is looming larger every year and much of the time the Council has been given to the ventilation of this question. So that in the course of the year following suggestions of Hon'ble Members might be considered and given effect to as far as possible. Time was when a very few number of Members used to take part in this question, but their number is gradually increasing, which is to my mind a hopeful sign, and it is some relief to the Education representative on your Excellency's Council, on whom the bulk of the work used to fall in former years. In the five years that I have been a Member of the Council, the Education grants have nearly doubled from thirty-six lakhs (a figure with which I started when I joined the Council), we are now close upon sixty lakhs. The Muhammadan community has no doubt participated proportionately in this increase, but in spite of such proportionate increase of Educational facilities all round, Hindu Members have always ungrudgingly recognized and still recognize that in order that Muhammadan education may be put on a par with the needs of the community and the country, special provision is necessary. As the Hon'ble Mr. Kuchler has pointed out, such treatment has not been withheld in the past, but I feel that enough has not been done in this direction, because the people belonging to the community who yet take advantage of education facilities are poor as in our community. I do not subscribe wholly to my friend's proposition that the Muhammadans are as a class poor. I do not know that Hindus are very much better off, but it is undoubtedly a fact that the richer classes of the Muhammadans do not yet come forward to avail themselves of the education facilities to the extent that the poorer classes do, because the question of facilities for earning a livelihood is unfortunately still associated with this question. Therefore it is right and necessary that special facilities should continue to be given to this community. I must frankly admit that I have heard it for the first time that it is not out of the Mohsin Fund that some of the special facilities of which we have often heard are given to the Muhammadan community. I acknowledge my ignorance. And I do not complain of what has been done by Government for specially advancing the cause of Muhammadan Education in this connection, but I think that more has to be done. So far as special facilities of another kind are concerned, I am afraid that we must make it clear that they cannot be always granted. So far Muhammadan education and the Islamic studies are concerned, they will no doubt continue to receive attention, but as far as higher and collegiate education is concerned, they must be on the same scale and on the same terms—conditions that obtain in the case of members of the other communities, except of course, in the matter of free studentships and scholarships to which reference has already been made.

[Dr. D. P. Sarbadhikari.]

"The real difficulty of the situation, my Lord, arose out of the abolition of the college classes of the Madrasa some time ago. Some very fine products of that Madrasa are present with us here to-day and elsewhere. For a time the demand for that education fell off and the result was that the classes were abolished and the few Muhammadan students that then cared for collegiate education were drafted on to the other colleges. There is absolutely no reason why the Madrasa should not be restored to greater vigour, and the restored College classes should be able to combine with European culture and Islamic studies, as has been done in the Sanskrit College. This is a view that has found acceptance in some quarters. I should have liked to bring up a question like this in connection with the general resolution which has been placed before the Council, but I do not wish to strike a discordant note. I am glad that it is going to be accepted. But I trust Government will carefully reconsider the question of restoring the Madrasa College classes. The result of that will be to afford relief to the other colleges and there will be more effective and greater co-ordination of studies among the Muhammadans themselves.

"With regard to this resolution I should like to correct the Hon'ble Member who has moved this resolution with reference to his remark regarding the University regulations. He is himself a member of the University and he should have been aware that, under regulations, up to now there has not been any practical difficulty. The Syndicate has been able to arrange that no student *bonâ fide* requiring instruction should go without it. Accommodation has been found for all in our colleges heretofore under special concession terms. The Government of India, however, deprecate such concessions and in the immediate future college accommodation will cease to be equal to the demand. College accommodation must therefore be increased all round and not alone for the benefit of Muhammadan students.

"Then, with regard to the question of Arabic and Persian teachers, it is not a fact that the authorities are unwilling to provide them, but the difficulty is that teachers of the proper stamp are not available. We have some teachers who do not know English and, under the University regulations, they cannot be employed for collegiate work or advanced school work, although they may be quite capable of conducting Madrasa classes or Maktabas. That has been a real difficulty in providing teachers for Arabic and Persian. This has been a difficulty with which the University and the Educational advisers of Government have been trying to combat in the past. It is to be hoped that in the colleges and schools better Arabic and Persian teaching facilities should be given and then this difficulty should disappear; but English-knowing Persian scholars will readily find employment on assured terms elsewhere, and do not much care for the Educational Service. That adds to the difficulty of the situation.

"With regard to the suggestion that because the examination in Persian and Arabic for the Matriculation is stiff, few students take up these subjects as their second language.

"I do not know that this view is well founded. Those who are taking Sanskrit as their second language in preference to Arabic and Persian must have begun their studies quite early in life, or else they never could have taken it up. Sanskrit is not an easy language; it is just as difficult as, if not more than, Arabic and Persian, and what has been suggested by my Hon'ble friend is not the real solution of the question. The Hon'ble Mr. Kuehler has referred to Muhammadan hostels in the neighbourhood of the College Square, the Elliott Hostel and the Baker Hostel. Mr. Kuehler and I have often gone land-hunting in Calcutta for these Hostels, and he might have known by this time that the Baker and Elliott Hostels are not in the neighbourhood of College Square, but in the neighbourhood of Wellesley Square."

[*Mr. Küchler ; Dr. D. P. Sarbadhikari ; Nawab Saiyid Hossam Haider Chaudhuri Khan Bahadur ; Babu Surendra Nath Banerjee.*]

The HON'BLE MR. KÜCHLER :—

"I don't know what you mean by neighbourhood."

The HON'BLE MR. SARBADHIKARI said :—

"Well, I mean about a mile or so away, if not the better part of a couple of miles. I do not know whether it is desirable to take our Muhammadan students away from the neighbourhood of Taltolla where Muhammadans of light and leading, who can benefit Muhammadan students by being in touch with them, congregate and bring them right in the midst of pure Hindu influence of College Square. That is a matter upon which I do not presume to offer an opinion. But if the Muhammadan students of the Ripon College are to be accommodated in close proximity to their colleges, I am afraid there must be some sort of hostel accommodation for them in the neighbourhood of those colleges of the kind suggested by the Hon'ble Maulvi Abul Kasem whom the Hon'ble Mr. Küchler seeks to answer in advance."

The HON'BLE NAWAB SAIYID HOSSAM HAIDER CHAUDHURI KHAN BAHADUR said :—

"My Lord, I beg to support the resolution moved by my Hon'ble friend Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali Chaudhuri. The resolution speaks for itself and has been ably put. There appears to be an awakening among the Muhammadans and a real desire to avail themselves of the benefit of Western education, but unfortunately their circumstances stand in their way. No doubt the Government has shown a great concern in the welfare of its Muhammadan subjects and made some concessions in their favour, for which the Government is entitled to the thanks of our community, but all that has been done is not adequate to the demand. We therefore hope that the Government will be pleased to see its way to give further facilities to the Muhammadan students by making a more liberal grant in the matter of their education."

THE HON'BLE BABU SURENDRA NATH BANERJI said :—

"I feel perhaps that I ought not to give a silent vote on this resolution. Speaking on my own behalf, as well as on behalf of my Hindu colleagues, I may say at once that we feel the deepest possible sympathy with the aspirations of our Muhammadan fellow countrymen to obtain greater facilities in the matter of education. We have advanced a great deal beyond them, for the simple reason that we have made greater educational progress than they have done. The Muhammadan community has now begun to realise its deficiency and a great movement for the foundation of a Muhammadan University has stimulated, deepened and quickened the desire of the Muhammadan community to make still further progress in the matter of education, and it is one of the healthiest signs of the times that their progress has been very substantial within the last two or three years. Speaking from my experience of the Ripon College, with which I happen to be associated, I find that in the course of the last three years the number of Muhammadan students has more than doubled itself. Three years back the percentage of Muhammadan students in the Ripon College was 4 as compared to the Hindus ; two years back it was 7. This year it is 10 per cent. of the entire contingent of Hindu students. What is true of the Ripon College is probably true of all the other colleges, and therefore there is a distinct forward movement in respect of education on the part of the Muhammadan community, and I desire, my Lord to say once again that we Hindus feel the deepest sympathy for our Muhammadan fellow countrymen in their aspirations for greater facilities in the matter of education. I cannot, I am afraid, see eye to eye with my friend on my left that there should be a special Muhammadan college for the education of

[*Nawab Syed Shams-ul-Huda ; Maulvi Abu. Kasem.*]

Muhammadans, or that special Muhammadan institutions should be strengthened for the benefit of Muhammadans. I am opposed to all-sectarian institutions to all-classes institutions. I believe that in the sacred temple of learning all distinctions of race, colour and creed should be forgotten, that Hindus, Muhammadans and Christians should take their seats with each other, cultivate the acquaintance of each other, associate with each other and cultivate that fellow-feeling which I think is of the greatest possible importance to a mixed community like ours. We have a large number of Muhammadan students in Ripon College. They are on the best terms with the Hindu students, a feeling of friendliness of created mutual understanding is promoted, solidarity of feeling is fostered. All that is helpful to the greater unity of the two communities upon which the best prospects of India depend so largely is promoted and therefore we feel all the deepest possible sympathy with Muhammadan aspirations in the matter of education. I totally dissociate myself from any attempt made on the part of anybody, no matter who he may be, no matter how highly placed he may be, to establish sectarian institutions based upon considerations of creed, race or colour.'

The HON'BLE NAWAB SYED SHAMS-UL-HUDA said :—

"I want to say just a few words in support of the present resolution. From my own personal knowledge of the matter I could have said a great deal, but I do not do so for two reasons. First, that the Government has already accepted my Hon'ble friend's resolution, and, secondly, I am afraid that I may mix up my views as a Muhammadan with the views which may be held by this Government. The Muhammadans realise what has been done in the past and are grateful for it. But at the same time I confess I have found, wherever I have gone, that there still exist large demands in connection with Muhammadan Education which it is probably difficult ever for Government fully to satisfy.

As regards one matter which has been referred to by the Hon'ble Mr. Kuchler, I wish to say a word. In making the grant for hostels to colleges, we have made it a condition in certain instances that a certain number of seats should be reserved for Muhammadan boys. I wish here to state that this condition was not one which was forced by Government on the authorities of these colleges. As a matter of fact, Hon'ble Babu Surendra Nath Banerji for the Ripon College and the Principal of the City College both agreed and volunteered to make provision for Muhammadan boys in their hostels. That is a circumstance which is probably not known to the Muhammadans themselves, but I think it my duty to state it."

The resolution was then put to the vote and agreed to.

The HON'BLE MAULVI ABUL KASEM moved the following resolution :—

This Council recommends to the Governor in Council—

- (a) that a sum of rupees two lakhs be applied for the building of a hostel for Muhammadan boys in the vicinity of College Square in Calcutta ; and
- (b) that a sum of rupees three lakhs be applied for the establishment of hostels for Muhammadan boys outside Calcutta and Dacca ; and
- (c) that the above expenditure be met out of the provision of Rs. 24,80,000 entered for expenditure during 1913-14 from the Imperial non-recurring educational grant of Rs. 75,00,000.

"My Lord, after the observations which have fallen from the Hon'ble the Director of Public Instruction in connection with and in support of the resolution moved by my Hon'ble friend the Nawab of Dhanbari, I feel great diffidence in moving the resolutions which stand in my name, and in asking



[*Mawlvi Abul Kasem.*]

this Council to accept them, and if I venture to do so, it is simply because I feel it my duty to place before your Excellency's Government and this Council the needs and the wants of the Muhammadan community with regard to educational facilities. The Hon'ble Mr. Kuchler has dealt with the whole question of Muhammadan education and we are deeply grateful to him for his sympathy for the aspirations of the Muhammadan community and for the assurance given that, as in the past so in the future, the Musalmans will receive every assistance from Government for their education. The Muhammadans, my Lord, in the beginning, had some apprehensions about giving their sons high education on occidental lines, and they did not take advantage of the opportunities placed before them by the Government with the result that they lost the position they once occupied and the influence they exercised. And from affluence they were reduced to a state of abject poverty and penury.

"The Musalmans, my Lord, have paid the penalty for their apathy to and neglect of high education and western culture. But the lessons of the past have not been lost upon them. They now feel and feel it keenly that education and education alone is the means not only for their progress and advancement but for their very existence as a community. They are now as much eager to give their boys education as the members of any other community. But, my Lord, to their cost, they find that they have realised the situation rather too late. They have now not the means with which to educate their children. When the Muhammadan boys turn their eyes to high schools and colleges they find that high education has become more costly than ever. My Lord, we have always acknowledged and are deeply grateful to the Government for the sympathy, support and help we have received for the advancement and progress of education among Muhammadans. The question of Muhammadan education has been engaging the attention of the Government now for many years, and it is a matter of the gravest concern to the community. The Hon'ble Nawab Sayid Shams-ul-Huda has remarked that in his tour he has found that the wants of the Muhammadans are such that it would be impracticable for the Government to meet them. The demand which I put forward on behalf of the community in these resolutions are not of that nature nor are they extravagant and unreasonable. The Musalmans, my Lord, form the majority of the population in this presidency. And their progress and their advancement depend entirely upon educational facilities they receive from Government. My Lord, my Hindu fellow-countrymen at any rate the leaders of Hindu public opinion in Bengal, have always expressed their sympathy with the demands of the Muhammadans for educational facilities. They have extended their hand of help to us in our endeavours to spread education among Musalmans. We are deeply grateful to them for their sympathy with our aspirations. I am sure, my Lord, that if your Excellency's Government grant the facilities which I now ask on behalf, and for the members, of my community, the action of the Government will receive the approbation of Hindus and Musalmans alike. In this resolution, my Lord, I ask for the establishment of hostels for Muhammadan boys in Calcutta and in the mufassal. The necessity of Muhammadan hostels is admitted on all hands. The Madrasah hostels can accommodate only a limited number of our boys and a very large number of our students have to shift for themselves. They live in private messes without discipline and proper care, in insanitary surroundings, independent of all control, and this has an injurious effect on the health, the education, the morals and the future career of these young men. From a statement published by the Muhammadan students last year it appears that about 100 boys in Calcutta failed to obtain accommodation not only in hostels but even in private messes. Probably they had to leave Calcutta and many of them must have been obliged to give up their studies. I am glad to learn, my Lord that authorities of the Ripon and City Colleges have voluntarily offered to provide accommodation for Muhammadan boys in their college hostels and that some other private colleges have been asked by Government to make such provision as a condition for the grant of their hostel buildings. This, my Lord, will no doubt accommodate some Muhammadan boys, but it cannot provide room for all the Moslem

[*Maulvi Abul Kasem ; Mr. Kuchler.*]

college boys in Calcutta. A good many of them will have to hunt for messes ; and again there are the students of the Presidency, Law and Medical Colleges for whom no provision is being made. Besides, my Lord, it is necessary that Musalman college students should so far as practicable live at one place. Under the present circumstances no religious instructions can be given in our colleges. We attach great importance to that branch of education and we will have to supplement the college education by a system of religious and moral education in our hostels. There are at present about 700 Muhammadan college students in Calcutta, and their number is gradually increasing ; there is accommodation in the Madrasah hostels for about 140 boys, and private colleges will probably make room for 160 more, so that accommodation will be wanted for about 400 students. Now the question arises as to where should the hostel be located. I suggest the vicinity of College Square. The Presidency and other colleges which have large number of Muhammadan students are all situated in the neighbourhood of College Square. The Madrasah hostels are at a distance of nearly two miles from these colleges. The students have to walk this distance immediately after their morning meals, which affects their health and causes an unnecessary loss of time. Under the present University regulations, college boys are taught in groups, and generally there is an interval of two hours or more between lecture hours ; and Musalman boys living at a distance cannot utilise this leisure to any advantage as their Hindu brethren do. They cannot take advantage of the University and college libraries, and the lectures of the University Professors and readers, and other facilities provided by the University.

"As regards Muhammadan hostels outside Calcutta and Dacca no words of mine are necessary to commend them to your Excellency's Government. I am glad to know that a good portion of last year's grant has been spent for Muhammadan hostels, but I would draw the attention of the Hon'ble the Director of Public Instruction to the fact that in the Burdwan Division except the Mohsin Hostel at Chinsura there is not a single hostel for Muhammadan boys.

"Large sums have been granted for the building of hostels in Calcutta and in mufassal, and this additional 75 lakhs have been granted by the Government of India for education, and I humbly submit, my Lord, that it is fair and reasonable that a small amount out of this should be applied to the building of hostels for Muhammadan boys in and out of Calcutta.

"The Muhammadans on account of their poverty find it difficult to provide accommodation for their boys at centres of education, and whenever they are able to get such accommodation, they feel the necessity and lack of sufficient control and supervision over boys who have to live out of home for their education. In our public schools and colleges which are non-sectarian the sort of religious education which Muhammadans want and feel it necessary for their boys cannot be imparted, and therefore we want to supplement secular education by a system of moral and religious training given at these hostels and boarding-houses to be established for Muhammadan boys.

"We in the Burdwan Division have tried for some years past to get a hostel established at some of the centres of education, but so far we have failed to succeed. I hope that if the Government comes forward with a substantial help, the local Muhammadan community will not fail to respond to a call of duty and contribute as far as their means would permit towards the building of these hostels. With the assured sympathy and support of our Hindu fellow-countrymen, I think the Government will find no difficulty in making provisions for the building of hostels."

The Hon'ble MR. KÜCHLER said :—

"My Lord, my chief objection to the resolution which has been put forward by the Hon'ble mover is that he mentions specific allotments in connection with his proposals. Now we all know, as I have already pointed out, that a very considerable sum has been given by the Government of India for the purpose of erecting new hostels in Bengal, but we do not know what are

[*Mr. Kückler ; Maulvi Abul Kasem.*]

the conditions attached to this grant. Even, however, if we had full information on this point, it would obviously be inexpedient for this Council, on the insufficient data at their disposal, to prescribe any definite sums for the construction of hostels for particular communities or in particular places. I think it is only reasonable that we should ask Hon'ble Members who support projects of this kind to leave the details in the hands of the executive. I have given in the name of Government the assurance that the claims of the Muhammadan community will be fully considered in the apportionment of this grant, and I do not think that it would be advisable at this stage to do any more. I am perfectly certain in any case that Government would never accept a resolution of this kind which ties its hands, especially in the absence of any information from the Government of India as to what are the exact conditions attached to the hostel grant. I think it would be only reasonable, I must say, if the Hon'ble Member would accept the assurance that has been given that these grants which are likely to be very large will be distributed in a fair way and that the claims of the Muhammadans to a fair share in them will be fully considered. In illustration of this, I have pointed out that, with regard to the grants which have already been made, the Muhammadans have actually got a share to which the other communities, if they had been inclined to be captious, might reasonably have taken exception, but they have not done so, and I think therefore that Muhammadans ought perhaps not to make specific demands, but to be content with the general assurance which has now been given.

"As regards the hostel in the vicinity of College Square, I may say that at the present moment, I have a perfectly open mind on the subject. I mean it is simply a question of principle. I do not think I possibly can in this Council give an assurance on the recommendation of the Hon'ble Member that such a hostel should be erected. The Hon'ble Member has mentioned that complaints are made of the distance of the present hostels—the Baker and Elliot Hostels from the colleges in Calcutta. Well, I must say that I have never heard such a complaint, nor do I accept the very liberal estimate which has been given of the distance to Wellesley Square from College Square. I certainly think it is very considerably under two miles. At any rate, I have always understood—and this is certainly the view which has been brought to my attention—that it is the wish of the Muhammadan community that the Baker and Elliot Hostels should be extended, and that no Government hostel in any other place should be erected, and in a way the Hon'ble Member himself has, in the course of his remarks, rather supported this view because he has called attention to the necessity of Muhammadan institutions being all together in one place. If however we build one of them in Wellesley Square and another in College Square, I do not see how we can secure that object, the desirability of which he himself has called attention to. Under these circumstances I am compelled, on the part of Government, to oppose the acceptance of this resolution and I still hope that the Hon'ble Member, on the strength of what has been said, will see his way to withdraw it."

The Hon'ble MAULVI ABUL KASEM said :—

"After the observations which have fallen from the Hon'ble Director of Public Instruction, I beg to withdraw my resolution, and, in doing so, I have to make only one observation, and that is, that I am glad to learn that the Director of Public Instruction is open to conviction about the establishment of hostels in the vicinity of College Square."

The Resolution was then withdrawn.

The Hon'ble MAULVI ABUL KASEM said :—

"My Lord, with your Excellency's permission, I beg to move that—

This Council recommends to the Governor in Council—

- (a) that a sum of rupees two lakhs be set apart for the grant of scholarships to Muhammadan boys ;



[Maulvi Abul Kasem.]

- (b) that a further sum of a lakh of rupees be applied for the teaching of Arabic, Persian and Urdu in colleges, as well as in secondary and high schools ; and
- (c) that the above expenditure be met out of the sum of Rs. 13,20,000 (recurring grant under the head "22—Education").

"My Lord, as this question of Muhammadan scholarships has been dealt with by the Hon'ble the Director of Public Instruction in his observations, I do not think it necessary to add much to it.

"That the Muhammadans were admittedly a poor people, and the Hon'ble Mr. Kuchler had himself remarked that the real difficulty of the Muhammadans was their poverty. The little progress Muhammadan education has made is due to a large extent to the scholarships and stipends granted to Moslem boys out of the Mohsin Fund, but the fund, as has been just remarked, is not elastic, and it cannot meet the wants of the increasing number of Moslem students or to further advance and spread education among Muhammadans. The Government considered the situation, and during the administration of Sir Rivers Thompson a few scholarships were created for Moslem boys. This has greatly helped the poor struggling students, but since 1887 no steps have been taken to give them any further assistance, although the number has since then largely increased and is growing.

"The Mohsin and Government scholarships have greatly helped the spread and advance of Muhammadan education in this province, and I think that this Council and the Hon'ble Mr. Kuchler will agree with me that the number of these scholarships is quite insufficient for the large and increasing number of Muhammadan students that come up for education. As he has himself stated, the real difficulty in regard to Muhammadans failing to take advantage of public institutions is their very great poverty, and to meet that it is necessary that scholarships should be provided on a liberal scale for the education of Muhammadan boys. There will be some difficulty, but I hope the Government will take into consideration the question of creating special scholarships for Muhammadan boys in order to provide greater facilities for Muhammadan education. The scholarships so far created concern college students and so far nothing has been done for Moslem boys in primary and secondary schools which are the feeders of high schools and colleges. I hope the creation of special stipends for these students will receive the consideration of the Education Department of the Government of Bengal.

"In reply to my question I was told that Government was not aware that the teaching of Arabic, Persian and Urdu was defective, and that it had received no complaints about it. The Muhammadan Educational Conferences and other representative bodies have from time to time drawn public attention to this matter.

"There are no maulvis in any schools and colleges and in others ill-paid and not fully qualified teachers are employed. They cannot be expected to, and do not, perform their duties satisfactorily. Large numbers of Muhammadan students are obliged to take up Sanskrit as their second language. This has an injurious and demoralising effect on the general well-being of the community. It is true that of late the examinations in Arabic and Persian have become more stiff, but that is not the reason for the Muhammadan boys taking Sanskrit. The fact is that in the early part of their education they get no facilities for learning Urdu and Persian, and so have to learn Sanskrit and the allied languages. The number of Government schools is very small, the greater portion of our boys receive their education in private institutions, and my humble suggestion is that for the encouragement of Muhammadan education, Government should apply a portion of the recurring grant for the purpose of an additional grant to aided, and as subsidy to unaided, institutions in order to enable them to make proper provision for the teaching of these languages.

[Mr. Kuchler.]

"Some provision has no doubt been made in Government schools for the teaching of these languages, but the number of Government schools are very small in this province and a large number of students receive their education in private institutions which may or may not care to engage teachers in Persian, Arabic or Urdu. Even in Government institutions the arrangements, my Lord, are insufficient. In high schools only one teacher is engaged; he has to take up ten classes, and it is simply impossible for him to do the work satisfactorily. In private institutions there is an apology for a teacher of Arabic and Persian who has to live on the pittance which the school authorities care to pay. It was stated yesterday that private institutions, if they wanted help for the maintenance of a teaching staff in these languages, may apply for Government aid, but it is not in the interests of these institutions to apply for such aid; it is for the Muhammadan community to see that sufficient facilities are provided for the teaching of these languages. Even in Calcutta itself there are many colleges where there is no such person as a teacher of Arabic, Persian and Urdu, and these colleges are not going to ask Government for any special aid. I appeal to Government and to the Director of Public Instruction to enquire where there is a large number of Muhammadan students, or a probability of Muhammadan students coming to the schools and colleges, and to come forward with some sort of subsidy or help to these private institutions for the teaching of Persian, Arabic and Urdu. So far as our Muhammadan community is concerned, I believe the Muhammadan Educational Conferences have from time to time drawn the attention of Government to the defective teaching of Arabic, Persian, and Urdu in our schools. There is no doubt that the examinations in Persian and Arabic have become of late rather stiff, but that is not the only reason, and perhaps not the real reason, why some Muhammadan students have taken up Sanskrit in the early stages of their studies. It is not for lack of desire to learn Arabic, Urdu and Persian that they have failed to take up those languages; but it is the lack of facilities for doing so that has forced them to turn to Bengali and Sanskrit.

"With these few words I beg to move my resolution."

The Hon'ble MR. KÜCHLER said :—

"I hoped from the preliminary remarks that the Hon'ble Member made that he was going to withdraw his resolution, but to judge from the conclusion of his speech he evidently wishes to press it.

It will be impossible to fix a specific sum for scholarships. I have already dealt fully with the question of scholarship in my remarks on the resolution of the Hon'ble Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali Chaudhuri. I do not think it is necessary here to cover the same ground again. I have already stated there that the Government is prepared to make still further grants in the way of securing a greater number of scholarships for the boys of the Muhammadan community, and I think that under the circumstances this ought to suffice.

With regard to the teaching of Arabic and Persian in our schools, I did not refer merely to Government schools, because it is one of the conditions of our grants-in-aid that instruction should be provided in such subjects as are required by the conditions of the locality. Of course this alone will not be very much by itself unless Government at the same time contributes to the pay of the teachers. Government is prepared to do so, and I do not think for a moment that schools will be reluctant to entertain teachers in these subjects, if there is a demand on the part of the local community to have instructions on these subjects. It will be in the interests of school authorities to do so. If there is a demand on the part of the local people for teaching in these subjects and if Government is prepared at the same time to give a grant-in-aid in that direction, it is difficult to understand why such teachers should not be appointed. The Hon'ble Dr. Sarvadhikari has referred to the difficulty of getting trained teachers on these subjects who are sufficiently acquainted

[*Mr. Küchler; Babu Surendra Nath Banerji; Maulvi Abul Kasem; Dr. Nilratan Sarkar.*]

with English and can thus fulfil the demand made by the University that no teacher should be appointed for these subjects who does not know English. But I do not think that this difficulty is so great as is imagined. The University of Calcutta, though it has insisted on a knowledge of the English language, has relaxed this condition in favour of the old school of maulvis who do not know English at all. I do not think that that is the real difficulty which lies in the way of teaching Arabic and Persian in our schools. But before taking the step suggested by the Hon'ble mover of this resolution, Government must be assured that there is some special reason for it."

The Hon'ble BABU SURENDRA NATH BANERJI said :—

"My Lord, I quite agree with the Hon'ble the Director of Public Instruction that we ought not to hamper these resolutions with specific allotments of money. It is for us from our place in this Council Chamber to formulate our demands and if these demands are accepted by the Government, it is for the Government to find money and to draw out the scheme that it may think fit. We lay down principles, and it is for the Government to give effect to these principles. That I conceive to be our function here. But, my Lord, while agreeing so far with the Director of Public Instruction in regard to this part of the contention, I must be permitted to repeat that the stand made by my Hon'ble friend Maulvi Abul Kasem to the effect that much remains to be done in the direction for the improvement of the instruction of Arabic and Persian is a reasonable one. My Lord, I happen to be associated with a college in which we teach Persian and Arabic. We find great difficulty in getting good maulvis. We can get maulvis—very good maulvis—but the difficulty arises when we cannot get maulvis of the right sort who know English and can coach boys on passing the University examinations. This has been referred to by my Hon'ble friend Dr. Sarvadhikari. This is a matter in regard to which there is a complaint—and a well-founded complaint—and it does seem to me that it is the duty of the Government and the Director of Public Instruction and the department over which he presides to inquire into the complaint. The complaint is that it is the duty of those who are in charge of the education work to see and to take such measure as would ensure and would facilitate teaching of these subjects in our institutions. And I fully associate myself with my Hon'ble friend Maulvi Abul Kasem, so far as this part of the resolution is concerned."

The Hon'ble MAULVI ABUL KASEM said :—

"My Lord, after the observations that have been made by the Hon'ble the Director of Public Instruction, I beg to withdraw my resolution. The Hon'ble the Director of Public Instruction has said in the course of his remarks that there is not sufficient local demand for instruction in Arabic and Persian, or the school authorities would, in their own interest, find it profitable to appoint qualified teachers for those subjects. But, my Lord, that is not the case. The majority of the boys in our colleges are Hindus and take up Sanskrit. And for the few Muhammadan boys the school authorities do not like to go into the expense of appointing good Persian or Arabic teachers. They can easily afford to do away with those boys than appoint a teacher for Persian and Arabic."

"With these words, my Lord, I beg to withdraw the resolution."

Before resolution No. 8 which stood in the name of the Hon'ble Dr. Nilratan Sarkar was moved, the Hon'ble Babu Ananda Chandra Ray said :—

"My Lord, I want to move an amendment to this resolution, before it is taken up."

[The President; Dr. Nilratan Sarkar; Babu Ananda Chandra Ray.]

The PRESIDENT said :—

"I do not think you can move an amendment before the original resolution is moved."

The Hon'ble DR. NILRATAN SARKAR said :—

"My Lord, with your Excellency's permission, I will move the resolution in a slightly amended form, i.e., I want to substitute for the words 'sum of not less than Rs. 1,00,000' the words 'definite allotment be made.'"

The Hon'ble BABU ANANDA CHANDRA RAY said :—

"I also wanted to make that slight alteration."

The PRESIDENT said :—

"It has already been done."

The Hon'ble BABU ANANDA CHANDRA RAY said :—

"I wanted to make it convenient for those who are manipulating the funds for the Government and not to tie their hands with the proposal of a specific allotment. I hope that my Hon'ble friend will accept my amendment for the substitution of the word 'substantial' for 'definite.'"

The PRESIDENT said :—

"We cannot do it now."

The Hon'ble BABU ANANDA CHANDRA RAY said :—

"My Lord, we have already made a definite statement regarding the increase of girls' schools. But trained teachers are needed. We find that a great deal of interest is taken in female education now in urban areas where there are a number of Indians. We also find that during the last five years a great deal of improvement has been done in Eastern Bengal and Assam, where the number of educational institutions for girls has been doubled. But still we want more. And we cannot get the improvement unless we set apart a large amount for this work."

The PRESIDENT said :—

"As far as I can see what the Hon'ble Member wishes to do is to make a slight amendment in form, and as it would not vitally affect the resolution, the amendment may be allowed."

The Hon'ble DR. NILRATAN SARKAR then moved the following resolution :—

This Council recommends to the Governor in Council—

- (a) that a definite allotment be made for female education in urban areas, principally for the establishment for girls' schools in localities where the same are needed, and also for the establishment of at least three additional higher class girls' schools, including preferably at least one seminary in Calcutta; and
- (b) that the initial expenditure on buildings and equipment and the above-mentioned grant be met from the recurring grant by the Government of India for Education (Rs. 13,20,000)



[*Dr. Nitratán Sarkar; Mr. Kuchler.*]

He said :—

"My Lord, in moving this resolution I must first acknowledge with grateful thanks the beneficent efforts of Government towards the furtherance of female education in the province. My only justification for bringing forward this resolution is the large inadequacy of institutions for the very large numbers of girls of school-going age even in Calcutta. Whereas there are in this city some 50 high schools for boys affiliated to the University providing accommodation for about 25,000 students, there are only 11 schools of the same standard for girls—that can accommodate only about 2,000 pupils (about 1,000 of whom are Indian) out of about 43,000 girls of the school-going age.

"After making due allowance for the fact that the number of girls of school-going age in Calcutta is less than half that of boys, as also for the general backwardness of ideas in regard to female education, it may be safely stated that for at least 5 per cent. of the total number or over 2,000 girls of school-going age, there is a real demand for education in high schools, whereas there is provision for only about 1,000.

"Outside Calcutta, again, there are over 250,000 girls of school-going age in municipal areas for whom there is practically no opportunity for obtaining higher education excepting such as is afforded by the three high schools in the Eastern districts. It is time therefore that greater impetus should be given to female education in the province.

"As regards Calcutta, the Director of Public Instruction in his last report states that the "upper classes of girls' high schools are beginning to attract more pupils, and though fees have in some cases been raised parents have shown no great opposition to the enhancement." I may be permitted to observe that though girls' education in this country has got only education for its end, it is making rapid strides in Indian homes—indeed it has become a necessity in the Indian society. It is possible now to enlist the co-operation of a large number of people of the Indian community, who until recently were quite apathetic towards the furtherance of female education.

"The system of early marriage, another obstacle to education, is gradually disappearing on account of radical changes in the social and economic conditions of the country. Our conservatism is happily breaking down before the manifold liberalising influences that are now at work in India. In fact, many belonging to the middle classes strongly feel the want of seminaries where their grown-up daughters, yet unmarried on account of pecuniary difficulties, may find a suitable home and proper training. If high schools and seminaries be opened at this opportune moment under trained female teachers who alone can make female education more acceptable to my countrymen, the success of such institutions is almost guaranteed. According to a high authority one of the obstacles that hinders the furtherance of female education in Bengal is the want of State aid and aid from other public funds. And it is my earnest hope that this will be removed by your Excellency's Government."

The Hon'ble MR. KUCHLER said :—

"My Lord, as the resolution is now amended, the objection which I would otherwise have made to it disappears. At the same time, I must still point out that it is yet possible that there may be conditions in the Government of India grant which would prevent the recommendations made by the Council being carried out, even if the resolution is accepted by the Council. However, with this proviso, I am quite prepared to accept the resolution, that a definite allotment be made for female education in urban areas. We must, however, remember that there are a number of other branches of female education which have equal claims to our funds. I have already indicated this in my speech in introducing the financial statement, when I was speaking of the grant of Rs. 1,07,000 already made by the Government of India, i.e., that the money should be distributed amongst various heads, such as the provision of training colleges and training schools for teachers, the provision of inspecting

[Mr Küchler ; Babu Surendra Nath Banerji ; Rai Radha Charan Pal Bahadur.]

agencies and the assignment of larger grants-in-aid not only for schools in urban area but for the far greater number of schools which we find in rural areas. It is obvious therefore that if we take the grant that has been assigned by the Government of India for the whole of India, viz., 5 lakhs, of which probably not much more than 1 lakh will be allotted to Bengal, we find that we could not transfer the whole amount as was originally proposed in the resolution to female education in urban areas, but with the new sums that will be placed at our disposal, it will be possible to give much greater assistance in this direction than has hitherto been possible. I think therefore that there will be no difficulty whatever in accepting the resolution as it now stands, as it merely agrees with the policy which has already been adopted in this matter by the Government. I would point out, however, that there is a slight danger in going too fast in the matter of female education. The Hon'ble Member has given us the number of girls of school-going age as an argument in favour of increase of facilities for female education. But this is not the true criterion ; the true criterion is the number of girls to whom their parents or guardians wish education to be given.

"In connection with this question, I would specially refer to the proposal which the Hon'ble Member has made for providing an additional high school in Calcutta. I am not prepared to admit that there is any necessity for another high school. The Hon'ble Member has said that there are 11 high schools in Calcutta. I know there are nine at least for Indian girls, and there are only 203 pupils in the higher classes of these schools. In the face of this fact it is idle to maintain that there is a demand for another high school in Calcutta. On the other hand, I agree that a few more high schools are needed in rural areas, and there are already some schemes under consideration. I need hardly add anything more to what I have already said. I am in perfect accord with the spirit of the resolution, and I am prepared to recommend its acceptance by the Council."

The Hon'ble BABU SURENDRA NATH BANERJI said :—

"I think, Sir, we must express our gratitude to the Hon'ble the Director of Public Instruction for the sympathy which he has expressed with my Hon'ble friend's motion and for having accepted it. There is, however, one observation which has been made by the Hon'ble the Director of Public Instruction to which I feel it my duty to take exception. The Hon'ble Mr. Küchler has said that it was not sufficiently a correct criterion to compare the number of school-going pupils as regards female education with the number already in schools. That the attitude of the parents in regard to the whole question of female education is a determining factor, nobody will deny. It is a statement which nobody will challenge. But, Sir, our contention is this : that in consequence of the progressive forces which have been operating upon us, the liberalising influences which have been at work for a period of more than a quarter of a century, a distinct advancement in the direction of the attitude of the public mind in regard to female education has taken place. I am perfectly certain that there is a growing desire on the part of the Indian community, and I think that the Government ought to take advantage of the rising tide of popular feeling in this respect. I believe that the Hon'ble mover of this resolution expresses the sense of the educated community of this province. We are glad of the assurances and sympathy, and we hope that it will bear fruit in the near future in the shape of female schools and colleges in rural areas."

The Hon'ble RAI RADHA CHARAN PAL BAHADUR said :—

"My Lord, I heartily support the resolution moved by the Hon'ble Dr. Nilratan Sircar. My Lord, speaking on behalf of the orthodox community I may say that there is a great demand for girls' schools in Calcutta and in the vicinity of Calcutta. Although the Hon'ble Babu Surendra Nath Banerji agreed with the Director of Public Instruction that there is some unwillingness on the part of parents to send their girls to schools to be



[*Babu Surendra Nath Banerji; Rai Radha Charan Pal Bahadur  
Mr. Sinha.*]

educated yet it cannot be denied that the unwillingness arises from certain difficulties—”

The Hon'ble BABU SURENDRA NATH BANERJI said :—

“ I did not say that.”

The Hon'ble RAI RADHA CHARAN PAL BAHADUR, continuing, said :—

“ My Lord, so far as the orthodox community are concerned, there are certain difficulties in the way of our daughters being sent to high schools, which I had explained personally to the Director of Public Instruction. So far as Calcutta is concerned, the schools are not suitable in every respect to the orthodox community. There are institutions like the Bethune College where some of our girls are educated. There are also the Brahmo and Christian girls' schools. But they do not supply the wants of the orthodox community. My Lord, the orthodox community do not require their girls to be educated up to the standard of B.A. and M.A. of the Calcutta University. They do not want such education to be imparted to their girls, as they are withdrawn from schools between the ages of 12 and 14. What is wanted is primary education imparted on religious basis so as to fit them to be good wives and good mothers in Hindu houses. In this respect these schools do not fulfil our expectation. And I agree with the Hon'ble Mr. Kuchler that what is wanted is not so many higher schools as a number of well conducted primary institutions. My Lord, there are some such institutions in Calcutta, but their sanitary condition is such that no respectable people would like to send their daughters there.

“ Placed in such habitations their health is bound to be injured, if they continue there for some time. Then, my Lord, although Government is so generously inclined to foster female education, proper facilities will not be afforded, unless and until female education is made cheap enough to be availed of by all ranks of the people. Belonging as I do to the middle class of the community my Lord, I can assure you that the high scale of fees in such institutions as the Bethune College, which I believe is from Rs 2 to Rs. 3 per month for every girl, is practically prohibitive for middle class people, who cannot afford to pay such fees. A clerk or a trader earning Rs. 50 or Rs. 60 cannot, if he has half a dozen, or three, or four girls, afford to pay the fee which is required to be paid at the Bethune College. Well conducted cheap primary schools housed in sanitary buildings are wanted. My friend the Hon'ble Dr. Nilratan Sircar, who belongs to the advanced community, has urged the desirability of additional higher class girls' schools. I think it my duty, my Lord, to bring more forcibly to the attention of Government the need of more primary schools to meet the wants of the orthodox community, who form by far the largest majority of the population under your Lordship's rule.”

The Hon'ble MR. SINHA said :—

“ I beg your Lordship's permission to add to the resolution, by way of amendment, certain words which, from what I understand from the Hon'ble Director of Public Instruction, will make it acceptable to the Government. I am sure my hon'ble friend the proposer of the resolution will be prepared to accept this, because it is his desire, as it is the desire of the Members of this Council, that the hands of Government should be strengthened in carrying out this measure of reform. My Lord, I propose that to the amended resolution as moved by the Hon'ble Dr. Nilratan Sircar the following words be added, viz.—“ provided the conditions attached to the Government of India grant are met.” I am sure the learned mover will accept this, because it is necessarily implied in the resolution itself. If the money out of which the grant is to be made is saddled by these conditions, it follows that the Government cannot use that money apart from or independent of the conditions which may be attached, and therefore, my Lord, I propose, without any further words, that the words

[*Dr. Nilratan Sarkar ; Dr. D. P. Sarbadhikari ; Mr. Küchler.*]

provided that the conditions attached to the Government of India grant are met ' be added to the resolution."

The Hon'ble DR. NILRATAN SIRCAR said :—

"I accept that."

The resolution was then put in the following form and agreed to :—

This Council recommends to the Governor in Council—

- (a) that a definite allotment be made for female education in urban areas, principally for the establishment of girls' schools, in localities where the same are needed, and also for the establishment of at least three additional higher class girls' schools, including preferably at least one seminary in Calcutta ; and
- (b) that the initial expenditure on buildings and equipment and the above-mentioned grant be met from the recurring grant by the Government of India for education (Rs. 13,20,000), provided that the conditions attached to the Government of India's grant are met.

The Hon'ble DR. DEBA PRASAD SARBADHIKARI said :—

"My Lord, if I may also have the indulgence extended to the mover of the last resolution, I should like, with your Excellency's permission, to substitute the words 'a substantial sum' for the words 'a non-recurring grant of 5 lakhs' in my resolution."

The Hon'ble MR. KÜCHLER said :—

"I have no objection."

The Hon'ble DR. SARBADHIKARI said :—

"It is never too late to learn, or to mend anything, and I accept the suggestion made by the Hon'ble Mr. Sinha in regard to the previous resolution, in connection with this resolution also."

The Hon'ble MR. KÜCHLER said :—

"May I rise to explain? I merely wish to say that I have no objection to the words being substituted, but I do not wish to imply by that, that I intend to accept the resolution."

The Hon'ble MR. SARBADHIKARI :—

"I never thought my hon'ble friend would be so generous as that. At all events, he need not have anticipated me, and might have heard me out."

The Hon'ble DR. DEBA PRASAD SARBADHIKARI then moved his resolution in the following form:—

This Council recommends to the Governor in Council-

- (a) that a substantial sum be provided for helping non-official medical education in Calcutta ; and
- (b) that the said grant be met out of the provision of Rs. 24,80,000 entered for expenditure during 1913-14 from the Imperial non-recurring educational grant of Rs. 75,00,000, provided that the conditions attached to the Government of India's grant are met.

[Dr. D. P. Sarbadhikari.]

In respect of this resolution, my Lord, I wish to draw the attention of the Council to the elaborate report of the Dacca University Committee, which states that the "competition for admission into the Calcutta Medical College has become so great that further provision for medical students must be made in this province." The report goes on to say :—"We are further told that it is not at present practicable to establish a fully-equipped Medical College at Dacca, for which reason only the lower preliminary science classes are to be established." Under the present scheme for the Dacca Department of Medical Studies "there will be no separate Medical College; students of medicine, like students of other scientific subjects, will be received into the various colleges and taught by the University. The number to be admitted each year will depend upon the demand for training and the capacity of the Calcutta Medical College to receive those students who have completed their course at Dacca.

"The 'capacity of the Calcutta Medical College,' which has long been limited, will continue to govern the situation for a long while yet to come. Hundreds of students have to be turned away from its doors every year, and, as the immediate Dacca accommodation is to be for 50 students, the overflow that will rush to Dacca will fare no better. Owing to the heavy failures in the earlier examination, there may be more room in the upper classes than at present, but when the Dacca men are quite ready to claim admission in the upper classes at Calcutta, the situation will be just the same or possibly a good deal worse.

"The medical needs of the country have long been expanding owing to growth of advanced ideas of sanitation. Of those that passed between 1856 and to-day, about 1,600 or 1,700 in number not more than 100 or 150 are alive and many of them had to man important offices in the Punjab, the Central Provinces, the United Provinces, Ceylon and Burma. The Bengal residuum of fully qualified doctors is therefore clearly inadequate for the demand. I pressed this point of view upon the King Edward Memorial Committee in connection with the shape that the permanent memorial should take, and urged that a second Medical College for Bengal, for which the existing non-official institutions afforded an excellent nucleus, should be established. This was not accepted by the Committee, but seems to have appealed to the Government. A Committee was appointed to go into the matter fully under the capable guidance of General Harris, and certain schemes were nearly formulated. Unfortunately, all the institutions concerned could not immediately agree upon the scheme of amalgamation that would make them one whole or correlating entities entitling them to substantial Government help. But those who worked on the Committee—and I was one of them—were convinced that a practical amalgamation of at least the better elements and entities that are available ought not to be impossible if the matter was carefully and persistently pursued. The Government was for a time anxious to introduce a Medical Practitioners Registration Act so far as allopathic practitioners are concerned, and a Bill was ready. But an essential preliminary of keeping out quacks is the furnishing of abundant supply of qualified practitioners, not necessarily of the first quality. We want qualified practitioners of all degrees of efficiency to suit the different classes of people requiring and able to pay for their services. The Patna and the Cuttack Medical Schools are now outside the province, and there will be a falling off even in the lower grade of practitioners. On the testimony of the Dacca University Committee and of our own knowledge and experience it is clear the Calcutta Medical College cannot possibly supply the demand for the superior class of practitioner, and Dacca will not have a Medical College long. In and in the neighbourhood of Calcutta there are non-official medical schools and hospitals that are doing excellent work, some of which your Lordship has seen. The Albert Victor Hospital at Belgachia, Bhagwan Das Bugla's Marwari Hospital, the Mayo Hospital in its different branches and the new King's Hospital and the hospitals attached to the medical schools in Corporation Street, would, if properly conducted and correlated, afford excellent nucleus for a second college. Between themselves they have large funds and some endowments, and if the Government and the University were to help in the work it

[Dr. D. P. Sarbadhikari; Mr. Kuchler.]

ought not to be difficult to have a second Medical College of fair excellence. Government expenditure on sanitary work is going to increase. It is of the utmost importance for the proper administration of such larger grants that enough capable and qualified men should be in charge of such administration. The prejudices against a second Medical College are fast dying out, and the Senate of the Calcutta University, where they were unfortunately strong some time ago, are beginning to see things in a better light. Such prejudices were high when Pundit Iswar Chunder Vidyasagar of revered memory started his Metropolis Institution, but we have to-day not one but many private Arts and Science colleges in Bengal which are substantially supplementing Government work. I quite recognise the difficulties of a non-official Medical College would be considerably greater, but a great many years have elapsed since Pundit Vidyasagar, the pioneer of private Arts and Science colleges, as he was the pioneer of many good works, began his work. Capable medical graduates may not be as plentiful as Arts and Science graduates. But in quite recent times we have had in our midst distinguished non-official Physicians and Surgeons who are capable of holding their own against all comers. One such alas we lost night before last with terrific suddenness, for in Dr. Gonendra Nath Mitter's sudden death the non-official branch of the profession has suffered a heavy loss. But others we have still spared to us, men of the standing and capacity of Dr. Nilratan Sirkar whom through your Lordship's good offices we are able to welcome to the Council. Busy as these men are, they are also warm-hearted patriots, who ungrudgingly give their time, energies and money in building up places like the Belgachia Hospital. The outside world has already indications of your Lordship's great sympathy towards the better classes of these struggling institutions. We invite your Lordship to translate this sympathy and good-will into action, and to make it possible for this admirable nucleus to grow into a full and a first-class institution. And the value of the work of these struggling institutions has been appreciated in provinces other than this—in the distant Punjab, in the Straits Settlements, where their students are finding ready service and ample employment as soon as the college can supply them. The question therefore is one of ways and means. The need is securely established, and from what we have been able to gather, my Lord, in spite of the disclaimer of the Hon'ble Mr. Kuchler, Government is not without sympathy towards concentrating at all events some of the better of these institutions and bringing them together with a view to finding what help they could be in forming the nucleus of a second Medical College. So far as Government is concerned, they are doing that of their own accord and out of their own means, but that is not enough to meet the demands of the situation. The larger demands have to be met, and it is clear that unless the resources are considerably strengthened, the Calcutta University will not be able to entertain their application for affiliation. They were in communication with some hospitals in England, and it was at one time thought that if a hospital with 100 beds and the necessary equipment could be established, some of the lower English qualifications and degrees could be conferred upon the students of this college. That, however, could not meet the requirements of the situation. A *bonâ fide*, genuine second Medical College is needed, and its provision would be assured if a suitable grant were forthcoming. I therefore ask, my Lord, that such a substantial grant should be made to the proposed institution on such terms and conditions as your Excellency's advisers may be able to agree upon."

The Hon'ble MR. KÜCHLER said.—

"The Hon'ble Member has removed one difficulty by the omission of the mention of any specific sum, but I am afraid a still more formidable difficulty remains. It is perfectly clear from the report of the budget proceedings in the Imperial Council that this grant of 75 lakhs is intended only for such branches of education as come under the control of the Department of the Director of Public Instruction. In any case, with the numerous claims which there are on the part of the ordinary branches of education for assistance from the Provincial or Imperial revenues, I should strongly oppose

[The President; Dr. D. P. Sarbadhikari; Mr. Kuchler; Raja Shoshi Kanta Acharyya Chaudhuri Bahadur.]

the diversion of any portion of the funds which are now going to be made available for the purpose of medical education. Not that I am at all out of sympathy."

The Hon'ble DR. SARBADHIKARI said :—

"If I may be permitted, my Lord, to interrupt my hon'ble friend for a moment, I accepted the form that had been agreed upon with regard to the last resolution, that a substantial sum should be provided by Government. I do not indicate where it is to come from."

The PRESIDENT said :—

"You must do so."

The Hon'ble MR. KUCHLER said :—

"I am afraid this constitutes a still greater objection, for I do not think for a moment that Government will accept any resolution in connection with the budget which is now before us asking for a grant when the source from which the funds are to come is not indicated. I need hardly say that if the last part of the resolution has really been withdrawn, I need not take up the time of the Council by any further remarks, because it falls to the ground of itself, and I think the Financial Members here present will support me in this view."

The PRESIDENT said :—

"If that part is withdrawn, it falls to the ground."

The Hon'ble DR. SARBADHIKARI said :—

"Well, I am afraid, my Lord, if that is so, it will be so."

The resolution was then withdrawn.

The Hon'ble RAJA SHOSHI KANTA ACHARYYA CHAUDHURI BAHADUR said :—

"My Lord, with your Excellency's permission, I should like to modify my resolution thus :—

This Council recommends to the Governor in Council—

- (a) that a substantial sum be set apart for the supply of fresh medicines and new surgical instruments to the existing hospitals and dispensaries in rural and urban areas other than Calcutta and Dacca; and
- (b) that the said expenditure be met out of the rupees four lakhs provided for expenditure in 1913-14 from the discretionary grant of Rs. 12,00,000, subject to conditions attached by the Government of India to that grant.

"Very few words are necessary in support of this resolution. I have no doubt that the question of health of the population is as important for the Government as for the people. There is no question that by far the largest population of this Presidency lives in the rural areas and within the mufassal municipalities. That the death-rate is very high in this Presidency admits of no doubt, the mortality due to fever alone being 63·3 per cent. in 1911. Moreover, no one who has any touch with these hospitals and dispensaries in the rural areas can help being struck with their wretched condition, specially in respect of the quality of the medicine and inadequacy of surgical instruments. As this Government has pointed out in one of its recent resolutions published in the *Calcutta Gazette*, "the advance in the standard of medical requirements must involve increased expenditure." The Government has further pointed out that "economy on hospitals and dispensaries must act very hardly



[Sir William Duke.]

on poor inhabitants," for whom these charitable institutions are primarily intended. So far as I can gather, these hospitals and dispensaries number about 400, and they are the only institutions to bring up to date medical relief to about 44 millions of His Majesty's subjects. The local funds according to reliable information are absolutely inadequate to meet the growing requirements of these institutions, and I find that the Government grants come up to nearly Rs. 85,000 a year. So far as materials at my disposal enable me to say, I find that this sum is only about one-fifth of the total expenditure on hospitals and dispensaries in this Presidency. Under these circumstances, I trust this resolution will commend itself to this Council.

The Hon'ble SIR WILLIAM DUKE said :—

"I am afraid that Government will not be able to accept this resolution. I am first of all indisposed to accept what the Hon'ble Member has stated in the speech which he has circulated, as to the wretched quality of the medicines and the deficiency of the surgical instruments in the hospitals and dispensaries in the rural districts. Medicines are, I believe, in all cases, whether in Government dispensaries or in the dispensaries run by local bodies—in all cases alike—indented for through the Civil Surgeon, and they are invariably procured from approved dealers in medicines; and I fail altogether to understand how the medicines received into these institutions can be fairly described as in a wretched condition. As far as I know, there never has been any general complaint as regards quality. If there were, it would probably at once come to notice, and the medicines would go back to the suppliers, who are usually very large wholesale firms. As regards quantity, in every case the indent is scrutinised by the Civil Surgeon, and if he thought it was insufficient, or if the local body in charge of the dispensary failed to comply with the indent, I am perfectly certain it would come to notice. To the best of my knowledge and belief, the indents are adequate and the medicines are supplied. I have myself had experience for very many years in visiting rural dispensaries, and we also examine the inspection reports submitted by the Civil Surgeon, in which some of the principal questions to be answered relate to the supply of medicines. One of them is—Is the supply of medicines adequate? Every now and then one finds that the Civil Surgeon notes that though the supply is generally adequate a particular medicine is short. Some medicines are very much run on, and perhaps they fall short, and then steps are taken to increase the indent for the following year. But that there is anything like a general shortage, I think is not the case. I am not, of course, prepared to say that every dispensary throughout the mufassal is as it ought to be, that everything is strictly and properly done, but although here and there miscalculations may be made or accidents may take place, or stock may be kept for too long, I should be very much surprised indeed if that sort of thing is general. If the Hon'ble Member has a specific instance in his mind, and will bring it to notice in the proper quarter, no doubt it will be dealt with, but to admit that there is a general deficiency in this respect, Government is certainly not prepared. Coming now to the question of surgical instruments. In the smaller rural dispensaries the medical officers in charge are seldom able to perform major operations, but even so the general experience is that in any district the dispensaries are equipped with far more instruments than are ever used. In fact in several dispensaries I have gone through in recent years, there have been cases of instruments, the instruments of a generation gone by, the greater part of which are never used at all; and, in fact, nothing is used except the pocket case which the Sub-Assistant Surgeon carries about with him. In dispensaries of a superior class there is a demand for superior instruments, and as far as I know, whenever that demand is made it is met. A great deal of the money which is at the disposal of the Commissioners for removing defects in local institutions, goes in this way. Much of the grant which is at the disposal of the head of the province for similar purposes goes in the same way in the course of his tour. In my experience, when going through a rural hospital, it is sometimes found that items of equipment which could be used have not been supplied, and, so far as I have observed, when



[Sir William Duke; Babu Surendra Nath Ray.]

any want of that kind is brought to notice it is met. I cannot think that there is any such general want as requires a special grant. At any rate, it has never come to the notice of Government. I may say one thing more and that is that there is certainly no object in spending large sums of money in providing stocks of drugs which could not be used and which will deteriorate, and equipment which will rapidly go out of date. The indents are calculated to the ordinary consumption, and it would be an absolute waste to indent for more. A mistake which may occasionally occur is indenting for excessive amount of drugs, more than can be used up during the year, so that the stale drugs remain in stock. That is the last thing which should be encouraged. We should provide enough, with a sufficient margin, and no more. I hope that in view of this explanation the Hon'ble Member will withdraw his Resolution."

The Resolution was withdrawn.

The Hon'ble BABU SURENDRA NATH RAY moved the following Resolution :—

"This Council recommends to the Governor in Council that the sum of Rs. 6½ lakhs provided for expenditure in the budget out of the 20 lakhs assigned for sanitation by the Government of India, be set apart for the use of mufassal municipalities, to enable them to make due provision for the supply of pure drinking water and of drainage."

He said :—

"My Lord, the above resolution which I am going to move is a simple one, and one which I trust will meet with the support of Your Excellency's Government. Since Your Excellency has taken over charge of the Government of this province, Your Excellency has taken up the subject of sanitation of the province, and among the subjects of sanitation those which have specially occupied Your Excellency's time and attention are the supply of pure drinking water and improvement of drainage of the rural area. In October last Your Excellency was pleased to convene a conference at Darjeeling to devise the best means of grappling with these questions in the rural area. It is admitted on all hands that there is a crying want for good drinking water, for drainage and for jungle-cutting not only in the rural but in the urban area as well, and it is essential that steps should be taken to carry out these and some other sanitary reforms. But where is the money to come from? The ordinary income of municipalities is not sufficient to carry out these sanitary improvements. As a result of want of pure drinking water and improved drainage, municipal towns and villages are being gradually depopulated, and the scourge of malaria is raging in them for at least 5 out of 12 months in the year. Government no doubt may say that if people want to live a healthy life, they must be prepared to pay for the same. But unfortunately from my experience of municipalities, extending over nearly a quarter of a century, I am in a position to state that in most of these municipalities ordinary sanitary improvements cannot be effected with their ordinary income, and that the income of most of the municipalities is not elastic. What the Right Hon'ble W. N. Massey, some time Finance Member to the Government of India, said before the Select Committee on Indian Finance in 1871 as regards Indian finance generally, is true of most of the mufassal municipalities. He said: "Your resources are so limited, that if you should overrun the constable a little, you are at once landed in a deficit. You cannot expand any of your taxation; you cannot create new taxations."

The people of the province are grateful to the Imperial Government for the transfer to the District Boards of the whole of the Public Works cess, and this will, to quote the words of the Hon'ble Sir William Duke, "be appreciated in quarters where interest in the financial policy of Government seldom penetrates." . . . This will result, to quote again his words, "in local self-government becoming much more real, being extended downwards until it is in much closer contact with the people, and finding itself in a

[Babu Surendra Nath Ray.]

position to deal with those questions of village sanitation and village water-supply which have so forced themselves upon our attention of late." A brighter day is dawning upon the District Boards of Bengal, and I have every reason to believe that the subject of supply of pure drinking water in the rural area will be solved of itself in the near future.

"My present prayer is, however, as regards the mufassal municipalities.

"I am fully aware of the fact that Government have been pleased in some municipalities where the case has been properly put before them to contribute handsome amounts for such works as supply of filtered water or improvement of drainage. But such assistance should be general and regular.

"If the Government have really the good of the people at heart, and no one doubts the sincerity of Government's intentions, it ought to contribute liberally to all municipalities. I know of municipalities near Calcutta which have to keep up, at least externally, a high standard of efficiency on account of its contiguity to the second city in the Empire and the first city in the East, but which on account of want of funds they are not in a position to do. I know of municipalities which have been able to show some improvements, not with the income from the rate-payers or any contribution from Government, but on account of private contributions from patriotic gentlemen or influential European mercantile firms. It appears from the figures supplied to me that in the year 1909-10 the grant from Provincial funds to municipalities was Rs. 6,21,284, and, in the years 1910-11 and 1911-12, Rs. 4,46,164 and Rs. 5,09,025, respectively. The grant from private individuals to municipalities during the same period was Rs. 1,08,481, Rs. 2,54,044 and Rs. 1,51,943. I have learnt from enquiry that in some cases the proprietors of large mills have not only supplied their own labourers with filtered water, but have most generously supplied the same to the municipalities where they have got their mills. But every municipality in the province is not fortunate enough to have mills in them under European management, nor rich and patriotic landlords to carry on works of benefaction. Under these circumstances, it is but meet and proper that the people should look up to Government for help and support.

"The municipal authorities are fully alive to the needs and requirements of the municipalities of the province. The following extracts from the Bengal Administration Report for 1909-10 and 1910-11 will show how there has been gradual increase in the expenditure for sanitary improvements :—

"The gradual increase in expenditure by municipality upon sanitary improvement, which was marked last year, was maintained in 1908-09, the total expenditure on conservancy, drainage and water-supply being Rs. 21,97,380, or an increase of Rs. 2,48,557 over the figures for 1907-08 (Bengal Administration Report for 1909-10, page 112, paragraph 597).

"The total expenditure by municipalities on conservancy, drainage and water-supply during the year 1909-10 continued to increase, and amounted to Rs. 24,88,154, which is Rs. 2,90,774 in excess of the figures for 1908-09 (Bengal Administration Report, 1910-11, page 117, paragraph 550)."

"No one can say, not even the detractors of local self-government, that the municipal authorities ever waste the money of the rate-payers, or fritter them away or spend the same in useless expenditure. They have invariably been found to be the trusted custodians of the rate-payers' money. Whatever is realised from the rate-payers is spent for their benefit. But, as I have already said, the money at their disposal is not generally sufficient to meet the ordinary expenditure. Theirs is generally a tale of poverty. But, if on the one hand it is a tale of poverty, on the other hand the necessities of the mufassal municipalities of the urban area are very great.

"The appointment of well-paid Health Officers and Sanitary Inspectors will not be of much use in mufassal municipalities. We want pure drinking water, we want improved drainage, we want jungles to be cut down. We certainly do not want at this stage highly paid Health Officers and Sanitary Inspectors for the improvement of the sanitation of our municipalities.

[Babu Surendra Nath Ray.]

"The following extract from the *Amrita Bazar Patrika*, dated the 2nd October last, gives only a true picture of the state of the province :—

"It is something like desolation in all Bengal villages, and it has gone on increasing during the last 40 years or more. This means the threatened extinction of the Bengali race. The only way to save them from their terrible fate is to make our villages, now the dens of malaria and cholera, overgrown with such jungles and honey combed with dirty pools of water, habitable."

"I have been to several of the mufassal municipalities, and I have seen in several places nothing but roads passing through what once were orchards and residential localities, but now overgrown with jungles and rank vegetation, and houses in ruination with one or two solitary occupants, reminding one of the words of the poet, "Death and silence hold their own."

"It is said that there are about 16 or 17 lakhs of people who die from malaria every year in this very province. With no drainage or many of the natural drains closed, generally with no pure water for drinking and both villages and urban areas overgrown with jungles, it is not surprising that the mufassal towns and villages should be in an unhealthy condition.

"From the amended Draft Financial Statement for Bengal for 1913-14 it appears that there is a provision of 12½ lakhs as grant for sanitary improvements. Of this amount, Rs. 6,71,725 have already been sanctioned, or will probably be sanctioned, for some of the proposed sanitary improvements in some of the municipalities of the province. It also appears that, out of this amount of Rs. 6,71,725, Rs. 4,02,833 are for sanitary improvements of the Burdwan Division alone. I do not grudge this. But it is necessary that other and more important divisions should also be provided with substantial grants from Government to carry on the works of sanitation which are being matured or which can be taken up for their improvement, and that the amount of 20 lakhs allotted by the Government of India for urban sanitation but of which amount only 6½ lakhs are available this year for expenditure should be set apart for distribution to the mufassal municipalities to carry on such works of sanitation as the supply of drinking water and drainage. I do not understand why it has been necessary to make provision in the Financial Statement for re-grant of non-utilized, non-recurring grant for sanitation to the extent for Rs. 2,60,970 (see page 30 of the Draft Financial Statement). Could not this amount have been distributed to the municipalities and District Boards of the province during the year?

"The year has been a year of remarkable prosperity, and there has been a provision of nearly 1½ crores by the Government of India in their annual Financial Statement for 1913-14 for sanitation for the country, and Bengal has come in for its share and has been promised 20 lakhs of rupees out of which however only 6½ lakhs are provided for expenditure in the budget this year. It is not expected that such a large grant would be made every year by the Government of India. It is therefore necessary that the whole of this amount should be given to the mufassal municipalities for the supply of pure drinking water and for drainage, the two most crying needs of the province.

"There are, I think, about 111 municipalities in the province. These municipalities are the centres of urban life, and are in many cases either district or subdivisional head-quarters or places of trade and commerce. Their importance is recognised. There is in Bengal generally a complaint by Government officials, both Indian and European, against, and reluctance on their part to go to, mufassal towns on account of their unhealthiness. It is therefore as much to the interest of the people as of Government that the mufassal towns should be healthy.

"The prayer is made betimes, and it is hoped that Government would be pleased to show their appreciation of the needs of the people by allotting the whole amount of grant of the Government of India for urban sanitation to the mufassal municipalities of the province to carry on the work of supply of pure drinking water and drainage."

[*Babu Surendra Nath Ray; Maharaja Ranajit Sinha of Nashipur; Babu Upendra Nath Ray.*]

"My Lord, the original resolution which I wanted to move was that the whole amount of the Imperial grant of Rs. 20 lakhs for urban sanitation be given to the mufassal municipalities for supply of pure drinking water and drainage. But I am sorry that my original resolution had to be modified, as I understand that the grant of 20 lakhs for urban sanitation in Bengal which was announced both in the Financial Statement of the Government of India and also of Bengal is not available for expenditure this year. It appears that the Government of India had entered only 6½ lakhs on the expenditure side of the Bengal provincial budget on sanitation, and that is the only amount available this year for urban sanitation from out of the Imperial grant. I need hardly say that I was sorely disappointed when I learnt that only about one-third of the original grant was available this year, and I think that disappointment will be shared by every Member of this Council. How much good would not this amount of 20 lakhs have done? Hope deferred maketh the heart sick. But it is useless to bewail our lot. We must be prepared to act according to our present changed circumstances."

The Hon'ble MAHARAJA RANAJIT SINHA said :—

"My Lord, I desire to move an amendment to this resolution. I would substitute the words 'a substantial grant' in place of the words 'the sum of Rs. 6½ lakhs;' and that the words 'and of jungle cutting' be added at the end of the Resolution."

The Hon'ble BABU SURENDRA NATH RAY said :—

"My Lord, I accept the amendment."

The Hon'ble BABU UPENDRA NATH RAY said :—

"With your Excellency's permission I wish to say a few words in support of this resolution.

"In doing so I beg to suggest that the demand for the supply of pure drinking water to the mufassal municipalities is well known, and with the limited funds at their disposal many of them can hardly manage to cope with their requirements. The want of pure drinking water is a source of malaria and epidemic diseases, carrying away several souls every year from big towns, and many of them are not fortunate in having wealthy residents who can come forward with liberal donations for supply of pure drinking water. Ample opportunities should, therefore, be given to the mufassal municipalities for utilizing a substantial amount out of the assignment of Rs. 20 lakhs made by the Government of India for sanitation, and that the sum of Rs. 6½ lakhs provided for expenditure in the budget be set apart for the use of mufassal municipalities for the purpose of drainage. I know that some of the municipalities have detailed schemes in hand in this connection, and at Chittagong itself the Government of Eastern Bengal and Assam very generously spent more than Rs. 50,000 over experimental borings which have proved successful, but the scheme has not yet been taken in hand only for want of funds. The whole of this money will be wasted if the project is not carried through. The Chittagong Municipality has prepared a complete scheme costing about Rs. 3,50,000 and has already submitted it with an application for loan and grants in three different shapes to your Excellency's Government. Other municipalities also have got similar projects. I therefore suggest that the resolution moved by the Hon'ble Babu Surendranath Ray, with the amendments to which the Hon'ble Member is agreed, be given full consideration by this Council and his suggestions accepted."

The Hon'ble MAHARAJA RANAJIT SINHA of Nashipur said :—

"My Lord, I desire to associate myself with what has fallen from the Hon'ble mover of the resolution. In this respect the mufassal municipalities are in no way in a better position than the rural district boards. Since the



[Maharaja Ranajit Sinha of Nashipur; Babu Surendra Nath Banerji.]

assumption of your exalted office Your Excellency's attention has already been drawn to this important subject, viz., the supply of drinking water in the rural areas. In the municipalities—I have some experience, being the Chairman of a municipality for 12 years—the resources of the municipalities are so limited that they cannot devote any adequate sum for this important matter. The Government generally grant one-third of the estimated cost for the water-works, but it is impossible for most of the municipalities to make a provision even for the two-thirds. Most of the houses in many municipalities are almost surrounded with thick jungle and rank vegetation. It is not only injurious to the health of the people residing therein but, also, it becomes sometimes a nest of wild animals and snakes. I hope that Your Excellency's Government will be able to find money for the mufassal municipalities which is required to supply the need of pure drinking water, drainage and jungle-clearing."

The Hon'ble BABU SURENDRA NATH BANERJI said :—

• "My Lord, it is a significant fact that out of the three Members who have spoken on this resolution two are chairmen of two important municipalities. I happen to be the chairman of a mufassal municipality and also have been so for the last 28 years. I can speak therefore with some amount of authority as to the wants and needs of municipalities, and I desire to associate myself with the appeal which my Hon'ble friend the mover of the resolution has made to Your Excellency's Government for the devotion of a substantial sum of money for the purpose of rural sanitation. My Lord, Your Excellency's Government has taken a deep interest in the question of sanitation, and that interest has evoked a deep gratitude in the minds of our people. There has not been a more striking illustration of the concern which Your Excellency feels in this important than the conference which Your Excellency was pleased to call in October last. I am sure that the conference will be productive of substantial results. My Lord, in this matter deliberation is good, but money is better. We may have many fine projects, but for want of money we cannot carry them out. If the necessary funds are not forthcoming, it would be quite useless to have fine projects for rural or urban sanitation. My Lord, my friend asks Your Excellency's Government not to adopt but to carry out a policy which Your Excellency has deliberately adopted, for my friend has just pointed out that schemes of rural water-supply have already been started in the Chittagong Municipality. I can bear my personal testimony to an important sanitary scheme which has been carried out in my own municipality, and which has been productive of the most beneficial results. The municipality over which I have the honour to preside contains an area in which malarial fever used to break out every year. This went on for years; then about three years ago Government made a sanitary survey and started a scheme of reclamation and of drainage. It spent about Rs. 25,000 upon this scheme, and what has been the result? Malarial fever has practically disappeared. I invite Your Excellency's Government to extend these benefits throughout the length and breadth of our mufassal municipalities, and then Your Excellency will confer an unspeakable boon upon our rural population. The extract from the *Amrita Bazar Patrika* quoted by my friend, the Hon'ble mover, does not exaggerate the situation. My Lord, if anybody visits any mufassal village, he will find it full of dilapidated houses covered with thick jungles. These places which were once the habitations of wealth and prosperity, are now the haunts of jackals and snakes. We know that thousands of our people die every year from the scourge of malaria, and thousands are dilapidated for life also owing to this terrible visitation. For these reasons, I would most earnestly appeal to Your Excellency to accept the suggestion which has been made by my friend, the Hon'ble mover. With regard to the particular sum, it may be 6 lakhs or more, but the principle which my friend desires Your Excellency to adopt is a principle which you have already carried out with the most beneficent results.

"I thoroughly associate myself with this proposal, and hope that my friend, the Hon'ble Member in charge of the Sanitary Department, will be in a position to give a reply which will have a reassuring effect upon the public mind