

CO-RELATION OF MUSIC WITH SPIRITUALISM AND PHILOSOPHY

An Analytical Study

Madhu Bala Saxena

This article, while highlighting the philosophical and spiritual values of music, purports to demonstrate its significant correlation with philosophy and to focus attention on the unique capacity of Indian music to lift one's mental state from worldly to transcendental level.

Spiritualists have recognized "Brahma" as the formless supreme power and regarded its worship as the best means of attaining liberation or "Moksha". Likewise, the base of music i.e. "Nada" has also been regarded as formless and devotion towards it is considered to result in spiritual happiness and the attainment of the ultimate emancipation. Moksha. In Indian tradition the "Nada" and "Brahma" are viewed as closely related. Thus we find a reference to worship of "Nadabrahma" in literature on music.¹ One scholar goes to the extent of taking the view that "Nada" is the परावाक्शक्ति of Brahma and a means to attain "Brahma" itself.² It has been stated:

"Nada is the Sakti of Brahma, synonymous with Paravak. By worshipping the Sakti of Brahma which is closely related to Brahma we can attain Brahma itself, just as a man moved by the lustre of a gem attains the gem itself."³

Similarly, there is a link between Brahma, Nada and Music which has been authoritatively appraised in a recent study as follows:

"Yoga Tantra has considered "Nada" as primordial sound to be the cause of the phenomenal world. The basic elements of this world are earth, water, fire, air and ether perceived correspondingly by the senses of smell, taste, vision, touch, and hearing. Sound is considered to be the manifestation of Nada which is described as Nadabrahma and thus equated with the absolute of the Upanishads."⁴

In one more important study it has been noted that the Yogi by making the human body a laboratory and workshop for spiritual Sadhana realized many truths of which Nada (corresponding to sound) and Sangita are of very great importance. These truths were considered as means of attaining self-realization and Jeewan Mukti.⁵ Eminent scholars have prescribed two ways to realize the ultimate aim of the final emancipation (Moksha). According to the first method one has to single-mindedly concentrate on meditation by renouncing all worldly pleasures. In the second method, one attempts to reach the ultimate aim of life by dividing life into four parts, i.e. Brahmacharya, Grehastha, Vanprastha & Sanyas, and passing through each of them deriving pleasure and beauty in measure permitted by the state of his age, without really clinging to them. For this, a man has to live apart from selfishness & has to observe eight principles prescribed by Yoga philosophy known as Yogang:⁶ Yam—Practice of non-violence, truth, chastity etc.; Niyam—Practice of precepts of contentment, devotion, regular study, mental concentration in God etc.; Asan (Yogic postures)—enjoyable physical state; Pranayam—inhalation, retention, exhaling of air; Pratyahar or Indriya Sanyam (Refraining sense organs or control of senses)—Practice of turning off the senses from worldly pleasures; Dharna (Retention)—Practice of centering the mind on some internal or external object; Dhyana (contemplation)—firm and continuous thinking about any subject; Samadhi (Meditation)—the state of complete concentration on meditative object. It has been stated that in the physical frame of body, which is purified by the practice of yogang, the awakened Kundalini illumines by its glow all the inner centres (चक्र) and parts of the entire body. At this stage the direct vision of truth is attained and yogi achieves the ultimate scientific knowledge of the secret, mystic and spiritual aspect of each and every element.⁷

In this manner there is an inbuilt aesthetic appeal or beauty in the first stage of every work of a man providing mental and physical happiness to him. However, when a man disassociates himself from worldly pleasures and gets absorbed in the blissful state of consciousness (rasa) the same beauty can be stated to have reached its peak form simultaneously converting itself into a primary stage of gaining spiritual experience. Beauty is of two types: Natural & art-oriented.⁸ Here we are going to reflect on the art-oriented beauty. Inasmuch as it is a source of providing mental and material (physical) happiness, this beauty at worldly level appears to be pleasure piquant, whereas the same beauty at the spiritual level in the aftermath of the moral awakening of man becomes the source of supreme bliss (*Ananda*) in the form of providing happiness to the soul, which can be called experience of divine beauty.

Scholars of Aesthetics take the view that aesthetic enjoyment or pleasure emerging from the experience of *Rasa* at the worldly level leads a person to the path of supreme bliss, whereas the spiritualists have called the supreme bliss resulting from deep meditation (spiritual Sadhana) as the

real beauty and have named it Godliness (God-realization).⁹ Thus, the aim of contemplation by Aestheticians and Spiritualists is the same though their ways to attain it vary a great deal. Much the same position of beauty is found in music.¹⁰ At the worldly level music through its beautiful form evolving from the skill and genius of an artist becomes a source of enjoyment wherein lies an in-built process of experience, but regular and hard practice of music conjoined with the artist's intuitive devotion towards it resulting in the experience of supreme *Rasa* becomes the medium of moral awakening of man.¹¹ In music, *Nada* is stated to have two forms: *Ahat* & *Anahat*.¹² Subtle sound located in the mind "Brahmarandhra" is called *Anahat Nada*, meaning *Nada* produced without beat (unstricken sound). Saints and sages meditate by centering their mind on this *Anahat Nada*. On the other hand, *Nada* produced by the force of air on vocal chords in throat, by force of hands on percussion instruments and by force of Bow or Jawa on stringed instruments etc. is called *Ahat Nada*. The structure of the Art of Music is evolved from this *Ahat Nada* which after reaching the stage of climax in terms of providing eternal divinity (आत्मिकदिव्यता) leads to moral awakening & spiritual prosperity of man, and in the same process that form of *Nada* drives his state of consciousness towards *Anahat Nada*. During this process of moral awakening, the unbreakable correlation of philosophy, particularly Yoga philosophy and Art of Music is established.

II

Philosophy and spiritualism are mutually reinforcing and interdependent. The fundamental principle of Indian philosophy is manifested in an effort, on the part of man, to acquire metaphysical knowledge which would enable him to lead the life of moral excellence, once he has relieved himself of the psychological conflict using his power of long-sightedness, future-sightedness and insight.¹³ It is generally believed that Indian philosophy displays total despair and, in consequence, it produces harmful effects on daily life. This view is not very persuasive. It is of course true that to some extent Indian philosophy, viewing the present state of material conditions of the world, gets pensive and distressed and therefore it is identifiable with despairism, nevertheless, in actual practice, it does not reveal so much dejection as is attributed to it. On the contrary, it makes realistic efforts at relieving the world of its painful conditions. Thus, even though Indian philosophy has been evolved from despairism, it leads to the path of hope. The influence of despairism on life is more beneficial than that of tactless optimism, because despairism cautions man about forthcoming difficulties whereas undue optimism affords him just unfounded hopes resulting in complacency.¹⁴ As in the case of philosophy, so also in the case of spiritualism it is indeed the mental attitude towards the latter which keeps a man attentively conscious about hope and the institution of eternal morality of the universe. Thus, it is the state of mind of a man towards philosophy and spiritualism that leads him to the direct path of attaining final emancipation

(Moksha) after rescuing him from the dangers of highly unpredictable conditions of hope and despair. So that this proposition may have a practical shape, it must be supported with one or the other foundation whether it be in the form of devotion to art or Yoga, or just dedication to one's deity. The extent of spiritual state of mind is revealed in how much one can detach his soul from worldly happiness and sorrow and attain a state of perfect concentration.

God resides in the music of devotees. This is the gist of—

नाहं वसामि बैकुण्ठे योगिनां हृदये न च;
मदमक्ता यत्र गायन्ति तत्र तिष्ठामि नारदः ।

which implies that the art of music and spiritualism are closely related to each other. The base of music is sweet and soothing sound whose subtle structure or form is *Nada*. *Shruti* has originated from *Nada*, and *Swara* from *Shruti*. It is the profusion of *swara* which designs the beautiful grand structure of music. By according importance to the worship of *Nada* equal to that of devotion to Yoga, the learned scholars have recognized music, within the framework of the fine arts, as the best mode of attaining the final emancipation.

Emphasizing the importance of *Nada*, it has been stated in Shastras:

न नादेन विना गीतम् न नादेन विना स्वराः ।
न नादेन विना वृतं तस्मान्नादात्मकं जगत् ॥
नादरूपः स्मृतो ब्रह्मा नादरूपो जनार्दनः ।
नादरूपा पराशक्तिनीदरूपो महेश्वरः ॥

Not only has *Nada* been considered as a means of worshiping *Brahma*, the supreme power, transcendental self etc., but in the process it itself has been turned into the object of devotion and worship. From the perspective of seeking spiritual bliss it is indeed the uniqueness and novelty of the Indian music that as it is being driven towards *Anahat Nada*, it tends to yield accelerating divine pleasure. Thus a balanced combination of various parts, *Yam*, *Niyam*, *Dhyan*, *Dharana*, *Pranayam* etc. as described in Indian philosophy and various qualities and talents of an artist accompanied by his *sadhara* of music make it possible to move from *Ahat* to *Anahat* and correspondingly from worldly to transcendental plane ensuring a proper place for spiritual thinking in the framework of music *sadhana*.

Spiritualism and philosophy constitute the firm foundation stones of the beauty of music. Full with shining light of spiritual intuition or sentiments the beauty of music brightens the soul of man with inner or eternal light of consciousness, whereas beauty without spiritual touch provides

a man with just enjoyment in the form of material happiness or worldly pleasures. There are numerous branches of philosophy such as Charwak, Jain, Buddha, Nyaya, Vaisheshik, Sankhya, Yoga, Mimanasa and Vedanta. Although the metaphysical thoughts underlying these branches vary a great deal with each other, nevertheless, all have made the final emancipation (Moksha) as the ultimate aim of life. Of these, the Yoga, Vedanta, Nyaya and Sankhya philosophy have exercised more profound influence than others on music. but even among these the Yoga philosophy is regarded to have cast the greatest impact on the practical aspect of Music. The principal subject of Yoga philosophy is found in the practice of Yoga.¹⁵ The Yogic spirit is called Retention. Of the special elements of Yoga, "concentration" and "indolence" are of great importance. In the state of concentration, the mind centres on a specific object, whereas in the state of indolence the faculty of thinking just ceases to function. The condition of Music is similar to this. In music, the initial singleminded concentration is subsequently replaced by the state of forgetting the self when, after concentrating on particular swara combinations the structure of the raga is formed and the mood of the raga is fully established, the artist, forgetting his material world, gets totally absorbed in *rasa* or intuitive sentiments.

For reaching the goal of God-realization through music *Sadhana*, it has been considered necessary to equip oneself with qualities similar to those associated with "Yogang", as described earlier, such as simple nature, self-discipline (consciousness), contentment, devotion, yogic posture, distinct from a inhaling, retention, exhaling of air, practice of restraining sense organs, continuous undivided attention and concentration.

From the above, it follows that in Indian tradition the art of Music has had always direct co-relation with spiritualism and philosophy. Indian spiritualism recognizes "Brahma" as the base of Godliness or beauty; Yoga philosophy considers the techniques of concentration, contemplation and devotion etc. as of special importance in the worship of Brahma. These techniques have natural link with music practice. For instance, the performance of pranayam, representing as it does the first stage of yoga knowledge, is identifiable with the natural use of the long breath in the practice of music. To this extent yoga and music project an image of unity. Thus the realization of transcendental bliss, which according to the learned scholars is possible through the medium of constant concentration of *Anahat Nada*, can be attained by a musician as well through *Ahat Nada*, implying "Swara Sadhana". On realization of *Ananda*, one forgets himself & the surrounding environment and then experiences transcendental bliss. If a *raga* has been properly developed, formed, and has undergone "Swara Sadhana" in the hands of a skilled artist, there is no doubt that, within the limits imposed by the particular style of music, transcendental bliss of *Ananda* can be achieved for sometime, even if the immediate aim of rendering that *raga* is entertainment only. In this way, moving from worldly to

transcendental, the aim of Indian music is to realize *Anahat* through *Ahat*. Of various mediums to attain the ultimate, the art of Music has been considered to be the most appealing to intuitions or inner feelings. Moreover, the experiment of music in the form of an effort to discover the ultimate, as unity in multiplicity, is especially significant.

In almost all treatises from Samveda to Sangeet Ratnakar some thought has definitely been given to the subject of the co-relation between spiritualism & music. This has continued in succeeding periods also, with the exception of Mughal period. In modern times spiritual values of music have regularly been appreciated and adopted in practice by music lovers and practitioners. Indeed, the ultimate aim of human life is to attain final emancipation (*Moksha*), therefore, even when a man remains busy in worldly affairs, there remain somewhere in him some intuitive feelings in subconscious mind to discover transcendental bliss and peace, or to attain emancipation in the form of spiritual peace. The ultimate aim of art is also the realization of transcendental bliss or to lift the human soul above the worldly pleasures and nourish it with supreme bliss. An art which is taken only as an instrument or medium to provide worldly pleasures is not considered as "art" by great scholars. The real aim of art is self-realizations, as has been stated in Shastras:

विश्रान्तिर्यस्य सम्भोगे सा कला न कला मता ।
लीयते परमानन्दे ययात्मा सा परा कला ॥

It is the realization of supreme bliss which nourishes the soul with "Rasa". When fully absorbed in *Rasa*, one can momentarily experience the presence of God or his image in the form of supreme bliss. Recognizing this very experience as the highest form of *Ananda* or *Rasa* and identifying *Rasa* with "Brahma",¹⁶ it has been said "Raso via Sah". Indian philosophers and scholars carried *Bhavas* (moods) like Beauty, *Ananda*, Happiness, *Rasa* etc. to such a level of spirituality where all *rasas* received the supporting base of spiritualism¹⁷ after being united with human soul in an indissoluble form of experience. Not only in the case of music, but in respect of other arts also, spiritual experience has been considered as the principal aim to be sought. Every artist wants to carry his art to the level of moral culmination and thereafter spiritual experience.

As through music one can experience the best form of *Rasa*, it will be true to say that music occupies the best place among arts. It is universally accepted that by contemplating, by procreating *raga*, by means of various combinations of *swaras*, by treating *raga* as worshipful idol, and by maintaining deep faith and belief in it as God, the best form of *rasa* can be experienced. As long as the musician does not succeed in constructing the form of *raga*, a critical struggle of *swaras* goes on in his mind. But once he has succeeded in structuring *raga* pleasing musical *swaras* in *Anahat chakra*

or *Brahma granthi*. (2) *Ghatawastha*—In this stage as the vital air enters *Vishnu granthi* located in the throat, the *Nada & Bindu* are united. (3) *Parichay*—In this stage the vital air enters into *Ajna chakra* located between two eyebrows on the mind or the (forehead). (4) *Nishpatti*. At this stage the vital air reaches the mind or Brahmarandhra. In this condition music is at climax and at that moment without reflecting any weakness or strength of any aspect of music the musician realizes the highest point of divine light. It is at this stage that a yogi experiences supreme bliss.

III

It is generally observed that the co-relation between music and the worship of God has had an uninterrupted history from the time of the Vedas.²⁰ In all forms of worship of God such as *Kirtan*, *Bhajan*, *Arati*, *Mantracharan*, etc. the impact of music has been significant. "Shakti" or worship is supposed to be of two kinds—*Ragi & Vaidhi*.²¹ Possibly, Music can serve as medium in both, but in *Vaidhi Bhakti* it has to be presented within the set limits of the rules of shastras, whereas in *Ragi Bhakti* in the form of singing, *Kirtan* & dance etc. in praise of God, the state of engrossment remains overpowering. In Indian tradition while showing the correlation between music and God and Goddesses, Narad alongwith *Ektara*, Shrikrishna with his flute, Vishnu with his conch, Shiva with his *Damru* rendering *Tandav Dance*, Saraswati with her *Veena*, & Krishna with *Gopikas* rendering *Rasa* dance have been regarded as experts in Music. Shiva as an expert in Dance, has been called as *Nateshwara*; likewise Krishna has been named as *Natwar* or *Murlidhar*; Saraswati is known as *Veenavadini*. Not only this, among saint-musicians like Surdas, Meera, Tulsidas etc., the so-called poets of *Ashtachhapa* also accomplished devotional poetical work of extremely fascinating value through music.

In real life because of the relationship of pain and pleasure with selfishness, a man actually feels himself happy or unhappy, but if the same pain & pleasure are presented in the form of art, the experience of both proves, from the standpoint of *Rasa*, to be delightful. When this experience of *Ananda* reaches deep inward in its best form, it assumes transcendental power to attract the soul. At this point the name of any special *Rasa* or *Rajoguna* or *Tamoguna* becomes meaningless and there is aroused in inner spirit consciousness which leads man towards self-advancement. The ideal of art is "Truth, prosperity & beauty". Therefore, the art, which can generate noble sentiments in a human soul, is supreme.

In general, it can be said that harmonious unity of musical notes and deep concentration can make music supremely effective. Even particular styles like *Dhrupad*, *Dhamar*, *Khyal*, *Thumri*, *Tappa* etc. according to their respective forms are recognized as particularly suitable for producing specific kinds of *Rasa*. For instance *Khyal* style of music, along with the

dominance of *Shringar*, *Karun*, *Shant*, *Bhakti* and *Veer* Rasa, occupy a place of very great significance. Similarly, in *Thumri* *Shringara* rasa becomes prominent; in *tappa* and *tarana* etc.—because of forceful tanas-sentiments of wonder and Queerness dominate and in *Dhrupad* and *Dhamar*, *Shant*, *Vir* and *Bhakti* rasa can be singled out as predominant. These many different styles of music combined with the varying kinds of rasas which are generated in the process of disciplined rendering of music can be turned into the modes of spiritual expression of music, because the co-relation between music and spiritualism is not based on the experience of any particular “Rasa” but it is an expression of transcendentalness and divinity of Rasa. For producing particular Rasa, the application of appropriate notes and combination of ordered multitude of sounds is necessary, whereas for creating spirituality and divineness in any specific Rasa, it is necessary for an artist to have individuality, skill, intellect and particularly devotion to Music.

Like the notes or tones, *Laya* (Rhythm) is also an equally important component of music which plays constructive role in nourishing Rasa. Broadly speaking, the use of *chautal*, *Dhamar* and *Sultal* in slow tempo is appropriate for creating *Bhakti*, *Vir* and *Shant* Rasa etc. Likewise *Teental*, *Dadra*, *Kaharva*, *Rupak*, *Jhaptal* and *Dipchandi* etc. in medium tempo are appropriate for producing *shringar*, *Karun* Rasa etc. On the other hand, in fast tempo the use of any tal displays excitement and agility. Thus, there are variety of factors responsible for the accomplishment of Rasa and its graceful form conducive to creating moral awakening in man and uplifting his mental state so as to experience transcendental bliss. These factors include artist's personality and his art-skill, personality of the listener and his state of mental consciousness at that time, conditions and environment, style of music and its form and specific rendering according to the mood of raga. A balanced combination of all these aspects of music helps in maintaining an everlasting link between Music and spiritual thinking of Music and transcendental bliss (*Ananda*).

IV

The above discussion leads to certain conclusions.

Music has been totally influenced by the fundamental principles of philosophy. Directing man towards spiritualism, both music & philosophy place emphasis upon self-realization and moral excellence, and in this way, lead him to the path of unity of soul and God (Brahma) i.e. moksha. The philosophy, after critically evaluating the co-relation of soul & God, and of sorrow & happiness, inspires one to work selflessly and to singlemindedly concentrate by keeping oneself away from worldly affairs. In the same way, music is regarded in its first stage as a source of entertainment of the minds of living beings and of creation of intuitive sentiments i.e. rasa, which by

themselves, through the medium of contemplation, inspire the artist to attain the level of transcendentalness. On reaching this stage, an artist does not remain just an artist, but becomes a 'Yogi' who, roaming in the sea of *rasa* and simultaneously keeping himself away from worldly distractions, gets sunk in the spiritual framework of music. In this way, the philosophical and spiritual aspects of music have been always strong as a result of which a man by means of *sadhana* of *Ahat Nada* is attracted towards *anahata nada* and is lifted from worldly pleasures to transcendental bliss. Because of this special quality of music, self-realization and moral excellence through unremitting music *sadhana* become possible of achievement making the path of realizing the final emancipation for him easy and simple. In yoga, the single-minded concentration is significant, but for an artist it is essential to have a number of qualities like brilliance in singing, skill, imagination or creative mind, deep knowledge of the theory of music, a feeling and sympathetic heart, ability to express & experience subtle emotional sentiments (*rasa*) and so on. Side by side, the qualities of contemplation and thinking are very important. A balanced combination of all these, representing the spirit of music and its real significance & value, will alone enable the artist to move from worldly pleasures to transcendental bliss (*Ananda*). For achieving this balance, it has been suggested by a contemporary scholar that the artist "should first attain proficiency in history, science, theory, psychology, and aesthetic philosophy of music and then realize the true significance of art."²² "Otherwise", he adds, "it (music) will be a meaningless and aimless reproduction of tones and tunes, resulting in a blind imitation of life and motive force."²³

An artist proves to be successful not only in his own moral advancement but, in a way, of the entire society. The undisciplined music can become the cause of the down fall of moral standards of the society, whereas the depth, purity & simplicity of music carry the society towards moral excellence. When equipped with these qualities, music proves to be in a position to help listeners to disassociate themselves from worldly affairs and gain blissful experience of *rasa*, even if it is momentarily only. Learned scholars have identified *rasa* with *Brahma*, only because of the former having the capacity of providing momentary transcendental bliss (*Ananda*) and beauty. As the material happiness and sorrow are related to selfishness, they provide happiness and sorrow to human soul, but the same happiness and sorrow, after being transformed into art, become blissful and full of *rasas* and when the same *rasas* assume their divine form, they lead to the path of attaining *moksha*.

From the very ancient times, learned scholars have been giving thought to the subject of spiritual *sadhana* keeping in view the mutual relations between music and philosophy, but the music education in contemporary times appears to be sadly lacking in this aspect. Only when a proper place is given in music education to the importance of *rasa*, which the scholars

have carried to the heights of divinity, will the philosophical & spiritual values of music survive; otherwise in due course of time music may turn out to become merely a means of entertainment.

REFERENCES

1. Sangeet Ratnakar by Sharang Dev, Adyal ed., Vol. I, p. 62.
2. Kallinath's commentary in Sangeet Ratnakar at p. 63, quoted in Jaidev Singh, "Nada in Indian Tradition", in Psychology of Music: Report of Seminar Organised by Sangeet Natak Akademi, 1975, p. 118.
3. *Ibid.* Indeed, the author of Sangeet Ratnakar was not satisfied even by assigning the epithet Nadabrahma to Nada. He personified Nada as Brahma, Vishnu, Mahesh and in this way attributed to Nada all the three cosmic forces namely creation, sustenance, and annihilation together. This viewpoint of Pt. Sharang Dev is stated in Jaidev Singh *Op. Cit.* Supra Note 2 at p. 143.
4. R.K. Shringey "Sangeet Ratnakar of Sharang Dev", Vol. I (1978), p. 21.
5. It is well known that Hathyoga, which is a manifestation of all other forms of yoga, is directly concerned with human body, so also music which emanates from the human body. Therefore, yogis who were aware of the truth that Nada is the beacon and the unobstructed element which illuminates the path of spiritual realization adopted it as their only guiding principle on the narrow enough, slippery and unknown path of spiritual sadhana. Vimla Musalgaonkar, "Music & Sound in Yoga" in Psychology of Music, Supra Note 1, at 126 ff.
6. Satish Chandra Chattopadhyaya and Dharendra Mohan Datt, "Bharatiya Darshan" (1964), p. 28.
7. Supra Note 5, p. 142.
8. Surendra Barlinge, "Saundarya Tatva Aur Kavya Siddhanta" (1963), p. 25.
9. The aesthetic experience from music has been regarded as the experience of "bliss" (Ananda) at the transcendental level according to Abhinava Gupta (Tantralok, Kashmir Sanskrit series 1921, Vol. II, 200-1), see K.C. Pandey, "comparative aesthetics", vol. I-Indian Aesthetics, p. 562. See also Swami Prajnanananda, "Historical Development of Indian Music" (1973), p. 262 and same author, "Music, Its Form, Function and Value" (1979). Appendix I (Heaven & Earth in Music).
10. Music has been called as a spiritual Sadhana, the prime aim of which is God-realization, Prajnananda, "Music, Its Form, Function & Value" (1979), p. 169.
11. In this connection the following verse is pertinent:
 वीणावादनतत्त्वज्ञः श्रुतिजातिविशारदः ।
 तालज्ञश्चाप्रयासेन मोक्ष मार्गं निगच्छति ॥४॥
 Ahobal, "Sangeet Parijat", Chapter I, sloka 18.
12. R.K. Shringey, *Op. Cit.*, Note I, p. 23.
13. Satish Chandra Chattopadhyaya & Dharendra Mohan Datt, *Op. Cit.*, Note 3, p.8.
14. *Ibid.*, p. 9.
15. For extended discussion see, *Ibid.*, Chapter I, p. 27.
16. Rama Shankar Jaitley, "Shringara Rasa. Bhavana Evam Vishleshan" (1972), p. 31.
17. Surendra Nath Dassgupta, "Saundarya Tatva" (2017), p. 47.
18. K.C. Pandey, *Op. Cit.*, Note 5, p. 567.
19. *Ibid.*, p. 570.
20. For related discussion, see *Ibid.*, p. 512.
21. Rasik Kavi "Bhakti Aur Sangeet", Sangeet, July 1973, p. 39.
22. Prajnanananda, "Historical Development of Indian Music", *Op. Cit.*, Note 5, p. 475-76.
23. *Ibid.*, p. 476.